

Reproduced from *The South China Sea Dispute: Navigating Diplomatic and Strategic Tensions*, edited by Ian Storey and Lin Cheng-yi (Singapore: ISEAS – Yusof Ishak Institute, 2016). This version was obtained electronically direct from the publisher on condition that copyright is not infringed. No part of this publication may be reproduced without the prior permission of ISEAS – Yusof Ishak Institute. Individual chapters are available at <<http://bookshop.iseas.edu.sg>>

THE SOUTH CHINA SEA DISPUTE

ISEAS – Yusof Ishak Institute (formerly the Institute of Southeast Asian Studies) was established as an autonomous organization in 1968. It is a regional centre dedicated to the study of socio-political, security and economic trends and developments in Southeast Asia and its wider geostrategic and economic environment.

The Institute's research programmes are the Regional Economic Studies (RES, including ASEAN and APEC), Regional Strategic and Political Studies (RSPS), and Regional Social and Cultural Studies (RSCS).

ISEAS Publishing, an established academic press, has issued more than 2,000 books and journals. It is the largest scholarly publisher of research about Southeast Asia from within the region. ISEAS Publications works with many other academic and trade publishers and distributors to disseminate important research and analyses from and about Southeast Asia to the rest of the world.

THE SOUTH CHINA SEA DISPUTE

NAVIGATING DIPLOMATIC AND STRATEGIC TENSIONS

Edited by
Ian Storey and
Lin Cheng-yi

First published in Singapore in 2016 by
ISEAS Publishing
30 Heng Mui Keng Terrace
Singapore 119614
E-mail: publish@iseas.edu.sg
Website: <http://bookshop.iseas.edu.sg>

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the ISEAS – Yusof Ishak Institute.

© 2016 ISEAS – Yusof Ishak Institute, Singapore

The responsibility for facts and opinions in this publication rests exclusively with the authors and their interpretations do not necessarily reflect the views or the policy of the publisher or its supporters.

ISEAS Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

The South China Sea Dispute : Navigating Diplomatic and Strategic Tensions /
edited by Ian Storey and Cheng-Yi Lin.

1. South China Sea—International status.
2. Territorial waters—South China Sea.
3. South China Sea—Claims.
4. South China Sea—Strategic aspects.
5. China—Foreign relations—Southeast Asia.
6. Southeast Asia—Foreign relations—China.
7. United States—Foreign relations—Southeast Asia.
8. Southeast Asia—Foreign relations—United States.
- I. Storey, Ian.
- II. Lin, Cheng-yi.

KZA1692 S722

December 2015

ISBN 978-981-4695-55-8 (soft cover)
ISBN 978-981-4695-56-5 (E-book PDF)

Cover Photo: CSIS Asia Maritime Transparency Initiative/DigitalGlobe.

Typeset by International Typesetters Pte Ltd
Printed in Singapore by Markono Print Media Pte Ltd

CONTENTS

| | |
|---|-----|
| <i>About the Contributors</i> | vii |
| 1. Introduction <i>Ian Storey and Cheng-yi Lin</i> | 1 |
| 2. Untangling a Complex Web: Understanding Competing Maritime Claims in the South China Sea <i>Clive Schofield</i> | 21 |
| 3. China Debates the South China Sea Dispute <i>Mingjiang Li</i> | 47 |
| 4. Taiwan's Evolving Policy towards the South China Sea Dispute, 1992–2016 <i>Anne Hsiu-an Hsiao and Cheng-yi Lin</i> | 74 |
| 5. The South China Sea: Primary Contradictions in China–Southeast Asia Relations <i>Alice D. Ba</i> | 104 |
| 6. Rising Tensions in the South China Sea: Southeast Asian Responses <i>Ian Storey</i> | 134 |
| 7. The Philippines and the South China Sea Dispute: Security Interests and Perspectives <i>Aileen S.P. Baviera</i> | 161 |
| 8. A Vietnamese Perspective on the South China Sea Dispute <i>Hoang Anh Tuan</i> | 186 |

| | | |
|-----|--|-----|
| 9. | The South China Sea Dispute: Options for Malaysia <i>Elina Noor</i> | 205 |
| 10. | The United States and the South China Sea: Front Line of Hegemonic Tension? <i>Denny Roy</i> | 228 |
| 11. | The South China Sea Dispute in U.S.–ASEAN Relations <i>Yann-Huei Song</i> | 247 |
| 12. | Japan and the South China Sea Dispute: A Stakeholder’s Perspective Yoichiro Sato | 272 |
| 13. | Conclusion <i>Ian Storey</i> | 291 |
| | <i>Index</i> | 297 |

