

Reproduced from *Deepening Democracy in Indonesia? Direct Elections for Local Leaders (Pilkada)* edited by Maribeth Erb and Priyambudi Sulistiyanto (Singapore: Institute of Southeast Asian Studies, 2009). This version was obtained electronically direct from the publisher on condition that copyright is not infringed. No part of this publication may be reproduced without the prior permission of the Institute of Southeast Asian Studies.

Individual articles are available at < <http://bookshop.iseas.edu.sg> >

DEEPENING DEMOCRACY IN INDONESIA?

The **Institute of Southeast Asian Studies (ISEAS)** was established as an autonomous organization in 1968. It is a regional centre dedicated to the study of socio-political, security and economic trends and developments in Southeast Asia and its wider geostrategic and economic environment. The Institute's research programmes are the Regional Economic Studies (RES, including ASEAN and APEC), Regional Strategic and Political Studies (RSPS), and Regional Social and Cultural Studies (RSCS).

ISEAS Publishing, an established academic press, has issued almost 2,000 books and journals. It is the largest scholarly publisher of research about Southeast Asia from within the region. ISEAS Publishing works with many other academic and trade publishers and distributors to disseminate important research and analyses from and about Southeast Asia to the rest of the world.

DEEPENING DEMOCRACY IN INDONESIA?

Direct Elections for Local Leaders (Pilkada)

Edited by
Maribeth Erb and
Priyambudi Sulistiyanto



INSTITUTE OF SOUTHEAST ASIAN STUDIES
Singapore

First published in Singapore in 2009 by
ISEAS Publishing
Institute of Southeast Asian Studies
30 Heng Mui Keng Terrace
Pasir Panjang
Singapore 119614

E-mail: publish@iseas.edu.sg

Website: [<http://bookshop.iseas.edu.sg>](http://bookshop.iseas.edu.sg)

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the Institute of Southeast Asian Studies.

© 2009 Institute of Southeast Asian Studies, Singapore

The responsibility for facts and opinions in this publication rests exclusively with the authors and their interpretations do not necessarily reflect the views or the policy of the publisher or its supporters.

ISEAS Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

Deepening democracy in Indonesia ? direct elections for local leaders (Pilkada) / edited by Maribeth Erb and Priyambudi Sulistiyanto.

1. Elections—Indonesia.
2. Local elections—Indonesia.
3. Local government—Indonesia.
 - I. Erb, Maribeth.
 - II. Sulistiyanto, Priyambudi.
 - III. Workshop on Pilkada: Direct Elections, Democratization and Localization in Indonesia (2006 : Singapore)

JS7197.3 D31 2009

ISBN 978-981-230-840-5 (soft cover)

ISBN 978-981-230-841-2 (hard cover)

ISBN 978-981-230-842-9 (PDF)

Typeset by Superskill Graphics Pte Ltd

Printed in Singapore by Utopia Press Pte Ltd

*Fondly Dedicated to
Ibu Sukapti Soekardan*

CONTENTS

<i>List of Tables</i>	xii
<i>List of Figures</i>	xv
<i>Contributors</i>	xvii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xix
<i>Glossary</i>	xxi
1 Indonesia and the Quest for “Democracy” <i>Priyambudi Sulistiyanto and Maribeth Erb</i>	1
2 <i>Pilkada Langsung</i> : The First Step on the Long Road to a Dualistic Provincial and District Government <i>Aloysius Benedictus Mboi</i>	38
Part I: Political Parties, Politician Elites and the Voters	
3 Political Parties in <i>Pilkada</i> : Some Problems for Democratic Consolidation <i>Pratikno</i>	53
4 Batam’s 2006 Mayoral Election: Weakened Political Parties and Intensified Power Struggle in Local Indonesia <i>Nankyung Choi</i>	74
5 The Rising Importance of Personal Networks in Indonesian Local Politics: An Analysis of District Government Head Elections in South Sulawesi in 2005 <i>Michael Buehler</i>	101

