

Reproduced from *Inequality and Exclusion in Southeast Asia: Old Fractures, New Frontiers*, edited by Lee Hwok Aun and Christopher Choong (Singapore: ISEAS – Yusof Ishak Institute, 2021). This version was obtained electronically direct from the publisher on condition that copyright is not infringed. No part of this publication may be reproduced without the prior permission of ISEAS Publishing. Individual chapters are available at <http://bookshop.iseas.edu.sg>

Inequality and Exclusion in Southeast Asia

The **ISEAS – Yusof Ishak Institute** (formerly Institute of Southeast Asian Studies) is an autonomous organization established in 1968. It is a regional centre dedicated to the study of socio-political, security, and economic trends and developments in Southeast Asia and its wider geostrategic and economic environment. The Institute's research programmes are grouped under Regional Economic Studies (RES), Regional Strategic and Political Studies (RSPS), and Regional Social and Cultural Studies (RSCS). The Institute is also home to the ASEAN Studies Centre (ASC), the Singapore APEC Study Centre and the Temasek History Research Centre (THRC).

ISEAS Publishing, an established academic press, has issued more than 2,000 books and journals. It is the largest scholarly publisher of research about Southeast Asia from within the region. ISEAS Publishing works with many other academic and trade publishers and distributors to disseminate important research and analyses from and about Southeast Asia to the rest of the world.

Inequality and Exclusion in Southeast Asia

Old Fractures, New Frontiers

EDITED BY

LEE HWOK AUN • CHRISTOPHER CHOONG

ISEAS YUSOF ISHAK
INSTITUTE

First published in Singapore in 2021 by
ISEAS Publishing
30 Heng Mui Keng Terrace
Singapore 119614
E-mail: publish@iseas.edu.sg
Website: <http://bookshop.iseas.edu.sg>

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the ISEAS – Yusof Ishak Institute.

© 2021 ISEAS – Yusof Ishak Institute, Singapore.

The responsibility for facts and opinions in this publication rests exclusively with the authors and their interpretations do not necessarily reflect the views or the policy of the publisher or its supporters.

This publication is made possible with the support of Konrad-Adenauer-Stiftung.



ISEAS Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

Name(s): Lee, Hwok Aun, editor. | Choong, Christopher Weng Wai, editor.

Title: Inequality and exclusion in Southeast Asia : old fractures, new frontiers /
edited by Lee Hwok Aun and Christopher Choong.

Description: Singapore : ISEAS – Yusof Ishak Institute, 2021. | Includes
bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: ISBN 9789814951203 (soft cover) | ISBN 9789814951210 (pdf) | ISBN
9789814951227 (epub)

Subjects: LCSH: Equality—Southeast Asia. | Marginality, Social—Southeast Asia.
| Southeast Asia—Social policy.

Classification: LCC HM821 I43

Typeset by Superskill Graphics Pte Ltd

Printed in Singapore by Markono Print Media Pte Ltd

CONTENTS

<i>List of Tables</i>	vii
<i>List of Figures</i>	x
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xv
<i>About the Contributors</i>	xvi
1. Introduction: Inequality and Exclusion in Southeast Asia <i>Lee Hwok Aun and Christopher Choong</i>	1
2. Cambodia's Experiences in Addressing Inequality <i>Piseth Keo and Vannarith Chheang</i>	22
3. Inequality and Exclusion in Post-Soeharto Indonesia <i>Mohammad Zulfan Tadjoeddin</i>	51
4. Inequality and Exclusion in Malaysia: Macro Trends, Labour Market Dynamics and Gender Dimensions <i>Lee Hwok Aun and Christopher Choong</i>	87
5. Inequality in Myanmar: Structural Change, Policy Outcomes and Gender Dimensions <i>Ngu Wah Win, Zaw Oo, Jana Rue Glutting, Aung Htun and S. Kanayde</i>	133
6. Structural Inequality in the Philippines: Oligarchy, Economic Transformation and Current Challenges to Development <i>Philip Arnold Tũaño and Jerik Cruz</i>	169