ABOUT THE CONTRIBUTORS

Alice D. Ba is Associate Professor of Political Science and International Relations at the University of Delaware, Newark. Her research focuses on the politics of regionalism in East Asia and the Asia Pacific, especially ASEAN; Southeast Asia's relations with China, the United States and Japan; and comparative questions of regime building and institutional change. The author of *(Re)Negotiating East and Southeast Asia: Region, Regionalism, and the Association of Southeast Asian Nations* (2009), Professor Ba also co-edited *Contending Perspectives on Global Governance: Coherence Contestation and World Order* (2005). Her articles have appeared in *Asian Survey*, *Contemporary Southeast Asia*, *International Relations of the Asia-Pacific* and *Pacific Review*. Her recent chapters and articles include "Power Bumps on the Way to Community: Asia's Competing Security Logics" (2014); "Is China Leading: China, Southeast Asia, and East Asian Integration" (2014); and "The Association of Southeast Asian Nations: Between Internal and External Legitimacy" (2013). A research associate of the ASEAN Studies Center at American University in Washington, D.C., Professor Ba also serves on the editorial boards of *Australian Journal of International Affairs*, *Journal of Current Southeast Asian Affairs* and Routledge's Comparative Asian Politics series.

Aileen San Pablo-Baviera is a Professor at the Asian Center, University of the Philippines and editor-in-chief of *Asian Politics & Policy*. She is also a Visiting Professor at the University of Malaya where she teaches at the Asia-Europe Institute. Her teaching and research specializations include contemporary China and International Relations (specifically Southeast Asia–China relations, Asia-Pacific security, the South China Sea maritime and territorial disputes and regional integration). Her recent publications include "Changing Dynamics in Philippines–China–US Relations: Impact of the South China Sea Disputes" (2014); "An ASEAN Perspective on the South China Sea: China–ASEAN Collision or China–US Hegemonic

Competition” (2014); “Territorial and Maritime Jurisdiction Disputes in East Asia: Comparing Bilateral and Multilateral Approaches” (2013); and “Accommodation with Hedging: Southeast Asia’s Changing Perspectives toward China” (2010). Professor Baviera has held visiting fellowships and lectured at various institutions in Australia, China, Japan, India, Malaysia, Singapore, Taiwan and the United States. She is an active member of the Philippine Association for Chinese Studies and the National Research Council of the Philippines, as well as founding president of the recently established Asia Pacific Pathways to Progress Foundation.

Hoang Anh Tuan is Vietnam’s ambassador to the Republic of Indonesia. He was formerly Director-General of the Institute for Foreign Policy and Strategic Studies at the Diplomatic Academy of Vietnam (DAV) in Hanoi. He is also co-founder of the Southeast Asia Roundtable, Washington, D.C. He served as Minister Counselor at the Embassy of Vietnam in Washington D.C. from March 2007 to September 2010. Before that, he held various research positions at DAV, including the director of research. Dr Hoang obtained his undergraduate degree at the College of Foreign Affairs, Hanoi and his Master’s and PhD from the Fletcher School of Law and Diplomacy, Tufts University. He has been a visiting fellow at various research institutions, including the Institute of International Peace Research, Norway; the Nordic Institute of Asian Studies, Denmark; the Institute of Southeast Asian Studies, Singapore; and Uppsala University, Sweden. He has published extensively on politics and security in East Asia and the foreign policies of Vietnam, China and the United States.

Anne Hsiu-An Hsiao is an Associate Research Fellow at the Institute of International Relations (IIR), National Chengchi University in Taiwan. She received her PhD in Law from the London School of Economics and Political Science (LSE) in the United Kingdom. Her research interests include theory and development of international law; international law issues related to cross-straits relations; dispute settlement and conflict management of territorial disputes, especially in the South and East China Seas. Before joining IIR, Professor Hsiao served on Taiwan’s National Security Council and at the Taiwan Foundation for Democracy (TFD).