6	<i>Pilkada</i> , Money Politics and the Dangers of “Informal Governance” Practices <i>Syarif Hidayat</i>	125
7	Electing District Heads in Indonesia: Democratic Deepening or Elite Entrenchment? <i>Jim Schiller</i>	147
8	Gender and Reform in Indonesian Politics: The Case of a Javanese Woman <i>Bupati</i> <i>Tri Ratnawati</i>	174
9	<i>Pilkada</i> in Bantul District: Incumbent, Populism and the Decline of Royal Power <i>Priyambudi Sulistiyanto</i>	190
Part II: Media and Campaigns: Comparing Local and National Elections		
10	Pomp, Piety and Performance: <i>Pilkada</i> in Yogyakarta, 2005 <i>Jennifer Lindsay</i>	211
11	Assessing Media Impact on Local Elections in Indonesia <i>David T. Hill</i>	229
Part III: Conflict, Ethnicity, and Political Divisions		
12	Autonomy, Democracy, and Internal Conflict: The 2006 Gubernatorial Elections in Papua <i>Marcus Mietzner</i>	259
13	Conflict and the Growth of Democracy in Manggarai District <i>Maribeth Erb and Wilhelmus Anggal</i>	283
14	The Return of the Sultan? Patronage, Power, and Political Machines in “Post”-Conflict North Maluku <i>Claire Q. Smith</i>	303
15	Ethnic Politics and the Rise of the Dayak-Bureaucrats in Local Elections: <i>Pilkada</i> in Six <i>Kabupaten</i> in West Kalimantan <i>Benny Subianto</i>	327

16	Bare-Chested Politics in Central Sulawesi: Local Elections in a Post-Conflict Region <i>Graham Brown and Rachel Diprose</i>	352
	<i>Index</i>	375

LIST OF TABLES

Table 3.1	Schedule of <i>Pilkada</i> in 2005–06	56
Table 3.2	Winning Coalitions among Major Political Parties in <i>Pilkada</i> during June–August 2005 (Number of Cases)	64
Table 3.3	Some Examples of Coalitions between Different Ideological Lines	65
Table 3.4	Pattern of Winner Coalitions among Major Political Parties in Local Elections, 2005–06	66
Table 3.5	Some Examples of Organizational Conflicts within Political Parties over Candidacy in Local Elections 2005–06	69
Table 3.6	Victories of Minor Parties vs Major Parties in Local Elections, 2005–06	71
Table 4.1	Composition of Parties in the Batam Municipal Assembly (2004–09)	80
Table 4.2	Candidates and Party Coalitions in the 2006 Batam Mayoral Election	81
Table 4.3	Results of the 2006 Batam Mayoral Election	89
Table 4.4	2006 Mayoral Election Results Compared with the 2004 Parliamentary Election Results (Municipal Level)	89
Table 5.1	2005 <i>Pilkada</i> Voting in Pangkep by Pairs of Candidates and Sub-district	109
Table 5.2	2005 <i>Pilkada</i> Voting in Pangkep by Pairs of Candidates and Sub-district	114
Table 6.1	Examples of Direct Money Politics Practices in the 2005 <i>Pilkada</i>	130

Table 6.2	Examples of Indirect Money Politics Practices in the 2005 <i>Pilkada</i>	131
Table 6.3	Project Fees by Category of Activity and Source of Funds	137
Table 8.1	Composition of DPRD (Local Legislature) of Kebumen Based on 1999 and 2004 General Elections	177
Table 8.2	<i>Pilkada</i> Results in Kebumen District in June 2005	181
Table 8.3	<i>Pilkada</i> Results in Every Sub-District (Kecamatan) in Kebumen District	182
Table 8.4	<i>Golput</i> in the Three Elections in Kebumen District	184
Table 8.5	Results of 2004 Direct Presidential Election (Round I) in Kebumen District, April 2004	186
Table 8.6	Results of 2004 Direct President Election (Round II) in Kebumen District, July 2004	186
Table 9.1	Results of the <i>Pilkada</i> in Bantul District, 2005	195
Table 9.2	Seats in Local Parliament (2004 General Elections)	196
Table 11.1	Choice of Governor of North Sulawesi Based on Communication	237
Table 11.2	The Most Effective Method Influencing Vote for Governor of North Sulawesi	238
Table 11.3	Communication Means That Were Most Influential in Voters' Choice for Mayoral Candidate in Manado	241
Table 11.4	Choice of Mayor of Manado Based on Communication Method	242
Table 11.5	Most Influential Method Determining the Choice of Particular Mayoral Candidates in Surabaya	246
Table 11.6	Choice of Mayoral Candidates in Surabaya Based on Most Influential Method of Communication	247
Table 13.1	Candidates in Manggarai District <i>Pilkada</i>	292
Table 13.2	Reported Wealth of the Candidates in Manggarai District <i>Pilkada</i>	293
Table 13.3	Results of the 2005 Manggarai District <i>Pilkada</i>	297
Table 14.1	National Assembly (DPR) Election Results in Ternate (2004)	309