7. Inequality and the Social Compact in Singapore: Macro Trends vs Lived Inequalities <i>Nathan Peng</i>	218
8. Inequality in Thailand: Income, Socio-economic and Wealth Dimensions <i>Vimut Vanitcharearnthum</i>	261
9. Trends and Drivers of Inequality in Vietnam <i>Trang Huyen Dang, Cuong Viet Nguyen and Tung Duc Phung</i>	295
10. Conclusion: Old Fractures and New Frontiers <i>Lee Hwok Aun and Christopher Choong</i>	323
<i>Index</i>	335

LISTS OF TABLES

1.1	Southeast Asian Countries: Economic and Demographic Profile, 2019	12
2.1	Cambodia Human Development Index	29
2.2	Measured or Estimated Population by Residence	35
2.3	Cambodia: Policies on Poverty Reduction and Inequality	40
5.1	Growth and Structural Change of Myanmar's Economy	135
5.2	Myanmar: Share of GDP Contributions by Economic Sectors	138
5.3	Human Development Index (HDI) in Myanmar and Southeast Asia: Score and Rank, and Gender Inequality Index (GII) Rank, 2017	139
5.4	Myanmar's HDI Trends	140
5.5	Myanmar and Selected Countries: Inequality and Human Development Index	141
5.6	Myanmar and Selected Countries: Gender Gaps in HDI Components	143
5.7	Indicators of Inequality in Myanmar, 2015	146
5.8	Myanmar: Stunting Rates in States and Regions, 2015–16	149
5.9	Myanmar: Electrification Rates Across State and Region	151
5.10	Myanmar: Relative Distribution of Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) per capita	153
5.11	Myanmar: Female Students as Percentage of Total Enrolment, by Level of Education	156
5.12	Myanmar: Women Staff in Basic Education Sector (Number and Percentage of Total)	159
5.13	Myanmar's Position in Global Gender Gap Rankings	162

6.1	Political Dynasties in Selected Philippine Congresses	172
6.2	Philippines: Regional Contribution to Gross Regional Domestic Product, 2002 and 2018	180
6.3	Philippines: Share of Employment and Underemployment by Economic Sector and Class of Worker	182
6.4	Philippines: Proportion of 15–24-year-olds by Education Level and Income Decile, 1998 and 2013	185
6.5	Philippines: Population for Each Type of Government Health Professionals, 2013 vs. 2018, Selected Regions	186
6.6	Philippines: Selected Infant and Child Mortality Rates, per 1,000 Infants/Children, 2003 and 2017	188
6.7	Philippines: Proportion of Children Below Five Years of Age Stunted, Underweight and Wasted, 2013 and 2015, by Wealth Quintile	189
6.8	Philippines: Households by Expenditure Class, 1997–2015 (as Percentage of Total Households)	190
7.1	Singapore: Summary of Inequality Trends	221
7.2	Singapore: Home Ownership Rate by Type of Dwelling	230
7.3	Singapore: Nominal Changes in Property Prices, Q1 2000 to Q4 2019, by Residence Type	231
7.4	Singapore: Correlation of Parents' and Child's Income Rank	233
7.5	Singapore: Average Household Monthly Expenditure on Private Tuition and Other Educational Courses	235
8.1	Thailand: Wealth Distribution of Adult Population	264
8.2	Thailand and International Comparison: Within-Generation Educational Inequality	270
8.3	Intergenerational Mobility in Education: Thailand vs Sample Average	270
8.4	Thailand: Percentage of Total Population with Healthcare Coverage	273
8.5	Human Capital Index: Thailand and International Averages	276
8.6	Thailand: Net Enrolment in the College Level by Expenditure Deciles	276
8.7	Thailand: International Standardized Test Scores by Geographic Area	278

8.8	Thailand: Cumulative Distribution of Household Income by Regions, 2017	280
8.9	Thailand: Distribution of Financial Assets across Regions, 2019	281
8.10	Comparison of Medical Resource Adequacy Between Bangkok and Other Provinces	284
8.11	Thailand: Education Attainment by Regions, 2017	284
8.12	Thailand's Richest Stockholders, 2019	287
8.13	Thailand's Richest Persons/Families, 2008 and 2019	288
9.1	Vietnam Living Standards Indicators: Per Capita Income and Expenditure, and Housing Value, 2002–16	301
9.2	Vietnam: Inequality Measures of Per Capita Expenditure	304
9.3	Vietnam: GMM Regressions of Income Inequality Indexes	316
A9.1	Vietnam: Income Inequality Measures	319
A9.2	Vietnam: Electricity Consumption Inequality Measures	319
A9.3	Vietnam: Housing-Value Inequality Measures	319