Li Mingjiang is an Associate Professor at the S. Rajaratnam School of International Studies (RSIS), Nanyang Technological University, Singapore. He is also the Coordinator of the China Programme at RSIS. He received his PhD in Political Science from Boston University. His

research interests include China's diplomatic history, Sino–U.S. relations, Asia-Pacific security, and domestic sources of Chinese foreign policy. He is the author (including editor and co-editor) of twelve books. His recent co-edited volumes include *China's Power and Asian Security* (2014) and *New Dynamics in US–China Relations: Contending for the Asia Pacific* (2014). He has published articles in *Global Governance*, *Cold War History*, *Journal of Contemporary China*, *The Chinese Journal of International Politics*, *China: An International Journal*, *China Security*, *Harvard Asia Quarterly*, *Security Challenges* and *The International Spectator*. Dr Li frequently participates in various track-two events on East Asian regional security.

Cheng-yi Lin is a Research Fellow at the Institute of European and American Studies, Academia Sinica, Taiwan. He received his PhD in Foreign Affairs from the University of Virginia in 1987. He has conducted extensive studies on Sino–American relations and Taiwan's national security policy. His articles have been published in *American Foreign Policy Interests*, *Asian Affairs*, *Asian Survey*, *China Quarterly*, *Issues & Studies*, *Journal of Northeast Asian Studies* and *Korean Journal of Defense Analysis*. He co-edited *Rise of China: Beijing's Strategies and Implications for the Asia-Pacific* (2009) and *The Future of United States, China, and Taiwan Relations* (2011). He was Director of the Institute of European and American Studies at Academia Sinica (1998–2003), Director of the Institute of International Relations at National Chengchi University (2004–5), and Executive Director of the Center for Asia-Pacific Area Studies at Academia Sinica (2009–12).

Elina Noor is Director, Foreign Policy and Security Studies, Institute of Strategic and International Studies (ISIS) Malaysia. She was previously a key team member of the Brookings Institution's Project on U.S. Relations with the Islamic World in its formative years post-September 11, 2001 and researched on weapons of mass destruction terrorism prior at the Center for Nonproliferation Studies, Monterey Institute of International Studies in Washington, D.C. Her policy interests include U.S.–Malaysia relations, cyber warfare and security, radicalization and terrorism, and major power relations. Her commentaries have appeared in local and foreign media, including the *New Straits Times*, *BFM*, the *New York Times* and *Al-Jazeera*. Ms Noor read law at Oxford University and earned her Blue playing ice hockey there. She obtained an LLM in Public International Law from the London School of Economics and Political Science (LSE), graduating with distinction at the top of her class. A recipient of the

Perdana (Malaysian Prime Minister's) Fellowship, she also holds a Master's degree in Security Studies from Georgetown University where she was a Women in International Security Scholar. She has been honoured twice by *Marie Claire Malaysia* magazine as a Woman of Style and Substance, and by *The Malaysian Women's Weekly* as one of its 2011 Great Women of Our Time.

Denny Roy is a Senior Fellow at the East-West Center, Honolulu, Hawaii where he focuses on international security issues in the Asia-Pacific region. Prior to joining the East-West Center in 2007, Dr Roy worked at the Asia-Pacific Center for Security Studies in Honolulu, the Naval Postgraduate School in Monterey, the Strategic and Defence Studies Centre at the Australian National University in Canberra, the National University of Singapore, and Brigham Young University in Utah. He obtained his PhD in Political Science from the University of Chicago in 1991. His articles have appeared in *International Security*, *Survival*, *Asian Survey*, *Security Dialogue*, *Contemporary Southeast Asia*, *Armed Forces & Society* and *Issues & Studies*. His books include *The North Korea Crisis and Regional Responses* (co-editor, 2015); *Return of the Dragon: Rising China and Regional Security* (2013); *The Pacific War and Its Political Legacies* (2009); *Taiwan: A Political History* (2003); and *China's Foreign Relations* (1998).

