Reproduced from Contentious Belonging: The Place of Minorities in Indonesia, edited by Greg Fealy and Ronit Ricci (Singapore: ISEAS – Yusof Ishak Institute, 2019). This version was obtained electronically direct from the publisher on condition that copyright is not infringed. No part of this publication may be reproduced without the prior permission of ISEAS Publishing. Individual chapters are available at http://bookshop.iseas.edu.sg.

Contentious Belonging

The ANU Indonesia Project, a leading international centre of research and graduate training on the Indonesian economy and society, is housed in the Crawford School of Public Policy's Arndt-Corden Department of Economics. The Crawford School is part of ANU College of Asia and the Pacific at The Australian National University (ANU). Established in 1965 in response to profound changes in the Indonesian economic and political landscapes, the ANU Indonesia Project has grown from a small group of Indonesia-focused economists into an interdisciplinary research centre well known and respected across the world. Funded by ANU and the Australian Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade, the ANU Indonesia Project monitors and analyses recent developments in Indonesia; informs the Australian and Indonesian governments, business and the wider community about those developments and about future prospects; stimulates research on the Indonesian economy; and publishes the respected Bulletin of Indonesian Economic Studies.

ANU College of Asia and the Pacific's **Department of Political and Social Change** focuses on domestic politics, social processes and state–society relationships in Asia and the Pacific, and has a long-established interest in Indonesia.

Together with the Department of Political and Social Change, the ANU Indonesia Project holds the annual Indonesia Update conference, which offers an overview of recent economic and political developments and devotes attention to a significant theme in Indonesia's development. The *Bulletin of Indonesian Economic Studies* publishes the conference's economic and political overviews, while the edited papers related to the conference theme are published in the Indonesia Update Series.

The ISEAS - Yusof Ishak Institute (formerly Institute of Southeast Asian Studies) is an autonomous organization established in 1968. It is a regional centre dedicated to the study of socio-political, security, and economic trends and developments in Southeast Asia and its wider geostrategic and economic environment. The Institute's research programmes are grouped under Regional Economic Studies (RES), Regional Strategic and Political Studies (RSPS), and Regional Social and Cultural Studies (RSCS). The Institute is also home to the ASEAN Studies Centre (ASC), the Nalanda-Sriwijaya Centre (NSC) and the Singapore APEC Study Centre.

ISEAS Publishing, an established academic press, has issued more than 2,000 books and journals. It is the largest scholarly publisher of research about Southeast Asia from within the region. ISEAS Publishing works with many other academic and trade publishers and distributors to disseminate important research and analyses from and about Southeast Asia to the rest of the world.

Contentious Belonging

The Place of Minorities in Indonesia

GREG FEALY • RONIT RICCI



First published in Singapore in 2019 by ISEAS Publishing 30 Heng Mui Keng Terrace Singapore 119614

E-mail: publish@iseas.edu.sg

Website: http://bookshop.iseas.edu.sg

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, translated, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the ISEAS – Yusof Ishak Institute.

© 2019 ISEAS - Yusof Ishak Institute, Singapore

The responsibility for facts and opinions in this publication rests exclusively with the authors and their interpretations do not necessarily reflect the views or the policy of the Institute or its supporters.

ISEAS Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

Contentious Belonging: The Place of Minorities in Indonesia / edited by Greg Fealy and Ronit Ricci.

"... an outcome of the Indonesia Update Conference held in Canberra on

14-15 September 2018."