LISTS OF FIGURES

1.1	Poverty Rate: Headcount Ratio, Based on National Poverty Line Income	13
1.2	Gini Coefficient of Household Expenditure	14
1.3	Gini Coefficient of Household Income	16
2.1	Cambodia: Minimum Wage in the Apparel and Textile Industries	31
3.1	Long-Term Gini Index, 1976–2019	56
3.2	Wage-Productivity Ratio and Gini Index (33 Provinces, 2001–11)	58
3.3	Provincial Gini Index and Manufacturing Share (%) of RGDP, 2000–15	59
3.4	Resource Boom: Expenditure Gini Index (Indonesia) and Global Commodity Prices (2010 = 100), 1993–2018	60
3.5	Theil T Index of Household Expenditure (Overall, Between and Within Provinces), 2000–18	64
3.6	Theil T Index of Household Expenditure (Overall, Between and Within Sectors), 2000–18	66
3.7	Median Earnings by Income Groups (Top 10% = 1), 2001–18	67
3.8	Median Earnings by Education (Primary, Secondary, Tertiary; Tertiary = 1), 2001–18	69
3.9	Median Earnings by Area (Urban-Rural; Urban = 1), 2001–18	69
3.10	Median Earnings by Type of Employment (Regular Employee = 1), 2001–18	71
3.11	Median Earnings by Gender (Male = 1), 2001–18	72
3.12	Median Earnings of Persons with Disability (No Disability = 1), 2016–18	74

4.1	Malaysia: Gini Coefficient of Gross Household Income, by Area Type, 1984–2019	91
4.2	Gini Coefficient of Gross Household Income, by Ethnicity, 1984–2019	92
4.3	Real Annual Average Growth of Gross Household Income, by Income Bracket, 1989–2019	94
4.4	Interethnic and Urban-Rural Household Income Disparities, 1984–2019	97
4.5A	Top 20 per cent, Middle 40 per cent and Bottom 40 per cent Chinese to Bumiputra Average Household Income Ratios, 1989–2019	99
4.5B	Top 20 per cent, Middle 40 per cent and Bottom 40 per cent Indian to Bumiputra Average Household Income Ratios, 1989–2019	100
4.6	Interethnic Average Wage Ratios, by Gender, 2010–18	102
4.7	Gini Coefficient of EPF Savings Accounts (Proxy for Wage Inequality), 2004–18	106
4.8	Share of EPF Savings, by Segment, 2004–18	107
4.9A	Employees' Salaries: Ratio of Salary Relative to Managers, by Occupation Group, 2010–18	108
4.9B	Employees' Salaries: Ratio of Salary Relative to Managers, by Occupation Group, 2010–18	109
4.10	Female:Male Ratio in University Intake, Enrolment and Graduation, 2010 and 2018	112
4.11	Malaysian Mean Wage by Gender, and Gender Wage Gap, 2012–18	114
4.12	Malaysian Female Employees (Share of Total Female Employees) and Gender Wage Gaps, by Occupation, 2018	116
4.13	Employees: Gender Wage Gap, by Age Group, 2012–18	118
4.14	Wage Share Gap, by Age Group, 2012–18	120
4.15	Labour Force and Participation Gap, by Marital Status, 2018	121
4.16	Share of Employment, by Employment Status, 1998, 2003, 2008, 2013, 2018	122
A4.1	Gini Coefficient of Gross Household Income, by State, Lowest to Highest Average Income (2012 → 2014 → 2016 → 2019)	124
A4.2	Household Income, by State, per National Mean (Peninsular Malaysia West Coast States)	125