Yoichiro Sato holds a B.A. (Law) from Keio University, a Master's degree (International Studies) from the University of South Carolina, and PhD (Political Science) from the University of Hawaii. He is currently a Professor at Ritsumeikan Asia Pacific University (APU) and is the Director of the Democracy Promotion Center. Before joining APU, he was an Associate Professor at the U.S. Department of Defense's Asia-Pacific Center for Security Studies, Honolulu, where he taught mid-rank military and diplomatic officers. He has also taught at Auckland University in New Zealand, Kansai Gaidai Hawaii College and the University of Hawaii. His main research areas include Japanese foreign policy, Asia-Pacific security and political economy, maritime security and fisheries issues. His major works include *The U.S.–Japan Security Alliance: Regional Multilateralism* (co-editor, 2011); *Norms, Interests, and Power in Japanese Foreign Policy* (co-editor, 2008); and *The Rise of China and International Security: America and Asia Respond* (co-editor, 2008). He has appeared in international media, including *Time Magazine*, Bloomberg Television, MSNBC, National Public Radio, *Defense News*, *New Zealand Herald*,

TVNZ (New Zealand), Radio Australia, *Agence France-Presse* (France), the *Strait Times* (Singapore), and Al Jazeera.

Clive Schofield is Professor and Director of Research at the Australian Centre for Ocean Resource and Security (ANCORS) at the University of Wollongong (UOW). He is also the Leader of the Sustaining Coastal and Marine Zones research theme within the UOW Global Challenges Program. He is an Australian Research Council (ARC) Future Fellowship and is a former ARC QEII Fellow. He holds a PhD (Geography) from the University of Durham in the United Kingdom and an LLM from the University of British Columbia, Canada. Professor Schofield's research interests relate to international boundaries and particularly maritime boundary delimitation and marine jurisdictional issues. He has published over 200 scholarly publications including twenty-two books and monographs (including edited works) on these issues as well as geo-technical aspects of the law of the sea and maritime security. He serves as an International Hydrographic Office (IHO)-nominated Observer on the Advisory Board on the Law of the Sea (ABLOS). He has also been involved in the peaceful settlement of boundary disputes, through the provision of advice and research support to governments engaged in boundary negotiations and in cases before the International Court of Justice and has been appointed as a Peacebuilding Adviser on behalf of the United Nations and the World Bank.

Yann-huei Song is currently a Research Fellow at the Institute of European and American Studies, Academia Sinica, Taiwan. He is also an Adjunct Professor at the School of Law, Soochow University in Taipei, Taiwan. Professor Song received his PhD in International Relations from Kent State University, Ohio and LLM and JSD from the School of Law (Boalt Hall), University of California, Berkeley. He has broad academic interests covering ocean law and policy studies, maritime security and sovereignty and maritime disputes in the East and South China Seas. Professor Song is a member of the editorial boards of *Ocean Development and International Law* and *Chinese (Taiwan) Yearbook of International Law and Affairs*. He is the co-editor of *Major Law and Policy Issues in the South China Sea: American and European Perspectives* (2014). His recent articles include "Legal Status of Taipei Island under the United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea", *Korean Journal of International and Comparative Law* (2015) and "The Impact of the Law of the Sea Convention on Conflict and

Conflict Management in the South China Sea”, *The International Journal of Ocean Development and International Law* (co-author, 2013).

Ian Storey is a Senior Fellow at the ISEAS – Yusof Ishak Institute, Singapore. He specializes in Asian security issues, with a focus on Southeast Asia. At the Institute, he is the editor of the peer review academic journal, *Contemporary Southeast Asia*. His research interests include Southeast Asia’s relations with China, the United States and Japan, maritime security in the Asia Pacific (especially the South China Sea dispute), China’s foreign and defence policies and the roles and interests of Asian countries in the Arctic. Prior to joining the Institute, he held academic positions at the U.S. Defense Department’s Asia-Pacific Center for Security Studies in Honolulu, Hawaii, and at Deakin University, Melbourne, Australia. He received his PhD from the City University of Hong Kong and his Master’s degree from the International University of Japan. He is the author of *Southeast Asia and the Rise of China: The Search for Security* (2011). Dr Storey has published articles in *Asia Policy*, *Asian Affairs*, *Asian Security*, *China Brief*, *Contemporary Southeast Asia*, *Harvard Asia Quarterly*, *Naval War College Review*, *Parameters*, *Political Science*, *Terrorism Monitor* and *Jane’s Intelligence Review*. His opinion pieces have appeared in the *Straits Times*, the *Wall Street Journal* and the *South China Morning Post*, and he is regularly interviewed by the international media.