THEY ASK IF WE EAT FROGS

The International Institute for Asian Studies (IIAS) is a postdoctoral research centre based in Leiden and Amsterdam, the Netherlands. Its main objective is to encourage the study of Asia and to promote national and international co-operation in this field. The geographical scope of the Institute covers South Asia, Southeast Asia, East Asia, and Central Asia. The institute focuses on the humanities and the social sciences and, where relevant, on their interaction with other sciences.

The Institute of Southeast Asian Studies (ISEAS) was established as an autonomous organization in 1968. It is a regional research centre dedicated to the study of sociopolitical, security and economic trends and developments in Southeast Asia and its wider geostrategic and economic environment.

The Institute's research programmes are the Regional Economic Studies (RES, including ASEAN and APEC), Regional Strategic and Political Studies (RSPS), and Regional Social and Cultural Studies (RSCS).

ISEAS Publishing, an established academic press, has issued more than 2,000 books and journals. It is the largest scholarly publisher of research about Southeast Asia from within the region. ISEAS Publishing works with many other academic and trade publishers and distributors to disseminate important research and analyses from and about Southeast Asia to the rest of the world.

THEY ASK IF WE EAT FROGS Garo Ethnicity in Bangladesh

ELLEN BAL





International Institute for Asian Studies
The Netherlands
Institute of Southeast Asian Studies
Singapore

First published in Singapore in 2007 by ISEAS Publishing Institute of Southeast Asian Studies 30 Heng Mui Keng Terrace Pasir Panjang Singapore 119614

E-mail: publish@iseas.edu.sg
Website: http://www.bookshop.iseas.edu.sg

First published in Europe in 2007 by International Institute for Asian Studies P.O. Box 9515 2300 RA Leiden The Netherlands

E-mail: iias@let.leidenuniv.nl Website: http://www.iias.nl/

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the Institute of Southeast Asian Studies.

© 2007 Institute of Southeast Asian Studies, Singapore.

The responsibility for facts and opinions in this publication rests exclusively with the author and her interpretations do not necessarily reflect the views or the policy of the publishers or its supporters.

ISEAS Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

Bal. Ellen.

They ask if we eat frogs: Garo ethnicity in Bangladesh.

- 1. Garo (Indic people)—Bangladesh—History.
- 2. Garo (Indic people)—Bangladesh—Ethnic identity.
- 3. Minorities—Bangladesh.
- I. Title
- II. Title: Garo ethnicity in Bangladesh DS393.83 G37B17 2007

ISBN 978-981-230-446-9 (hard cover) ISBN 978-981-230-591-6 (PDF)

PHOTO CREDIT: The photograph used on the front cover is reproduced with the kind permission of the author, Ellen Bal.

Typeset in Singapore by Superskill Graphics Pte Ltd Printed in Singapore by Oxford Graphic Printers Pte Ltd

CONTENTS

Acknowledgements		vii
Glossary		X
1	Introduction	1
2	The History of a Persistent Image	27
3	'The Importance of Being Garo': Garo Narratives of Self	50
4	Peoples without History?	67
5	'Dual were Dual, Kochu were Kochu': Garos Divided	88
6	Negotiable Boundaries, Negotiable Identities	111
7	Garos and Christianity	132
8	Garos and the State	158
9	Summary and Conclusion: From Tribes to Ethnic Minorities	209
References		217
Index		233
About the Author		243



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

They Ask if We Eat Frogs is a revised and updated version of my Ph.D. thesis which I defended in June 2000 at the Erasmus University in Rotterdam and which appeared under the title "They Ask if We Eat Frogs': Social Boundaries, Ethnic Categorization, and the Garo People of Bangladesh". Although I opted for a new subtitle to the book, I chose to keep the main title the same. To anyone familiar to South Asia, the question whether one eats frogs needs no further explanation. It symbolizes a whole world of prejudices and hierarchical relations between South Asia's 'majority populations' and socalled tribal minorities. 'Frog eaters' supposedly stand for the most primitive of South Asians, those who have not learnt 'civilized' behaviour. To ask if one eats frogs goes beyond 'objective' curiosity. No matter how naive the inquirer, notions of inequality and simplicity underlie the question, and result, at the least, in feelings of embarrassment and uneasiness of the person addressed. In other words, 'they ask if we eat frogs' is the briefest possible summary of unequal and uneasy relations that have for decades marked Garo images and self-perceptions, and their relations to many others, non-Garos.

For this project I carried out research between 1993 and 2000 and visited Bangladesh more or less on a yearly basis. Between March 1994 and March 1995, I spent a full year in the field. In that year I established most of my contacts with Garos and others, formed a number of valuable friendships, and experienced a heartwarming hospitality and willingness of Garos to welcome me into their lives and share their thoughts with me.