A4.3	Household Income, by State, per National Mean (Peninsular Malaysia Northern and East Coast States, East Malaysia)	126
5.1	Myanmar: Poverty Incidence under Two Different Methodologies	144
5.2	Myanmar: Labour Force Participation Rates across State and Regions, 2014	155
5.3	Myanmar: Gender Division of Labour by Economic Sector, 2015	158
5.4	Myanmar: Average Daily Wage Rate by Economic Sector, Per Civil Service, 2015	161
6.1	Philippines: GDP by Sector, 1998–2015	173
6.2	Selected Southeast Asian Countries: Market Capitalization of Family-Owned Conglomerates, by Sector	174
6.3	Philippines: Total Employment, by Economic Sector, 1995–2017	175
6.4	Philippines: Sectoral Labour Productivity, Nominal Pesos per Worker, 1995–2015	176
6.5	Philippines: Poor and Subsistence-Poor Individuals, Millions and Percentage of Population, 1991–2015	177
6.6	Philippines: Gini Index, National, Urban and Rural, 1991–2015	179
6.7	Philippines: Gini Index, by Politico-Administrative Region, 1997 and 2015	180
6.8	Philippines: Gini of Land Ownership, 1960–2012	183
6.9	Philippines: Share of Savings Deposits, 2012, 2016 and 2019	183
6.10	Philippines: Gini of Educational Attainment (Years of Schooling for Population 15 Years or Older), 1993–2013	184
6.11	Selected Southeast Asian Countries and China: Proportion of Poor Households to Total, 1985–2015	192
6.12	Selected Southeast Asian Countries and China: Proportion of Middle-Class Households to Total, 1985–2015	192
7.1	Singapore: Gini Coefficient of Per Capita Household Income	223
7.2	Singapore: Percentage Reduction in Gini Due to Government Taxes and Transfers	224

7.3	Singapore: Average Monthly Household Per Capita Income (Top 10 Per Cent vs Bottom 10 Per Cent)	224
7.4	Singapore: Real Household Per Capita Income Change, by Decile, 2000–18	225
7.5	Singapore: Real Household Per Capita Income Change, by Decile, 2014–18	226
7.6	Singapore: Average Monthly Expenditure Per Capita (S\$), by Income Quintile	227
7.7A	Singapore: Ratio of Average Monthly Expenditure Per Capita, Top 20 Per Cent vs Bottom 20 Per Cent	228
7.7B	Singapore: Ratio of Average Monthly Income Per Capita, Top 20 Per Cent vs Bottom 20 Per Cent	228
7.8	Singapore: Wealth Gini Coefficient	229
7.9	Singapore: Share of Luxury Cars	230
7.10	Singapore: Percentage of Children Born to Parents Earning the Lowest 20 Per Cent of Income Who Reached the Top 20 Per Cent of Income	233
7.11	Singapore: Average Household Monthly Expenditure on Private Tuition & Other Educational Courses (Percentage)	236
7.12	Singapore: Probability of Completing Tertiary Education Based on Parents' Education (Low/Medium/High)	237
7.13	Singapore: Income Earners by Geographical Planning Zones	239
7.14	Singapore: Ratio of Resident Households in Condominiums/ Apartments and Landed Properties vs HDB 1–3 Room Flats, by Geographical Planning Zones	240
7.15	Singapore: World Values Survey—How Proud of Nationality	241
8.1	Thailand: Gini Coefficient of Household Income, 1988–2017	265
8.2	Thailand's Gini Coefficients Based on Household Income and Consumption Expenditure	266
8.3	Thailand: Income Inequality, by Region	267
8.4	Thailand: Consumption Inequality, by Region	267
8.5	Indicators of Thailand Improved Standard of Living: HDI and GDP per capita	268
8.6	Thailand: Convergence in the Enrolment Rate in the Secondary School Level by Income Quartile	269