- 1. Minorities Indonesia.
- 2. Minorities Civil rights Indonesia.
- Indonesia Social conditions.
- 4. Indonesia Ethnic relations.
- 5. Minorities Indonesia Public opinion.
- 6. People with disabilities Indonesia.
- Sexual minorities Indonesia.
- Religious tolerance Indonesia.
- I. Fealy, Greg, editor.
- II. Ricci, Ronit, editor.
- III. Indonesia Update Conference (36th : 2018 : Australian National University)

DS644.4 I41 2018 2019

ISBN 978-981-4843-46-1 (soft cover) ISBN 978-981-4843-49-2 (hard cover) ISBN 978-981-4843-47-8 (ebook, PDF)

Cover photo: Wayang puppets on sale at an antiques market in Jakarta Photo by Peter Adams Photography Pte Ltd / Alamy Stock Photo

Edited and typeset by Beth Thomson, Japan Online, Canberra Indexed by Angela Grant, Sydney Printed in Singapore by Markono Print Media Pte Ltd

Contents

Con Ack	es and figures tributors nowledgments ssary	vii ix xi xiii
1	Diversity and its discontents: an overview of minority–majority relations in Indonesia <i>Greg Fealy and Ronit Ricci</i>	1
PAI	RT 1 HISTORY AND LAW	
2	Minorities in Indonesian history: from ambiguous advantage to cantonisation <i>Robert Cribb</i>	19
3	Minorities and discrimination in Indonesia: the legal framework <i>Tim Lindsey</i>	36
4	The Constitutional Court and minority rights: analysing the recent homosexual sex and indigenous belief cases Simon Butt	55
PAI	RT 2 DISABILITY	
5	Changing laws, changing attitudes: the place of people with disability in Indonesia <i>Thushara Dibley and Antoni Tsaputra</i>	77

vi	Contentious Belonging: The Place of Minorities in Indonesia	
6	Disability inclusion in Indonesia: the role of Islamic schools and universities in inclusive education reform Dina Afrianty	95
PAI	RT 3 SEXUALITY	
7	Is the recent wave of homophobia in Indonesia unexpected? Saskia E. Wieringa	113
8	Localising queer identities: queer activisms and national belonging in Indonesia <i>Hendri Yulius Wijaya</i>	133
PAI	RT 4 RELIGION AND ETHNICITY	
9	The mobilisation of intolerance and its trajectories: Indonesian Muslims' views of religious minorities and ethnic Chinese Marcus Mietzner and Burhanuddin Muhtadi	155
10	Disputes over places of worship in Indonesia: evaluating the role of the Interreligious Harmony Forum <i>Ihsan Ali-Fauzi</i>	175
11	Anti-Chinese sentiment and the 'return' of the <i>pribumi</i> discourse Charlotte Setijadi	194
12	Minority and advantage: the story of Sindhis in Indonesia Maria Myutel	214
13	'Normalising' the Orang Rimba: between mainstreaming, marginalising and respecting indigenous culture Butet Manurung	232
PAI	RT 5 REFLECTIONS	
14	Manipulating minorities and majorities: reflections on 'contentious belonging' Sidney Jones	255
Inde		267

Tables and figures

Tables

5.1

11.4

	8/2018 on People with Disabilities	85
9.1	Share of Muslims objecting to non-Muslims occupying elected positions (%)	162
9.2	Share of Muslims objecting to non-Muslim governors, by educational level (%)	168
9.3	Share of Muslims objecting to non-Muslim places of worship, by educational level (%)	170
Figu	res	
8.1	The Genderbread Person, version 4	148
9.1	Religio-cultural intolerance: share of Muslims objecting to non-Muslim ceremonies and places of worship (%)	163
9.2	Rates of Muslim prejudice towards ethnic Chinese (%)	165
11.1	Respondents' views on whether Chinese Indonesians are economically privileged (%)	206
11.2	Respondents' views on whether Chinese Indonesians are exclusive (%)	207
11.3	Respondents' views on whether 'It is inappropriate	

Overview of implementing regulations for Law No.

for pribumi Indonesians to intermarry with Chinese

Respondents' views on whether 'Chinese Indonesians have their own religion that does not fit well in

208

209

Indonesians', by religious background (%)

Indonesia', by religious background (%)

Contributors

Dina Afrianty, Research Fellow, La Trobe Law School, Melbourne

Ihsan Ali-Fauzi, Director, PUSAD Paramadina, Jakarta

Simon Butt, Professor of Indonesian Law and Director, Centre for Asian and Pacific Law, University of Sydney, Sydney