During the past thirteen years I met numerous people who contributed in all sorts of ways to this outcome. Without their help and support this book would not exist. Hereafter I shall mention a number of them without even the smallest suggestion that the list includes all. My gratitude first goes out to the Garos in Bangladesh who opened their houses and hearts to me; who willingly spoke up and shared their life stories with me; far too many to be mentioned by name. Without their generosity, curiosity, enthusiasm and hospitality this research would not have been possible. I would especially like to thank the villagers of Bibalgree who time and again welcomed me and the

viii Acknowledgements

occasional friends and relatives I brought along. I am particularly indebted to *mamu* Nehru, *mani* Chameli and their daughter Puti, who took me into their family and treated me as one of theirs.

I am very grateful to the brothers of Taizé in Mymensingh. The gate to their home was always open. They inspired me by their work and commitment to the people in Bangladesh. Here I would particularly like to thank Br Guillaume, always full of stories and always out of time to share them all, possessing the priceless talent to see the beauty in all and everything. Br Erik helped me in a number of ways, among others, as co-editor of the book of photographs *Manderangni Jagring: Images of the Garos of Bangladesh* and as a travel companion during one of my many enjoyable journeys through 'Garoland'. It was always good to discuss my research with him.

In Dhaka, Professor Anwarrulah Choudhury helped me to navigate the inevitable bureaucratic hurdles and to obtain a research visa. Professor Sirajul Islam, Dr Ratan Lal Chakraborty and Dr Kibriaul Khaleque, whose sudden passing away came decades too early, offered me invaluable advice on the research project.

My friends in Dhaka made my stay even more enjoyable. I was very fortunate to find a pleasant and stimulating environment in which to live with the volunteers of the Swedish Swallows, Karin and Maria, who also invited me to join their large circle of friends. Others who need to be mentioned here are the many members of the Chisim family of T.B. Gate, Bernard, Eva, Ineke, Juise and Zeba, Sanjeeb, Sister Elizabeth, Sumon, Tanvir and the workers of Nokmandi.

I also want to thank my two colleagues in the 'Garo field', Robbins Burling and Erik de Maaker, and my colleagues at the Faculty of History and Arts of the Erasmus University of Rotterdam, in particularly Andrea Tyndall, Arjan de Haan, Bart Hofstede, Gijsbert Oonk, Hanneke Hoekstra, Jeroen Blaak, Jolien Harmsen, Karin Willemse, Manon van der Heijden, P.W. Zuidhof, Rick Dolphijn, Stef Scagliola, Ulbe Bosma, and Wilfred Dolfsma. The faculty funded much of my research, at home and abroad. Additional funding was provided by the J.E. Jurriaanse Stichting, Netherlands Foundation for the Advancement of Tropical Research (WOTRO), and the Trustfonds.

Since August 2001, I have found myself a new circle of colleagues. The Department of Social and Cultural Anthropology of the VU University Amsterdam offers a friendly and stimulating environment to work in. I came to know my new colleagues too late to share many of my ideas about this particular project with them, although some of their influence has seeped into this revised edition, but I am looking forward to working with them and to be part of each other's projects in future.

Acknowledgements ix

I feel particularly indebted and thankful to my research companion Suborno Chisim, who jokingly referred to me as "boss", but who really was my research partner. Suborno turned out to be much more than a good interpreter, research assistant and key informant. He became a very good friend and as committed to the project as I was. I feel that this book is his as well as mine. Willem van Schendel was much more than a distant supervisor to this project. He also inspired my work through his own and the force of his ideas. His ongoing support and belief in the relevance of the project and its outcome were fundamental to a positive outcome.

I want to thank Wim Stokhof, Paul van der Velden and Marloes Rozing of the International Institute for Asian Studies (IIAS) in Leiden, for encouraging and enabling me to have my work published. At the ISEAS, Triena Ong and particularly Fatanah Sarmani were responsible for bringing it to a good end.

I experienced that my life as a researcher is inextricably bound up with my life as a whole. To feel well is to work well. I am particularly thankful to my friends Annemarie Uhlenbeck, Esther van Beelen, Fennie Posthumus, and Sandra Bos, who supported me with their friendship and enthusiasm, and to Kathinka Sinha-Kerkhoff, who encouraged me both with her friendship and with her intellectual support. I hope we will continue working together for many years to come. Finally, thanks to my sisters Marlon and Pien and my parents Nellie and Simon Bal, who spent some unforgettable weeks in Bangladesh. Erik and Jip, let us keep travelling, together.