Table 14.2	National Senate (DPD) Election Results in Ternate (2004)	311
Table 14.3	Ternate City Mayor Election Results (2005)	312
Table 15.1	Kabupaten Ketapang <i>Pilkada</i> Results	336
Table 15.2	Kabupaten Kapuas Hulu <i>Pilkada</i> Results	337
Table 15.3	Kabupaten Bengkayang <i>Pilkada</i> Results	339
Table 15.4	Kabupaten Sintang <i>Pilkada</i> Results	340
Table 15.5	Kabupaten Sekadau <i>Pilkada</i> Results	341
Table 15.6	Kabupaten Melawi <i>Pilkada</i> Results	343
Table 15.7	Winners of West Kalimantan 2005 <i>Pilkada</i>	347
Table 16.1	Negative and Positive Peace at Two Levels	354
Table 16.2	Chronology of Communal Conflict and Violence in Poso since 1998	358
Table 16.3	Candidates for the Poso <i>Pilkada</i> Election	363
Table 16.4	Poso <i>Pilkada</i> Election Results by Sub-district	368

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 3.1	The Politics of <i>Aliran</i> in Indonesia, 1945–65	63
Figure 3.2	Ideological Lines/Political Culture of Indonesian Political Parties	64
Figure 6.1	Inter-Correlation between <i>Pilkada</i> Process and the Performance of Local Government in the Post <i>Pilkada</i>	129
Figure 9.1	A Basket of Eggs	199
Figure 10.1	A Cartoon Published in the Yogyakarta newspaper <i>Bernas</i> on 7 June 2005. The text reads “Get to know the faces first. Programmes come later”	215
Figure 10.2	Widely circulated election advertisement of H. GBPH Yudhaningrat and KH Aziz Umar from Bantul	216
Figure 10.3	<i>Gamelan</i> at the “Cultural Parade” on 19 June 2005	221
Figure 10.4	The Royal Elephants Kyai Arga and Nyi Gilang at the Rally on 19 June at Tlirenggo Alun-alun in Bantul	222
Figure 10.5	Voting Practice. The Elephants and Their Riders Demonstrate How to “ <i>Nyoblos</i> ” on Election Day	223
Figure 11.1	Was the Candidate for Deputy Mayor an Important Factor in Your Vote for Mayor of Surabaya?	249

Figure 11.2	Those Who Voted for a Pair of Candidates in Surabaya Because of the Deputy Mayor	249
Figure 13.1	Map of Flores, West Manggarai and Manggarai Regencies	287

THE CONTRIBUTORS

Wilhelmus Anggal is the Director of the Manggaraian Institute in Ruteng, Flores, and runs his own radio station, Be Smart Radio, in Ruteng.

Graham Brown is Senior Lecturer at the Department of Economics and International Development, University of Bath, U.K.

Michael Buehler is the Postdoctoral Fellow in Modern Southeast Asian Studies 08–09 at The Weatherhead East Asian Institute at Columbia University, New York.

Nankyung Choi is a Research Fellow at the Southeast Asia Research Centre, City University of Hong Kong.

Rachael Diprose is affiliated with the Centre for Research on Inequality, Human Security and Ethnicity, University of Oxford.

Maribeth Erb is an Associate Professor in the Department of Sociology, National University of Singapore.

Syarif Hidayat is a researcher at the Centre for Economic Research, the Indonesian Institute of Sciences (LIPI) in Jakarta.

David T. Hill is Professor of Southeast Asian Studies and Research Fellow in the Asia Research Centre at Murdoch University, Western Australia.