Robert Cribb, Professor of Asian History, Department of Political and Social Change, Coral Bell School of Asia Pacific Affairs, College of Asia and the Pacific, Australian National University, Canberra

Thushara Dibley, Deputy Director, Sydney Southeast Asia Centre (SSEAC), University of Sydney, Sydney

Greg Fealy, Associate Professor, Department of Political and Social Change, Coral Bell School of Asia Pacific Affairs, College of Asia and the Pacific, Australian National University, Canberra

Sidney Jones, Director, Institute for Policy Analysis of Conflict (IPAC), Jakarta

Tim Lindsey, Malcolm Smith Professor of Asian Law, Redmond Barry Distinguished Professor, and Director of the Centre for Indonesian Law, Islam and Society at Melbourne Law School, University of Melbourne, Melbourne

Butet Manurung, Director, Sokola Institute

Marcus Mietzner, Associate Professor, Coral Bell School of Asia Pacific Affairs, College of Asia and the Pacific, Australian National University, Canberra; and Visiting Research Scholar, Center for Southeast Asian Studies, Kyoto University, Kyoto

Burhanuddin Muhtadi, Senior Lecturer in Political Science, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Syarif Hidayatullah State Islamic University, Jakarta; Executive Director, Indikator Politik Indonesia, Jakarta; and Director of Public Affairs, Lembaga Survei Indonesia (LSI), Jakarta

Maria Myutel, School of Culture, History and Language, College of Asia and the Pacific, Australian National University, Canberra

Ronit Ricci, Sternberg-Tamir Chair in Comparative Cultures and Associate Professor, Departments of Asian Studies and Religion, Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Jerusalem; and Associate Professor, School of Culture, History and Language, College of Asia and the Pacific, Australian National University, Canberra

Charlotte Setijadi, Assistant Professor of Humanities, School of Social Sciences, Singapore Management University, Singapore

Antoni Tsaputra, PhD Candidate, Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences (FASS), University of New South Wales (UNSW), Sydney

Saskia E. Wieringa, Chair, Women's Same-Sex Relations Crossculturally, Amsterdam Institute for Social Science Research (AISSR), University of Amsterdam, Amsterdam

Hendri Yulius Wijaya, Writer

Acknowledgments

The papers in this volume were presented during the thirty-sixth Indonesia Update Conference at the Australian National University (ANU), Canberra, on 14–15 September 2018. Our greatest thanks go to the authors, without whom this book would not exist.

The Indonesia Update Conference is organised jointly by the Indonesia Project and the Department of Political and Social Change at the ANU, and has been conducted annually since 1983. In preparing for the 2018 conference, we were greatly supported by Blane Lewis, the head of the ANU Indonesia Project, and we thank him for his guidance. We also acknowledge the helpful suggestions and feedback from all Indonesianists at the ANU.

We thank the core team of the 2018 Indonesia Update Conference for making the conference run smoothly: Kate McLinton, Lydia Napitupulu, Nurkemala Muliani, Ruth Nikijuluw, Maxine McArthur and Thuy Thu Pham. We would also like to thank Rus'an Nasrudin, Wishnu Mahraddika, Joseph Marshan and all the student volunteers for their assistance during the conference, and the speakers, chairs and discussants for their valuable contributions. Perhimpunan Pelajar Indonesia Australia (PPIA) ACT, the Australia–Indonesia Youth Association (AIYA) ACT and the ANU ASEAN Society also assisted with preparations for and logistical support during the conference. We are grateful to Liam Gammon and his team at *New Mandala* for helping to promote the event.