GLOSSARY

The following is a glossary of Bengali, Garo, and English terms as they are used in the text. Most of the terms are Bengali. The Garo terms are indicated with a (G)

Abeng Division of Garos and language spoken by Garos in

the lowlands of Bangladesh (G)

Achik Lit. hill, or hill man; also name of a division of Garos;

language spoken by Garos in the hills (G)

Achu Grandfather, also used for elderly men, or forefathers

(G)

Adivasi Lit. original inhabitant; commonly used as a synonym

for the communities known as tribes

Ajong Mother's elder sister (in Abeng language) (G)

Ambi Grandmother, also used for elderly women or

foremothers (G)

Asong Country (G)

Atong Division of Garos living in Bangladesh; also name of

their language (G)

Bangal Derogatory naming of Bengali (used by Garos)

Bazaar Marketplace
Borkondazes Armed retainers

Bormon Caste title of many Hindu minorities in East Bengal

Chatchi Kin group; also relative or guest (G)

Choudrie Landlord; revenue officer

Chu Rice beer (G)
Dakari.ka Culture (G)
Desh Country

Dol Group (in Bengali language). Here it is also used to

refer to particular Garo groups or divisions

Fakir Muslim mendicant or missionary

Fouzdar Mughal tax collector

xii Glossary

Gari Car, cart

Ghor jamai Son-in-law of the house. Husband moves in with his

in-laws

Gotro Clan or tribe Hartal General strike

Hat Market Hookah Water pipe

Jat Most commonly translated as caste; other meanings

are endogamous community, religious, social or ethnic

group

Jati See: jat

Jhum System of cultivation by which jungle on the hills is

cut down, generally in the cold season (December–February). The remains of the trees are left until March

when they are burned

Jumma Collective name of the inhabitants of the Chittagong

Hill Tracts

Kaka Paternal uncle

Kushuk Language or dialect (G)

Lungi Male circular, ankle-length, skirt-like garment worn

by men; it is also worn by Garo women who fasten it

differently from men

Ma'chong Matrilineal kin group (G)

Madong Lit. married to mother; refers to forbidden marriages

within exogamous kinship group (G)

Mahajan Moneylender Mahari See: ma'chong Mama Maternal uncle

Mandi Lit. man, human being; Garos of Bangladesh call

themselves Mandi (G)

Mani Maternal aunt

Marak Garos are primarily divided into three exogamous

groups: Sangma, Marak, and Momin (G)

Midi amua Sangsarek ritual in which supernatural beings are

worshipped (including Gods and lesser spirits) (G)

Mimang kam Ritual ceremony (G)

Mimang Spirit (G)

Moghul Islamic Empire in India from the sixteenth to the

nineteenth century

Momin See: Marak (G)

Glossary xiii

Mujibite Follower of Sheikh Mujibur Rahman

Naib Lit. a deputy, landlord's agent and rent collector

NGO Non-governmental organization

Nokma Chief of a clan (G) Nokna Garo heiress (G) Pagol Mad, lunatic

Pahari Hill people; also indication of one particular minority

Pan Betel-nut Pandit Hindu priest

Para Village neighbourhood, hamlet

Pargana (or pergunnah) Revenue division; an estate

Partition Creation in 1947 of two independent states – India,

with a Hindu majority, and Pakistan, with a Muslim majority – out of the territory formerly ruled by the

British

Pi'sa Child (G)

Puja Worship, adoration

Purdah Lit. seclusion of women, custom of segregating the

sexes

Raja King; sometimes an estate-holder, or a landlord, or a

chief

Razakaar Collaborator with the Pakistan army

Ruri Garo way to refer to Bengalis, irrespective of their

religion

Ryot (raiyat) Tenant Sangma See: Marak

Sangsarek Religion of the Garos; believer in the Sangsarek religion

Sannyasi Hindu mendicant or missionary

Sanskriti/kriti Culture Sarkar Government

Independence

Shongho Organization, association

Shomaj Community

Sthaniyo Bengali for local (also tanio, taina)

Swaraj Self-rule

Swarajist Supporter of self-rule Taka Bangladesh currency

Tanka System of cropsharing whereby a tenant had to pay a

fixed quantity of crop to the landlord

xiv Glossary

Tebhaga Lit. three shares; movement by sharecroppers for two-

thirds of crops from landholders

Thana Administrative unit in rural Bengal; a police station

Upojati Lower order of the nation; sub-nation

Wana krita ceremony in which sacrifice to spirits is made (G)

Wangala Garo harvest festival (G)

Zamindar In Bengal, holder of a large estate, usually one farmed

by sharecroppers or sub-tenants; created by the British administration as part of a feudal system of revenue

collection

Zenana Seclusion of women; separate quarters for women which

men cannot enter (except for close relatives)