8.7	Thailand: Estimated Number of Households (Thousands) Falling into Poverty due to Medical Expenses (Protected from Health Impoverishment)	274
8.8	Bangkok's Gross Provincial Product (GPP) as Percentage of National GDP, 1995–2016	279
8.9	Thailand: Average Household Monthly Income, by Region, 2002–17	280
8.10	Thailand: Deposit Distribution across Regions, 1995 and 2019	282
8.11	Thailand: Credit Distribution across Regions, 1995 and 2019	283
8.12	Thailand: Top Income Brackets (Percentage of National Income), 2016	286
9.1	Vietnam: Gini Coefficient of Income, Expenditure and Housing Value, 2002–16	302
9.2	Gini Coefficient and GDP, Vietnam and the Countries Worldwide, 2012	304
9.3	Vietnam: Per Capita Expenditure of Kinh and Ethnic Minorities	306
9.4	Vietnam: Expenditure Poverty Rates of Kinh and Ethnic Minorities	306
9.5	Vietnam: Poverty Rate of Ethnic Groups, with 90 per cent Confidence Interval, 2016	308
9.6	Vietnam: Education Enrolment Rates, 2016	309
9.7	Vietnam: Decomposition of Expenditure Inequality by Urban/Rural Areas and Provinces, 2006 and 2016 (Theil-L Index)	311
9.8	Vietnam: Decomposition of Expenditure Inequality by Ethnic Groups, 2006 and 2016 (Theil-L Index)	312
9.9	Vietnam: Decomposition of Expenditure Inequality by Head of Household Characteristics, 2016 (Theil-L Index)	313
9.10	Vietnam: Income Inequality and Per Capita Income, by Province, 2002–16	315

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book is the culmination of a regional research project based at the ISEAS – Yusof Ishak Institute, Singapore and funded by the Konrad Adenauer Stiftung (KAS). We gratefully acknowledge KAS' financial support, and the Institute's facilitation of forums that allowed works in progress to be presented and critiqued. All the country chapters in this book benefited from the proceedings of a March 2019 in-house workshop and July 2019 public conference, both held at ISEAS. We also benefited from feedback received at the SEAsia Biennial Conference of December 2019 in Taipei. Earlier versions of a few chapters have been published in the December 2019 Special Issue of the *Journal of Southeast Asian Economies*. We extend our gratitude to the journal for the review process that helped sharpen the papers, and the coverage given to this subject from political economy perspectives.

We must express our heartfelt appreciation to the authors for their diligence and perseverance in drafting and revising their chapters, amid pandemic-triggered disruptions. This collective endeavour, in which we journeyed together for two years, has been enhanced by their camaraderie and commitment to the research subject. The product is a richer and diverse compilation of Southeast Asian perspectives. We gratefully acknowledge the authors' respective organizations for granting the flexibility and time, as well as supporting with additional resources where applicable, to complete the book chapters. There are also many individuals—peers and colleagues—who have commented on these chapters, above and beyond what is required in the formal peer review process, and we are thankful for these contributions. We heartily thank ISEAS Publishing, especially Rahilah Yusuf, for refining the manuscript into this book. Last and definitely not least, we are immensely indebted to our family members, not only for their moral support but also the unpaid care rendered to make all these possible.

ABOUT THE CONTRIBUTORS

(by Chapter)

Chheang Vannarith is President of the Asian Vision Institute (AVI), an independent think-tank based in Phnom Penh, Cambodia. He is a public policy analyst specializing in geopolitics and political economy of Southeast Asia. **Keo Piseth** is AVI's Vice President, and a researcher, practitioner and consultant in sustainable and inclusive development and environmental management. AVI aims to promote inclusive, adaptive and sustainable societies in Asia through knowledge co-creation and multi-stakeholder partnerships. Major research areas include geopolitics, political economy and sustainable development.

Mohammad Zulfan Tadjoeddin is Associate Professor and Director of Academic Program – Humanitarian and Development Studies at Western Sydney University, Australia. He had visiting research appointments at the Queen Elizabeth House, University of Oxford and the International Institute of Social Studies, Erasmus University Rotterdam. He is an economist by training and his research areas include conflict and development, employment and labour market as well as inequality and human development. He has published two books with Palgrave Macmillan, *Explaining Collective Violence* (2014) and *Employment and Reindustrialisation* (2018). His articles are published in leading academic journals such as *Journal of Development Studies*, *Oxford Development Studies*, *Journal of East Asian Studies*, *Journal of Peace Research* and *Journal of International Development*. He has consulted for the Asian Development Bank and various United Nations agencies.

