

# ISLAMISM AND DEMOCRACY IN INDONESIA

The **Institute of Southeast Asian Studies (ISEAS)** was established as an autonomous organization in 1968. It is a regional centre dedicated to the study of socio-political, security and economic trends and developments in Southeast Asia and its wider geostrategic and economic environment. The Institute's research programmes are the Regional Economic Studies (RES, including ASEAN and APEC), Regional Strategic and Political Studies (RSPS), and Regional Social and Cultural Studies (RSCS).

**ISEAS Publishing**, an established academic press, has issued more than 2,000 books and journals. It is the largest scholarly publisher of research about Southeast Asia from within the region. ISEAS Publishing works with many other academic and trade publishers and distributors to disseminate important research and analyses from and about Southeast Asia to the rest of the world.

ISEAS Series on Islam

# ISLAMISM AND DEMOCRACY IN INDONESIA

**PIETY AND PRAGMATISM**

MASDAR HILMY



**INSTITUTE OF SOUTHEAST ASIAN STUDIES**

*Singapore*

First published in Singapore in 2010 by  
Institute of Southeast Asian Studies  
30 Heng Mui Keng Terrace  
Pasir Panjang  
Singapore 119614  
*E-mail:* [publish@iseas.edu.sg](mailto:publish@iseas.edu.sg)  
*Website:* <http://bookshop.iseas.edu.sg>

© 2010 Institute of Southeast Asian Studies, Singapore

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the Institute of Southeast Asian Studies.

*The responsibility for facts and opinions in this publication rests exclusively with the author and his interpretations do not necessarily reflect the views or the policy of the publisher or its supporters.*

---

#### ISEAS Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

---

Hilmy, Masdar, 1971-

Islamism and democracy in Indonesia : piety and pragmatism.

1. Islam and politics—Indonesia.
2. Democracy—Religious aspects—Islam—Indonesia.
3. Islam and state—Indonesia.
- I. Title.

BP63 15H65

2010

ISBN 978-981-230-971-6 (soft cover)

ISBN 978-981-230-973-0 (E-book PDF)

---

Typeset by International Typesetters Pte Ltd  
Printed in Singapore by Utopia Press Pte Ltd

# Contents

---

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	ix
<b>1. Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>2. ISLAM AND DEMOCRACY: Re-examining the Intricate Relationship</b>	<b>18</b>
Cultural Essentialist/Exceptionalist Approaches	19
The Critics: Structural-Instrumentalist Approaches	24
On the Multivocality of Islam: Muslims' Debates on Democracy	30
Arguments of Democracy Proponents	33
Accommodationist Approaches to Democracy	40
The Islamists' Culturalist Approaches to Democracy	46
Conclusion	49
<b>3. ISLAM AND DISCOURSES ON DEMOCRACY IN INDONESIA: Definition, Historical Account, and Muslims' Approaches to Democracy</b>	<b>61</b>
Conceptualizing Democracy in the Indonesian Context	61
Islam and Democracy: A Fluctuating Relationship	66
Indonesia's Democracy in Historical Perspective	69
The Dutch Colonial Period	69
The Japanese Occupation	71
Sukarno's "Demokrasi Terpimpin"	74
Soeharto's New Order	76
Post-Soeharto Era	78
Indonesian Muslims' Approaches to Democracy: A Preliminary Discussion	79
Conclusion	88