We acknowledge the continuing support of the ANU College of Asia and the Pacific. The Australian Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (DFAT), through its grant to the ANU Indonesia Project, has been a long-term supporter of the Update conferences and the associated series of books. We thank Virginia Hooker for her welcoming remarks at the conference, and Julie Heckscher, the Director of DFAT's Southeast Asia Division, for formally opening the conference. After the Update we held two follow-up events in Sydney and Melbourne (the 'Mini Updates'). For

these, we thank Aaron Connelly and his colleagues at the Lowy Institute for International Policy in Sydney and Tim Lindsey at the Centre for Indonesian Law, Islam and Society at the University of Melbourne.

The Indonesia Update series of books has been published annually since 1989. Once again, we would like to thank our publisher, the ISEAS – Yusof Ishak Institute, especially Ng Kok Kiong and Rahilah Yusuf, for their excellent work. We are indebted to Beth Thomson for her superb editorial work; she has been involved in the Update book series since 1994. We also thank Angela Grant for assistance with indexing.

Greg Fealy and Ronit Ricci *Canberra, April* 2019

Glossary

adat custom or tradition; customary law, traditional law

agama religion

Ahok Basuki Tjahaja Purnama (former governor of

Jakarta)

AILA Aliansi Cinta Keluarga (Family Love Alliance)

aliran kepercayaan 'stream of beliefs'; term for traditional religious beliefs that do not belong to one of the six officially

recognised religions

AMAN Aliansi Masyarakat Adat Nusantara (Alliance of

Archipelagic Indigenous Peoples)

ANBTI Aliansi Nasional Bhinneka Tunggal Ika (Unity in

Diversity National Alliance)

asas kekeluargaan family principle, family values

asas tunggal sole basic principle

asli authentic, indigenous, native

banci transgender person

Bappenas Badan Perencanaan Pembangunan Nasional

(Ministry of National Development Planning)

Bhaiband 'Brothers'; a subcaste of Hindu Sindhis

Bhinneka Tunggal Ika 'Out of Many, One', 'Unity in Diversity', 'The Many

Are One'

bissu a gender category among the Bugis (South Sulawesi)

BJP Bharatiya Janata Party

BKS Gereja Badan Kerjasama Seluruh Gereja (All Churches

Cooperation Agency)

BKSDA Balai Konservasi Sumber Daya Alam (Natural

Resource Conservation Agency)

BMA Bombay Merchant Association

BPS Badan Pusat Statistik (Statistics Indonesia), the

central statistics agency

BRWA Badan Registrasi Wilayah Adat (Ancestral Domain

Registration Agency)

Budi Utomo the first Indonesian nationalist organisation,

founded in 1908

cacat defect, deformity camat subdistrict head

CAPPA Foundation Ecological Justice for People Foundation CRPD Convention on the Rights of Persons with

Disabilities

dakwah religious outreach, Islamic proselytising

Darul Islam Islamist insurgent movement that rebelled against

the Republic of Indonesia between 1948 and 1962 and declared Indonesia to be an Islamic state in 1949

desa adat customary village

difabel 'diffability'; differently abled

disabilitas disability

DPR Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat (People's Representative

Council), also known as 'House of Representatives'

and as 'parliament'

DPRD Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat Daerah (Regional

People's Representative Council)

dukun godong shaman in an Orang Rimba community

e-KTP kartu tanda penduduk elektronik (electronic identity

card)

FBR Forum Betawi Rempug (Betawi Brotherhood Forum)

fiqh Islamic jurisprudence or legal prescriptions
FJI Front Jihad Islam (Islamic Jihad Front)

FKUB Forum Kerukunan Umat Beragama (Interreligious

Harmony Forum)

FLNKS Front de Libération Nationale Kanak et Socialiste

(Kanak and Socialist National Liberation Front)

FPI Front Pembela Islam (Islamic Defenders Front)

FTM female-to-male

Gerindra Gerakan Indonesia Raya (Great Indonesia

Movement)

Gerwani Gerakan Wanita Indonesia (Indonesian Women's

Movement)

GMIS Gandhi Memorial International School

GMIT Gereja Masehi Injili di Timor (Christian Evangelical

Church in Timor)