Jennifer Lindsay is Visiting Fellow at the Southeast Asia Centre, Australian National University, and was previously Senior Research Fellow at the Asia Research Institute, National University of Singapore.

Aloysius Benedictus Mboi was Governor of Nusa Tenggara Timur Province from 1978–88, and won the prestigious Ramon Magsaysay Award in 1986.

Marcus Mietzner is Lecturer in Indonesian Studies at the Faculty of Asian Studies, Australian National University.

Pratikno is a Senior Lecturer at the Department of Government, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Gadjah Mada University and Director of the Postgraduate Program on Local Politics and Regional Autonomy.

Jim Schiller is Senior Lecturer at Flinders Asia Centre, School of Political and International Studies, Flinders University, Adelaide, Australia.

Claire Q. Smith is a fellow at the London School of Economics. She is completing a PhD in Development Studies, focusing on political transition and post-conflict reconstruction in Eastern Indonesia.

Benny Subianto works for the Netherlands Institute for Multiparty Democracy (NIMD); he did his master's degree in Southeast Asian History at Cornell University.

Priyambudi Sulistiyanto is Lecturer at Flinders Asia Centre, School of Political and International Studies, Flinders University, Adelaide, Australia, and was previously Assistant Professor at the Southeast Asian Studies Programme, National University of Singapore, Singapore.

Tri Ratnawati is a researcher at the Research Center of Political Studies, the Indonesian Institute of Sciences (LIPI) in Jakarta.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Most of the papers in this volume originated from a workshop conducted on 17–18 May 2006 at the National University of Singapore, entitled “Pilkada: Direct Elections, Democratization and Localization in Indonesia”. The workshop was organized by The Indonesian Studies Group, one of the study groups attached to the Asia Research Institute and the Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences, at the National University of Singapore. The workshop was funded by the Asia Research Institute, and we would like to express our deepest gratitude for all the funding, as well as logistical support, provided for this event by ARI. Most especially we would like to thank Professor Alan Chan, Acting Director of ARI at that time, who ensured that we would have enough funds for the event. We would also like to express our gratitude to Professor Anthony Reid, Director of ARI, and to ARI’s wonderful clerical administrative staff, most especially Alison Adrienne Rozells, Kalachelvi Krishan, and Valerie Yeo Ee Lin, who are exceptionally efficient in all the events they have helped us organize for the Indonesian Studies Group.

The editors, who were also the organizers of the workshop, would like to thank those people who attended, but whose papers have not been included here for various reasons: Aris Ananta, Jamil Gunawan and Fahmi Wibawa. Also many thanks to our discussants at the workshop: Natasha Hamilton, Birgit Brauchler, Jamie Davidson, Roxana Waterson, Evi Arifin and Johannes Widodo. We were privileged to have had Dr Aloysius Benedictus Mboi, ex-Governor of the Nusa Tenggara Timur province in eastern Indonesia, to give our keynote address and a post-workshop seminar delivered by Dr Nafsiah Mboi, one-time Director of the Department of Women’s Health at the World Health Organisation, Geneva, and present Chair of the National AIDS Commission Task Force on Papua. We are very honoured that these two great Indonesians made the time to attend our workshop.

Special thanks also to all the clerical and administrative staff of the Department of Sociology: Chia Choon Lan, Brenda Nicole Lim Mei Lian, Cecilia Sham Mo Ching, K. Rajamani, Jameelah Bte Mohamed, who provided assistance with the workshop. Thanks also to Mrs Lee Li Kheng at the Geography Department for her drawing of the maps and Adonara Elizabeth Mucek for her meticulous help in editing the manuscript.

Thanks to Paul Tickell and the editorial board of the *Review of Indonesian and Malaysian Affairs* for permission to reprint here Michael Buehler's paper published in vol. 41, no. 1 (2007), pp. 119–47, and John Edmondson and the editorial board of *South East Asia Research* for permission to reprint Nankyung Choi's paper published in vol. 15, no. 3 (2007), pp. 325–54.