<b>4.</b>	<b>ISLAMISM IN POST-NEW ORDER INDONESIA:</b>	<b>99</b>
	<b>Explaining the Contexts</b>	
	Defining Islamism in the Indonesian Context	99
	The Socio-political Background of Islamism	103
	Majlis Mujahidin Indonesia (MMI)	109
	Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia (HTI)	117
	Partai Keadilan Sejahtera (PKS)	123
	Conclusion	126
<b>5.</b>	<b>THEOLOGY OF RESISTANCE: On the Utopian Islamist</b>	<b>135</b>
	<b>Rejection of Democracy</b>	
	The Islamists' Conception of Democracy	135
	Islamist Exceptionalism	141
	The Social Construction of Anti-Democracy Discourse	144
	The Role of the Media	151
	Resisting Democracy with the Arguments of Democracy	153
	Islamists and the Ballot Box	158
	Anathema to the Islamists: Secularism, Liberalism, and Pluralism	165
	Conclusion	168
<b>6.</b>	<b>TOWARDS A HOME-GROWN DEMOCRACY? On the</b>	<b>179</b>
	<b>Meliorist Islamist Acceptance of Democracy</b>	
	Crafting Islamic Democracy: The New Era of Political Islam	179
	From Political Islam to Islamic Politics: Towards a New Paradigm	187
	The Islamic State Reconsidered	191
	The Legacy of Masyumi	197
	Between Madinah Charter and Jakarta Charter	199
	Conclusion	203
<b>7.</b>	<b>INTERSECTION AND RUPTURE: Piety, Pragmatism,</b>	<b>213</b>
	<b>and Power Contests among the Islamists</b>	
	The Emergence of Public Islam	213
	The Notion of Power: Between Pietism and Pragmatism	217
	Power Manifestation: The Transnational <i>Khilafah Islamiyah</i>	226
	Approaches to Power Structures	229
	Expanding Power Structures: Shari'ah-based Proposed By-laws	238
	Ideological Rupture	240
	Conclusion	243

---

<b>8. CONCLUSION: Findings and Theoretical Reflection</b>	<b>253</b>
Intersection: Commonalities and Differences	256
Whither Islamism?	259
<i>Appendix 1: Full Text of the Madinah Charter (622 C.E.)</i>	265
<i>Appendix 2: Yogyakarta Charter</i>	270
<i>Bibliography</i>	271
<i>Index</i>	301
<i>About the Author</i>	320





# Acknowledgements

---

This book was developed from my doctoral thesis (University of Melbourne 2007), examined by Professor Martin van Bruinessen (Utrecht) and Dr Michael Feener (National University of Singapore). Credit is due to an anonymous reviewer of this draft and to the Institute of Southeast Asian Studies (ISEAS) for publishing this manuscript and making it available to a wider audience.

I would like to take this opportunity to extend my deepest gratitude to all those who assisted me during my doctoral studies at the University of Melbourne's Asia Institute (formerly known as the Melbourne Institute of Asian Languages and Societies, or MIALS). Chief among these are my supervisors, Professors Merle C. Ricklefs and Arief Budiman, whose critical comments and passionate guidance enabled me to complete my research project within a period of three years. Professor Arief Budiman, with his fatherly touch, patience and expertise, enlightened me in matters of sociology and political science. Professor Ricklefs continued to supervise me, even though he resigned from the university in January 2005, and helped me deal with the hardships and complexities of my studies through a series of e-mails and face-to-face communications. Words are simply insufficient to express my deepest gratitude to both of them. After Professor Ricklefs' resignation, Professor Michael Leigh took over as my supervisor. He also deserves my deep appreciation, particularly in dealing with the structure of the thesis.

The earlier stage of this work benefitted from a number of professors and experts from various universities. Professor Abdullah Saeed, Director of the Asia Institute at the University of Melbourne, gave invaluable comments on the overall draft of the thesis. Professor Tim Lindsey from the Law School, University of Melbourne, not only helped me sharpen the argument of the thesis but also made it stronger in character. I would like to extend my sincere thanks to both of them. Furthermore, the following people contributed in one way or another towards the betterment of the thesis: Professors M.B. Hooker, Virginia Hooker, Kathryn Robinson, and

Greg Fealy from the Australian National University (ANU) helped me in criticizing the earlier draft of my proposed research at the 2004 Mt. Beauty Workshop; Clive Kessler, Professor of Sociology from the University of New South Wales (UNSW), Sydney, Anthony Bubalo, Research Fellow at the Lowy Institute for International Policy in Sydney, and Kevin Dunn, Professor of Cultural Geography at UNSW, gave comments on the paper I delivered at the second annual Islamic Studies Postgraduate Conference at the University of Melbourne on 20–22 November 2006; Olle Törnquist, a political scientist from Oslo University, read and gave invaluable comments on Chapters 5 and 6 of the thesis; Elizabeth Fuller Collins of Ohio University for her contribution in the writing of Chapter 6; Ariel Heryanto, the Convenor of Indonesian Studies at the Asia Institute, University of Melbourne, for his critical comments on Chapters 1 and 3; Professors Azyumardi Azra and Komaruddin Hidayat, the respective former and current Rectors of the State Islamic University (UIN), Jakarta, for their criticisms on my proposed research during their visits to Melbourne; Nadirsyah Hosen, the former Postdoctoral Research Fellow at the University of Queensland (UQ), for his help in proofreading and commenting on Chapter 5; Thoha Hamim, Deputy Rector I of the State Institute for Islamic Studies (IAIN) Sunan Ampel, Surabaya, for his insights and comments on my thesis; and Noorhaidi Hasan, a Postdoctoral Research Fellow at the National University of Singapore (NUS), for his suggestions through e-mail communication during the preparation of the thesis. I benefited greatly from intellectual exchanges with all of these scholars during conferences, seminars, e-mail communications, and informal conversations, and I extend my deepest gratitude to all of them.