Lee Hwok Aun is Senior Fellow and Co-ordinator of the Malaysia Studies Programme at the ISEAS – Yusof Ishak Institute, Singapore. He holds a PhD in Economics from the University of Massachusetts, Amherst, and an MSc in Political Economy of Development from SOAS, University of London. His main research interests are affirmative action, discrimination, inequality, labour and education. He is the author of *Affirmative Action in Malaysia and South Africa: Preference for Parity* (2021), and of articles in *Journal of Contemporary Asia*, *Journal of Asian and African Studies*, *Journal of the Asia Pacific Economy*, *Journal of Southeast Asian Economies*, as well as ISEAS' *Perspectives* and *Trends in Southeast Asia* series.

Christopher Choong Weng Wai is the Deputy Director of Research at Khazanah Research Institute (KRI) and an Atlantic Fellow for Social and Economic Equity at the International Inequalities Institute, London School of Economics. His main research interests pivot around the everyday reproduction of inequalities and exclusion, and the care economy. He was the lead author of the following reports: *Time to Care: Gender Inequality, Unpaid Care Work and Time Use Survey* (KRI, 2019) and *Welfare in Malaysia Across Three Decades: The State of Households 2020 Part I* (KRI, 2020). Prior to joining the Institute, he was the Economist for the UNDP Country Office of Malaysia, Singapore and Brunei Darussalam.

Zaw Oo is Executive Director of the Centre for Economic and Social Development (CESD), an independent and non-political think-tank. **Ngu Wah Win** is CESD's Senior Policy Coordinator; **Jana-Chin Rué Glutting**, **Aung Htun** and **S. Kanayde** are Research Associates. CESD supports evidence-based policy research, results-orientated knowledge sharing, and people-centred public advocacy to support the peaceful and sustainable transformation of Myanmar. Major research areas include labour market reform, food security and value chain development.

Jerik Cruz is a Lecturer at the Department of Economics of the Ateneo de Manila University, and a PhD student at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology. He completed his Master's degree at the Graduate Institute of International and Development Studies, Geneva in 2016. He is also a fellow of Action for Economic Reforms and the Labor Education and

Research Network, and has co-authored policy studies commissioned by ADB, ILO, Friedrich Ebert Stiftung, and the Philippine Institute for Development Studies.

Philip Arnold Tũaño is an Associate Professor and Chair of the Department of Economics of the Ateneo de Manila University. He is a project coordinator of the Philippine Human Development Network as well as acting manager of the Philippine Chapter of the Sustainable Development Solutions Network. He has also served as Director of Macropolicy of the Philippines' National Anti-Poverty Commission. He completed his PhD from the University of the Philippines in 2015, and has published papers on social and economic mobility, the welfare impacts of trade and tax reform and climate change, and the digital divide.

Nathan Peng is a Lecturer of Political Science in Singapore Management University (SMU) under the Faculty Development Scheme. He is currently pursuing graduate studies at the University of British Columbia as an SMU Overseas PhD Scholar. His research focuses on the political economy of development in Southeast Asia. His larger research agenda has two parts: the first examines the link between patterns of politics and the development potential of a country. The second looks at strategies countries adopt when economic growth does stagnate and their implications; specifically, what kinds of politics and policies better sustain quality of life relative to others in these states of slow growth. Ultimately, he hopes his research will help narrow the development gap between nations as well as the socioeconomic gaps within them.

Vimut Vanitcharearnthum is Associate Professor at the Department of Banking and Finance, Chulalongkorn Business School, Chulalongkorn University. He received a doctoral degree in Economics from the University of Chicago. His areas of expertise are macroeconomics and development economics. His recent publications are on top-income share and inequalities in Thailand and business accounting for the Thai economy.

Tung Duc Phung is the director of Mekong Development Research Institute (MDRI), an independent scientific research agency in Vietnam. **Cuong**

Viet Nguyen is a vice director of MDRI. **Trang Huyen Dang** is a research analyst at MDRI. MDRI aims to contribute to social change and regional development in the Mekong region through development policy research and sectoral studies. Major research areas include poverty reduction, ethnic minority, labour and immigration, and education.