We would also like to express our gratitude to faculty and staff of the Program of Local Politics and Regional Autonomy (S2 PLOD), at the University of Gadjah Mada, most especially Pak Pratikno and Arie Ruhyanto for their assistance and access to the voluminous information on the local head elections in Indonesia collected by their programme in 2005. Many thanks also to the faculty and staff of Flinders Asia Centre for their warm welcome, both to a new staff and a sabbatical visitor, especially Anton Lucas, Pat Huxtable, Jim Schiller and Rosslyn von der Borch. Both of us spent varying amounts of time in Yogyakarta, working on this manuscript, and depending on the hospitality of Sukapti Soekardan. For her interminable patience, self-sacrifice, and ceaseless good nature, we would like to express our gratitude and dedicate this book to her.

GLOSSARY

<i>Abangan</i>	“Nominal” or “syncretic” Muslims
<i>Adat</i>	tradition, custom
AMPUH	Aliansi Masyarakat Pendukung Ulama
APDN	Akademi Pemerintahan Dalam Negeri (Academy of Local Government)
ATVLI	Asosiasi Televisi Lokal Indonesia (Indonesian Association of Local Television Stations)
Bappeda	Badan Perencanaan Pembangunan Daerah (Regional Body for Planning and Development)
BIDA	Batam Industrial Development Authority
BIN	Badan Intelijen Negara (National Intelligence Agency)
BPD	Badan Pemerintahan Daerah (Council of Local Government)
BPH	Badan Pemerintah Harian (Local Council of Daily Affairs)
<i>Bupati</i>	Regent or District Head
<i>Camat</i>	Sub-District Head
DAK	Dana Alokasi Khusus (Special Allocation Fund)
DAP	Dewan Adat Papua (Council of Papuan Customary Leaders)
DAU	Dana Anggaran Umum (General Allocation Fund)
<i>Desa</i>	Village
DPAC	Dewan Pengurus Anak Cabang (Assembly of Sub-district Party Leaders)
DPC	Dewan Cabang (Assembly of Provincial Party Leaders)
DPD	Dewan Daerah (Assembly of District Party Leaders)
DPP	Dewan Pusat (Assembly of National Party Leaders)

DPR	Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat (People's Representative Assembly, or the National Legislature)
DPRD	Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat Daerah (Regional People's Representative Assembly, or Regional Legislature)
GAM	Gerakan Aceh Merdeka (Free Aceh Movement)
Gapensi	Gabungan Pelaksana Konstruksi Nasional Indonesia (National Board for Building Construction and Maintenance)
GBHN	Garis Besar Haluan Negara (Broad Guidelines of National Strategy)
Golkar	Golongan Karya (Functional Group-secular nationalist party)
IDPs	internally-displaced persons
Jamppi	Jaringan Masyarakat Pemantau Pemilu Indonesia (Monitors' Network Foundation)
<i>Jawara</i>	strongman
JPPR	Jaringan Pendidikan Pemilih untuk Rakyat (People's Voter Education Network)
<i>Jurdil</i>	<i>jujur dan adil</i> (Honest and Fair)
Kabupaten	District government
Kecamatan	Sub-district
KKN	Korupsi, Kolusi dan Nepotism (Corruption, Collusion and Nepotism)
Kotamadya	Municipality
KTP	Kartu Tanda Penduduk (Identity Card)
KPU	Komisi Pemilihan Umum (National Election Commission)
KPUD	Komisi Pemilihan Umum Daerah (Regional Election Commission)
LP3ES	Lembaga Penelitian, Pendidikan dan Penerangan Ekonomi dan Sosial (Institute for Social and Economic Research, Education & Information)
MPR	Majelis Permusyawaratan Rakyat (People's Consultative Assembly)
NDI	National Democratic Institute for International Affairs
NTT	Nusa Tenggara Timur
NU	Nadhlatul Ulama (Islamic Scholars Association)
OPM	Organisasi Papua Merdeka (Free Papua Organization)
PAD	Pendapatan Asli Daerah (locally derived revenue)