GMS Gandhi Memorial School

Golkar Golongan Karya (the state political party under the

New Order, and a major post-New Order party)

GPdI Gereja Pantekosta di Indonesia (Pentecostal Church

of Indonesia)

Guided Democracy political system in place from 1957 to 1966 under

President Sukarno

Hadith report or account of the words and deeds of the

Prophet Muhammad transmitted through a chain of

narrators

the annual pilgrimage to Mecca

Hanura Partai Hati Nurani Rakyat (People's Conscience

Party)

HTI Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia

IAIN Institut Agama Islam Negeri (State Islamic Institute)

ICMI Ikatan Cendekiawan Muslimin Indonesia

(Indonesian Association of Muslim Intellectuals)

Indo Indonesian of European descent

IPT 1965 International People's Tribunal on 1965 Crimes

Against Humanity in Indonesia

jilbab headscarf worn by Muslim women

Jokowi (President) Joko Widodo

kafir infidel kampung urban village kartu keluarga family card

KBM 1969 Surat Keputusan Bersama 1969 (Joint Decree 1969) kepercayaan 'beliefs'; term for traditional religious beliefs that

do not belong to one of the six officially recognised

religions

Kesbangpol Badan Kesatuan Bangsa dan Politik (Agency for the

Protection of National Unity and Politics)

Ketuhanan Yang Maha Esa Almighty God

kitab kuning 'yellow books' (a reference to the colour of the

pages); commentaries on the Qur'an and Islamic law

used as teaching texts in pesantren

KKI Warsi Komunitas Konservasi Indonesia Warsi (Indonesian

Conservation Community Warsi)

Koalisi Masyarakat People's Coalition to 'Reject the One-Size-Fits-All

'Tolak PP Sapu Jagat' Government Regulation'

Komnas HAM Komisi Nasional Hak Asasi Manusia (National

Commission for Human Rights)

Kompak Komunitas Peace Maker Kupang (Kupang

Peacemaker Community)

Kopkamtib Komando Operasi Pemulihan Keamanan dan

Ketertiban (Operational Command for the

Restoration of Security and Order)

KPI Koalisi Perempuan Indonesia (Indonesian Women's

Coalition)

KSP Kantor Staf Presiden Republik Indonesia (Executive

Office of the President of the Republic of Indonesia)

KTP kartu tanda penduduk (identity card)

KUHP Kitab Undang-Undang Pidana (Criminal Code)

Laksusda Pelaksana Khusus Daerah (Special Territorial

Administrator)

LEKRA Lembaga Bantuan Hukum (Legal Aid Office)
LEKRA Lembaga Kebudayaan Rakyat (People's Cultural

Institute)

Lemhannas Lembaga Ketahanan Nasional Republik Indonesia

(National Resilience Institute)

LGBT lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender

LGBTQI lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, queer and

intersex

LSI Lembaga Survei Indonesia (Indonesian Survey

Institute)

madrasah Islamic school

masyarakat adat 'traditional' or 'customary' community

masyarakat hukum adat customary law community

masyarakat terasing isolated community

masyarakat tertinggal 'left-behind community'; underdeveloped or

isolated community

Melindo Melanesia Indonesia MGS Mahatma Gandhi School

MPR Majelis Permusyawaratan Rakyat (People's

Consultative Assembly), Indonesia's upper house

MSG Melanesian Spearhead Group MSM men who have sex with men

MTF male-to-female

MUI Majelis Ulama Indonesia (Indonesian Council of

Religious Scholars), founded in 1975

NasDem Nasional Demokrat (National Democrats)

Nawacita Nine Development Goals

negara hukum rule of law

New Order political system in place from 1966 to 1998 under

President Suharto

NGO non-government organisation

NKRI Negara Kesatuan Republik Indonesia (Unitary State

of the Republic of Indonesia)

non-pribumi non-indigenous Indonesian

orang person

Orang Rimba People of the Jungle; Forest People

Pancasila the five guiding principles of the Indonesian state:

belief in God, humanitarianism, nationalism, democracy and social justice; or, in another formulation: belief in one supreme God, just and civilised humanity, national unity, democracy led by wisdom and prudence through consultation and

representation, and social justice

PBM 2006 Peraturan Bersama Menteri 2006 (Joint Ministerial

Regulation 2006)

