

as she examines their day-to-day lives in Singapore. This book is thus a worthy addition to the growing scholarship that sits at the intersection of migrant imaginaries, globalizing labour markets, and individual state and society responses to changing demographics within their borders.

**Anju Mary Paul**

Division of Social Sciences, Yale-NUS College, National University of Singapore, 10 College Avenue West, #01-101, Singapore 138527; email: anju.paul@yale-nus.edu.sg.

DOI: 10.1355/sj33-2j

*Nanyang huazong: Malaixiya pili yibao yandong miaoyu shilu yu chuanshuo* 南洋華蹤：馬來西亞霹靂怡保岩洞廟宇史錄與傳說 [Trails of the Nanyang Chinese: History and legends of the cave temples in Ipoh of Malaysia]. Edited by Tan Ai Boay 陳愛梅 and Toh Teong Chuan 杜忠全. Beijing: *Zhongguo shehui kexue chubanshe* [China Social Sciences Press], 2017. 276 pp.

This volume of essays, funded by the Perak Non-Islamic Affairs Department (Unit Hal Ehwal Bukan Islam Negeri Perak, 霹靂州非伊斯蘭事務局), is an attempt to uncover the history and legends of cave temples (*yandong miaoyu* 岩洞廟宇) in Ipoh, the capital city of the Malaysian state of Perak. Scholars of Malaysian history have long been interested in Chinese migration to British Malaya and their involvement in Perak's tin mining industry during the nineteenth century and the first half of the twentieth century. The intention of this volume is not to focus on Chinese tin mines in Perak, but rather to present the lesser-known histories of the numerous cave temples in the Ipoh region. It examines the historical sources and epigraphic records of seven cave temples that were established before the Japanese occupation of Malaya in 1941.

Following the forewords by Tan Chee-Beng 陳志明 (Sun Yat-sen University), Wong Sin Kiong 黃賢強 (National University of Singapore), and Mah Hang Soon 馬漢順 (Perak Non-Islamic Affairs Committee), Tan Ai Boay's short introductory essay explains the

background to the volume and the rationale for its focus and themes. Tan's chapter 1 provides a list of thirty-nine cave temples and ten temples located within the caves' surrounding areas. Chapter 2, which reads like a literature review of primary sources, presents an overview of the British colonial records, newspaper articles, and Chinese epigraphic materials concerning the Chinese temples in Perak. She argues for the need to collect and document the print and material sources of the cave temples before they are lost to time. The second chapter ends with a reprint of the Pangkor Treaty of 1874.

The remaining chapters, each focusing on one of the seven cave temples, are organized chronologically based on their year of establishment. Liow Min Wei 廖明威 and Toh Teong Chuan's essay (chapter 3) focuses on Kwong Fook Ngam 廣福岩, the oldest cave temple in Ipoh. The Buddhist temple was established by Venerable Weijia 微嘉 of the Meifeng 梅峰 lineage in 1890. It was once an influential monastery in the Ipoh region prior to the founding of Sam Poh Tong 三寶洞 (the topic of chapter 8). Following the advent of Sam Poh Tong, Kwong Fook Ngam came under the management of the abbot and committee of the newer cave temple. Tan Chaw Hui's 陳昭慧 essay (chapter 4) on Nam Tou Ngam 南道岩 explores the arrival and development of institutional Taoism in Perak. The chapter suggests that Nam Tou Ngam, which was founded by Master Zhong Shankun 鐘善坤 of the Donghua Shan Haiyun lineage 東華山海雲派, marked the earliest presence of the Quanzhen 全真 school of Taoism in Malaysia. Tan Chaw Hui's essay (chapter 5) on Loong Thow Ngam 龍頭岩 examines yet another Quanzhen Taoist cave temple. Perhaps the most intriguing part of this chapter is the description of Master Li Zhenxiang's 李真祥 talismanic practices and healing skills. Liow Min Wei's essay (chapter 6) charts the history of Nam Thean Tong 南天洞, which is considered one of the few cave temples that have maintained their original appearances. Although Nam Thean Tong is a Taoist temple, it houses deities of three religions (*sanjiao* 三教): Buddhism, Confucianism, and Taoism. Additionally, the chapter contains several images of rare handwritten manuscripts.