PAN	Partai Amanat Nasional (National Mandate Party-secular party with Muhammadiyah link)
<i>Pancasila</i>	Five principles of the Indonesian State
Panwaslu	Pengawas Pemilihan Umum (Election Supervisory Body)
Panwasda	Pengawas Pemilihan Umum Daerah (Regional Election Supervisory Body)
Partai Marhaenisme	Marhaenism Party (secular nationalist party)
Partai Patriot Pancasila	Pancasila Patriot's Party (secular nationalist party)
Partai Pelopor	Vanguard Party (secular nationalist party)
Partindo	Partai Indonesia
PBB	Partai Bulan Bintang (Islamic party)
PBR	Partai Bintang Reformasi (Reform Star Party-Islamic party)
PBSD	Partai Buruh Sosial Demokrat (Socialist Democratic Labour Party secular party)
PD	Partai Demokrat (Democratic Party-secular nationalist party)
PDI	Partai Demokrasi Indonesia (Indonesian Democratic Party-secular nationalist party)
PDI-P	Partai Demokrasi Indonesia-Perjuangan (Indonesian Democratic Party Struggle-secular nationalist party)
PDK	Partai Demokrat Kebangsaan (National Democratic Party)
PDS	Partai Damai Sejahtera (Prosperous Peace Party-Christian party)
<i>Pemda</i>	<i>pemerintahan daerah</i> (local government)
<i>Pemulu</i>	<i>pemilihan umum</i> (general election)
<i>Peraturan Pemerintah</i>	government regulation
PGRS	Pasukan Gerakan Rakyat Sarawak
<i>Pilkada</i>	<i>pemilihan kepala daerah langsung</i> (direct elections of regional heads)
PIB	Partai Perhimpunan Indonesia Baru (New Indonesian Association Party)
PKB	Partai Kebangkitan Bangsa (National Awakening Party-secular party with NU link)
PKI	Partai Komunis Indonesia (Indonesian Communist Party-defunct communist party)
PKNU	Partai Kebangkitan Nasional Ulama (National Ulama Awakening Party)

PKPB	Partai Karya Perduli Bangsa (Nationhood and Caring Party-secular nationalist party)
PKPI	Partai Keadilan dan Persatuan Indonesia (Indonesian Justice and Unity Party-secular nationalist party)
PKS	Partai Keadilan Sejahtera (Prosperous Justice Party-Islamic party)
PM	Partai Merdeka (Freedom Party-secular nationalist party)
PNBK	Partai Nasional Banteng Kemerdekaan (Freedom Bull National Party-secular nationalist party)
PNI	Partai Nasional Indonesia (Indonesian Nationalist Party)
PNKB	Partai Nasional Banteng Kemerdekaan (Freedom Ball National Party)
PNU	Partai Nadhlatul Ulama
PPD	Partai Persatuan Daerah (Regional Unity Party)
PPDI	Partai Penegak Demokrasi Indonesia (Indonesian Democratic Vanguard Party-secular nationalist party)
PPDK	Partai Persatuan Demokrasi Kebangsaan (United Democratic Nationhood Party-secular nationalist party)
PPIB	Partai Perhimpunan Indonesia Baru (New Indonesia Alliance Party-secular party)
PPNUI	Partai Persatuan Nahdlatul Ummah Indonesia (Indonesian Nahdlatul Community Party-Islamic party)
PPP	Partai Persatuan Pembangunan (United Development Party-Islamic party)
PPP	Partai Persatuan Daerah (Regional Unity Party)
<i>Preman</i>	Gangsters
PSI	Partai Sarikat Indonesia (Indonesian Unity Party-secular nationalist party)
<i>Putra daerah</i>	local inhabitants (literally “native sons”, “sons of the soil”)
PWI	Persatuan Wartawan Indonesia (Indonesian Journalists Association)
<i>Reformasi</i>	Reform (movement)
Rp	Rupiah (Indonesian currency)
<i>Santri</i>	“Pious” or devout Muslims

<i>Sekwilda</i>	Sekretaris Wilayah Daerah (Regional Secretary)
SPD	Sekolah Pemerintahan Desa (School for Village Government)
STDN	Sekolah Tinggi Pemerintahan Dalam Negeri (College of Local Government)
<i>Tim sukses</i>	Victory team, core campaign team
TNI	Tentara Negara Indonesia (Polisi Republik Indonesia)
<i>Undang-undang</i> (UU)	Laws
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
<i>Walikota</i>	Mayor
Yappika	Aliansi Masyarakat Sipil untuk Demokrasi (Civil Society Alliance for Democracy)