PDI-P Partai Demokrasi Indonesia-Perjuangan (Indonesian

Democratic Party of Struggle)

pemekaran 'blossoming'; the subdivision of administrative

regions to create new provinces, districts and

subdistricts

penghayat kepercayaan believer in an indigenous religion

Peranakan Chinese Indonesians who have adopted local

customs and assimilated into local communities

peraturan regulation

Pokja

perda peraturan daerah (regional government regulation)

pesantren Islamic boarding school

PKB Partai Kebangkitan Bangsa (National Awakening

Party)

PKH Program Keluarga Harapan (Family Hope Program)
PKI Partai Komunis Indonesia (Indonesian Communist

Party)

PKMT Pemukiman Kembali Masyarakat Terasing

(Resettlement of Isolated Peoples)

PKS Partai Keadilan Sejahtera (Prosperous Justice Party)

Kelompok Kerja Undang-Undang Disabilitas

(Working Group on the Disability Law)

pornoaksi pornographic action/activities

PP peraturan pemerintah (government decree or

regulation)

PPP Partai Persatuan Pembangunan (United

Development Party)

PRC People's Republic of China

pribumi indigenous, nativePribumi Party Partai Priboemi

priyayitraditional Javanese upper-class elitepunakawanattendant to a main character in the Indic

Mahabharata story

PUSAD Paramadina Pusat Studi Agama dan Demokrasi (Center for

the Study of Religion and Democracy in the

Paramadina Foundation)

QUANGO quasi-autonomous non-government organisation Ramadan ninth month of the Islamic calendar during which

fasting is required

reformasi 'reform'; name for the post-Suharto period (since

1998)

Riskesdas Riset Kesehatan Dasar (Basic Health Research)

rombongan Orang Rimba clan rumah ibadat house of worship

SAD Suku Anak Dalam (Tribes of the Interior; People

from the Deep Jungle)

SARA suku, agama, ras dan antar golongan (ethnicity,

religion, race and intergroup)

SBKRI Surat Bukti Kewarganegaraan Republik Indonesia

(Proof of Indonesian Citizenship Document)

sinetron commercial soap opera

SLB sekolah luar biasa (special school)

Sobat KBB Solidaritas Korban Pelanggaran Kebebasan

Beragama dan Berkeyakinan (Solidarity of Victims of Violations of Religious Freedom and Belief)

sexual orientation, gender identity and gender

expression

Suku Anak Dalam Tribes of the Interior; People from the Deep Jungle

Survei Sosio-Ekonomi Nasional (National Socio-

Economic Survey)

Totok China-born or Chinese residents in Indonesia who

have not assimilated or only partially assimilated

into local society

Tuhan Yang Maha Esa Almighty God

tumenggung chief of an Orang Rimba community

UIN Universitas Islam Negeri (State Islamic University)

ulama 'learned'; Islamic scholar(s)

ULMWP United Liberation Movement for West Papua

umrah pilgrimage to Mecca that can be undertaken at any

time of the year

UN United Nations

UNDP United Nations Development Programme

US United States

USAID United States Agency for International Development VOC Vereenigde Oost-Indische Compagnie (United East

India Company; Dutch East India Company)

wadam wanita Adam (transgender person), from wanita and

Adam and no longer common

wandu (Javanese) transgender person

Wantimpres Dewan Pertimbangan Presiden (Presidential

Advisory Council)

waria wanita-pria (woman-man), inadequately translated

as 'transgender women'

Warsi see KKI Warsi

Currencies

SOGIE

Susenas

\$ US dollar

Rp Indonesian rupiah