My doctoral studies would not have been possible without the support given by my home institution, IAIN Surabaya. In this case, let me extend my deepest gratitude to Professor Dr H.M. Ridlwan Natsir, M.A., Rector of IAIN, for allowing me to absent myself from all my duties as a lecturer of this institute during my studies and for giving me the recommendation to pursue my Ph.D. degree at the University of Melbourne.

My stay in Australia would not have been possible without the financial support provided by various institutions. Special thanks go firstly to AusAID for granting me a scholarship to pursue my Ph.D. degree at the University of Melbourne. I am particularly grateful to Lucia Wong and Kathy Menezes, the AusAID liaison officers of the University of Melbourne. My research fieldwork in Indonesia was only possible due to financial support I received from AusAID, the Postgraduate Overseas Research Experience Scholarship (PORES), and the Asia Institute Fieldwork/Travel Grants. To all of these institutions I express my sincerest gratitude.

During my fieldwork, I received assistance from a number of people such as Soedharmono, Professor of History at the Sebelas Maret University Surakarta (UNS), Moh. Syafi'i Anwar, Director of the International Center for Islam and Pluralism (ICIP) in Jakarta, Rizal Mallarangeng from the Freedom Institute in Jakarta, Mutoharun Jinan, a lecturer from Muhammadiyah University Surakarta (UMS), Janif Zulfiqar, an undergraduate student at the State Islamic University (UIN) Sunan Kalijaga, Yogyakarta, who was undertaking research for his thesis on MMI and took me to MMI's headquarters in that city, and Fatimah Husein and Muhammad Wildan, who are lecturers at the UIN Yogyakarta. I am indebted to all of them for their contributions to my fieldwork.

Acknowledgements also go to my colleagues, the Ph.D. students at the University of Melbourne such as Su'aidi Asy'ari, Arskal Salim, Luthfi Assyaukanie, Ludiro Madu, Arnusianto, Khalid Al-Azri, Dirk Tomsa, Amelia Fauzia, Andi Ali Amiruddin, Dina Afrianty, Raihani, Denny Indrayana, and Nina Nurmila, who gave me the sense of being at home at work. Many thanks for their warm friendship and for sharing ideas as well as experiences with me during my stay in Melbourne. Special credit is due to Dirk Tomsa for proofreading the entire draft of my thesis.

The general staff at the Asia Institute, including Linda Poskitt, Nadine Blair, Jemimah Fraser, Mary Kidd, Cheryl Carter, Michelle King, and Liza Tsang, helped me immensely in dealing with administrative matters. I thank them very much for their contributions during my stay at the Asia Institute.

I feel a deep sense of gratitude to my father, K.H. Usman Rifa'i, and my mother, Hj. Sunipah, who have given all they have, including emotional and spiritual support, for my success and health in accomplishing this Ph.D. I am also grateful to my parents-in-law, my brothers and sister, and all members of my family for their support in the completion of my studies.

Last but not least, my very special thanks go to my beloved wife, Nanik Anjarwati, and my lovely cute daughter, Fifi (Aliviani Emilia Hilna, seven years old), whose enduring love and persistent support and encouragement have been inspiring along the way. Especially to my sweetheart Fifi, I apologize for having "neglected" you during the critical moments of finishing the thesis. I hope that someday you will understand why I could not spend more time with you having fun, as I should have. I do not know in what way I have to pay back for what you have sacrificed and given to me during the time you accompanied me in Melbourne, except my love from the bottom of my heart. This humble piece of work is dedicated to both of you.

*Masdar Hilmy*  
*Surabaya*  
*2 March 2009*