

***Asia's Emerging Regional Order: Reconciling Traditional and Human Security.* Edited by William T. Tow, Ramesh Thakur and In-Taek Hyun. Tokyo: United Nations University Press, 2000. 342pp.**

This edited volume, in its attempt to examine the three issues of the interrelationship between traditional and human security agendas, with specific reference to the Asia-Pacific region, is an important addition to the growing but as yet unsatisfactory literature on the "new", "alternative", or "critical" security agendas in the post-Cold War period. Much of the literature on these three issues has either been primarily theoretical in nature and divorced from particular regional contexts, or overly focused on one region, and thus neglected the theoretical and empirical implications for the study of other regions and global security as a whole. The approach of this book is thus innovative in its efforts to combine the study of all three issues, and it does provide stimulating insights, which make it invaluable reading for anyone interested in the contemporary security situation in the Asia-Pacific region.

The volume is a product of a joint Australian and Asian workshop in 1998 which drew upon the expertise of many of the established and up-and-coming scholars dealing with Asia-Pacific issues. Indeed, one of the refreshing aspects of this book is that the majority of the chapters are written by scholars who can claim an "Asian" identity, possibly giving the book more of an Asian perspective than other more traditional commentaries available on the security of the region (even allowing for the clear academic influence from other regions which sets much of the theoretical agenda on human security under investigation). The book itself is divided into four major sections. Part One provides an initial outline of many of the key theoretical underpinnings of the human security agenda and the input into these Asian and Australian perspectives. The first two chapters by, respectively, William Tow and Russell Trood, and Woosang Kim and In-Taek Hyun, assess the traditional and human security frameworks and examine ways in which both might be reconciled. Both are excellent chapters, but the chapter by Tow and Trood possibly succeeds best, for despite the precise delineation by Kim and Hyun of each paradigm and their stress on the need to find a way out of the often false dichotomous relationship of the two, their piece appears ultimately to run out of steam, with important but underdeveloped proposals for the greater co-operation of epistemic communities and middle powers as a means to breach the security paradigm divides.

Part Two of the volume relates the human security paradigm to the Asia-Pacific context. Withaya Sucharithanarugse, in a thought-provoking, but not always clearly structured chapter, uses the case of India to

argue for the need to interpret human security within an Asian context. Ikrar Nusa Bhakti's chapter tends to meander but does make an important argument about the relationship between the growth of civil society and that of an effective human security agenda. The last chapter in this section by Carl J. Ungerer is a very clear explanation of the ability of middle-ranking powers, such as Australia and Canada, to contribute to the disarmament process, and in this sense follows on from the chapter by Kim and Hyun. However, the chapter, interesting as it is, really only addresses the example of Asia in the last page or so, and thus it points to, rather than deals substantially with the issue of the human security agenda in relation to the specific case of the Asia-Pacific region.

Part Three of the volume shifts to examine in greater detail specific issues of the human security agenda. A series of highly informative chapters are presented on Asian values and human security cooperation (Hyun-Seok Yu); human rights and culture (Wilfrido V. Villacorta); "grey area phenomenon" (Peter Chalk); refugees and forced migration (William Maley); environmental security (Lorraine Elliott); maritime security (Jie-Hyun Paik and Anthony Bergin); human and economic security (Leong Liew); and human security in the face of nuclear weapons (Marianne Hanson). All these chapters provide useful information on a range of immediate security issues in the region, with some working better than others in linking the regional context to the theoretical work on human security. In particular, the chapters on refugees, environmental, and economic security are written closely to the theme of the book and provide important evidence with which to challenge those who still adhere to traditional forms of security as forming the "true" security agenda in the region.

Part Four moves on to consider issues of the institutionalization of human security in the Asia-Pacific. Ramesh Thakur offers a succinct and user-friendly outline of the various forms of regime necessary in the political, economic, and military spheres in order to build security in the region — highlighting in particular the role of norms in supporting regime formation and accountability. Chandran Jeshurun considers the future role of the ASEAN Regional Forum (ARF) and the possibility of condensing it to form a smaller and more Northeast and Southeast Asia-centric organization that would function with a stronger basis of "regionalism". Toshiya Hoshino also takes up the themes of regional organizations and the human security agenda with a fascinating status report on the trials and tribulations of informal Track Two diplomacy in the region. Sung-Han Kim then challenges Jeshurun's conclusions by advancing the argument that the ARF is uniquely placed to deal with regional problems because of its promotion of epistemic communities attuned to the security agenda, thus contributing to a sound basis for

governance. Finally, in the conclusion to the volume, Joseph A. Camilleri indicates ways in which to construct and implement a more concrete human security agenda through an evolutionary process of integrating the concepts of human security into existing security institutions in the region.

Overall, *Asia's Emerging Regional Order* is an excellent book which identifies a crucial research theme and provides diverse coverage of theoretical and empirical issues. The main drawback of the volume is that as an edited book based on workshop proceedings it inevitably falls short of its desired intent at trying to explore in an integrated fashion the interrelationship between the three issues of the traditional security agenda, human security agenda, and the regional context of the Asia-Pacific. Most of the chapters cover at least two of these issues, but few manage to truly span the gaps between all three. There is often a lot of examination of traditional security without human security, or examination of Asian security without human security, and so on. The result is that the contents of the book do not always conform to the book's title and subtitle. The reader is left with the sense that the book cries out for an overarching framework to carry its conclusions forward and to really challenge the supposed orthodoxy on security matters which still holds sway in much of Asia and elsewhere. Given the format of the book, it would be unreasonable to expect such a framework at this stage. However, the hope is that this book might form the starting point for further research on these themes for the same project team and for others working on similar security topics in the Asia-Pacific region.

CHRISTOPHER W. HUGHES

*Centre for the Study of Globalization and Regionalization*  
*University of Warwick*  
*United Kingdom*