Tan Chaw Hui and Tan Ai Boay (chapter 7) look at Tung Wah Tong 東華洞, a cave temple established to serve as a spiritual refuge for early Chinese migrants in Perak. During the Malayan Emergency, the cave temple was once used as a hideout for communist insurgents. In 1980, Tung Wah Tong was registered as Tung Wah Buddhist Meditation Centre (Pusat Meditasi Buddhist Tung Wah), much to the displeasure of the temple's Taoist council members. This chapter ends with Tan Chaw Hui's anecdote about her fieldwork at the Tung Wah Tong. Toh Teong Chuan's essay (chapter 8) on Sam Poh Tong 三寶洞 focuses on how the cave temple became a popular tourist site, as well as a crematorium and columbarium complex. It suggests that Sam Poh Tong maintains a close relationship with the local Chinese community. Finally, an essay by Liow Min Wei (chapter 9) explores how Perak Tong 霹靂洞 became known as the "Dunhuang of Southeast Asia" (*Nandao Dunhuang* 南島敦煌). This Buddhist cave temple contains numerous paintings and calligraphies of renowned Chinese intellectuals from Malaysia, Singapore, Thailand, Taiwan, Hong Kong, Macao, and mainland China.

In the short concluding chapter (chapter 10), Tan Ai Boay and Toh Teong Chuan attempt to draw together the findings of the individual essays. They suggest that legends played an important role in defining the history of Ipoh's cave temples and are important narratives that reveal the values and worldviews of the Chinese community in Malaysia. Tan and Toh also highlight the fact that the lack of successors is a pressing problem threatening the continued existence of temple caves in Ipoh.

Drawing on fieldwork and archival research, the contributors of this volume offer valuable insights into the multifaceted Chinese religious beliefs and practices in a Malaysian city. The chapters on the cave temples do well in documenting the historical sources and epigraphic materials found in those temples. The colour photographs in the essays are truly stunning, and seeing these images emphasizes the diverse range of religious activities that characterizes the Chinese diaspora. Nevertheless, this volume suffers from a lack of engagement with historiography and analytical discussion. Missing from these essays are the connections and networks between the

Ipoh cave temples and other religious sites in other parts of Malaysia and beyond. How do the cave temples, for example, interact and collaborate with each other and with temples in various parts of Malaysia? How do Buddhist and Taoist cave temples maintain their ties with their ancestral monasteries (*zuting* 祖庭) in China? How do Muslims perceive these cave temples in Muslim-majority Malaysia? It is important to note that cave temples do not exist in isolation but are situated within, and therefore influenced by, the course of socio-political change in colonial and post-colonial Malaysia.

Furthermore, this volume could be stronger with better chapter organization and editing. For instance, the introduction, chapter 1, and chapter 2 could be merged into a single chapter. In addition, the English translations contain numerous typographical errors, punctuation mistakes, and grammatical inconsistencies. For example, “glossary” is misspelled as “glossory” (List of chapter[sic]); “*yinglian* 楹聯” (couplets on the pillars) is mistranslated as “autograph of Tao couplets” (p. 64), and “*sanjiao dian* 三教殿” (hall of three religions) is mistyped as “hall of three regions” (p. 259). Lastly, the book does not have a bibliography, so readers are forced to search through the many footnotes to learn more about the sources cited.

Despite these minor quibbles, this volume is an informative and well-researched contribution to the study of Chinese religions and Malaysian history. It is hoped that it will inspire further research on the temple caves in Perak and in Malaysia in general.

**Jack Meng-Tat Chia**

Department of History, Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences, National University of Singapore, 11 Arts Link, AS1 #05-27, Singapore 117573; email: jackchia@nus.edu.sg.

DOI: 10.1355/sj33-2k

*A Meeting of Masks: Status, Power and Hierarchy in Bangkok.* By Sophorntavy Vorng. Copenhagen: Nordic Institute of Asian Studies, 2017. xii+194 pp.

In 1977, Benedict Anderson first focused attention on the then new Thai middle class, arguing that the success of the 1973 uprising