

Reproduced from *Problems of Democratisation in Indonesia: Elections, Institutions and Society* edited by Edward Aspinall and Marcus Mietzner (Singapore: Institute of Southeast Asian Studies, 2010). This version was obtained electronically direct from the publisher on condition that copyright is not infringed. No part of this publication may be reproduced without the prior permission of the Institute of Southeast Asian Studies. Individual articles are available at < <http://bookshop.iseas.edu.sg> >

Problems of Democratisation in Indonesia

The Research School of Pacific and Asian Studies (RSPAS), a part of the **ANU College of Asia and the Pacific** at **The Australian National University**, is home to **The Indonesia Project**, a major international centre, which supports research activities on the Indonesian economy and society. Established in 1965 in the School's Division of Economics, the Project is well known and respected in Indonesia and in other places where Indonesia attracts serious scholarly and official interest. Funded by the ANU and the Australian Agency for International Development (AusAID), the Indonesia Project monitors and analyses recent economic developments in Indonesia; informs Australian governments, business and the wider community about those developments and about future prospects; stimulates research on the Indonesian economy; and publishes the respected *Bulletin of Indonesian Economic Studies*.

The School's **Department of Political and Social Change (PSC)** focuses on domestic politics, social processes and state-society relationships in Asia and the Pacific, and has a long-established interest in Indonesia.

Together with PSC and RSPAS, the Project holds the annual Indonesia Update conference, which offers an overview of recent economic and political developments and devotes attention to a significant theme in Indonesia's development. The Project's *Bulletin of Indonesian Economic Studies* publishes the economic and political overviews, while the proceedings related to the theme of the conference are published in the Indonesia Update Series.

The **Institute of Southeast Asian Studies (ISEAS)** was established as an autonomous organization in 1968. It is a regional centre dedicated to the study of socio-political, security and economic trends and developments in Southeast Asia and its wider geostrategic and economic environment. The Institute's research programmes are the Regional Economic Studies (RES, including ASEAN and APEC), Regional Strategic and Political Studies (RSPS), and Regional Social and Cultural Studies (RSCS).

ISEAS Publishing, an established academic press, has issued more than 2,000 books and journals. It is the largest scholarly publisher of research about Southeast Asia from within the region. ISEAS Publishing works with many other academic and trade publishers and distributors to disseminate important research and analyses from and about Southeast Asia to the rest of the world.

Indonesia Update Series

Problems of Democratisation in Indonesia

Elections, Institutions and Society

EDITED BY
EDWARD ASPINALL AND MARCUS MIETZNER



INSTITUTE OF SOUTHEAST ASIAN STUDIES
Singapore

CONTENTS

<i>Tables</i>	vii
<i>Maps and figures</i>	ix
<i>Contributors</i>	xi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xiii
<i>Glossary</i>	xv
1 Problems of Democratisation in Indonesia: An Overview <i>Marcus Mietzner and Edward Aspinall</i>	1
2 Indonesia's Place in Global Democracy <i>Larry Diamond</i>	21
PART I Managing Democracy	
3 Indonesia's 2009 Elections: Defective System, Resilient Democracy <i>Rizal Sukma</i>	53
4 Voters and the New Indonesian Democracy <i>Saiful Mujani and R. William Liddle</i>	75
5 Indonesia's 2009 Elections: Performance Challenges and Negative Precedents <i>Adam Schmidt</i>	100
6 The Professionalisation of Politics: The Growing Role of Polling Organisations and Political Consultants <i>Muhammad Qodari</i>	122
7 The Indonesian Party System after the 2009 Elections: Towards Stability? <i>Dirk Tomsa</i>	141

- 8 The Parliament in Indonesia's Decade of Democracy:
People's Forum or Chamber of Cronies? 160
Stephen Sherlock

PART II Society and Democratic Contestation

- 9 Entertainment, Domestication and Dispersal:
Street Politics as Popular Culture 181
Ariel Heryanto
- 10 The Rise and Fall of Political Gangsters in Indonesian
Democracy 199
Ian Wilson
- 11 Increasing the Proportion of Women in the National
Parliament: Opportunities, Barriers and Challenges 219
Sharon Bessell
- 12 Pushing the Boundaries: Women in Direct Local
Elections and Local Government 243
Hana A. Satriyo

PART III Local Democracy

- 13 Decentralisation and Local Democracy in Indonesia:
The Marginalisation of the Public Sphere 267
Michael Buehler
- 14 Services Rendered: Peace, Patronage and Post-conflict
Elections in Aceh 286
Blair Palmer
- 15 Electoral Politics and Democratic Freedoms in Papua 307
Richard Chauvel
- 16 The Normalisation of Local Politics? Watching the
Presidential Elections in Morotai, North Maluku 330
Sidney Jones
- Index* 349

TABLES

2.1	The growth of electoral democracy, 1973–2006	22
2.2	Cases of loss of democracy, 1999–2009	26
2.3	Trends in Indonesia’s scores on political rights and civil liberties, 1997–2009	31
2.4	Comparative measures of democracy and governance in emerging democracies, 1998 and 2008	32
2.5	Perceived extent of and desire for democracy among emerging democracies, 2006	38
3.1	Results of the 2009 legislative elections	56
4.1	Exposure to voter mobilisation through direct contact and the mass media, April 2009	82
4.2	Campaign exposure and party advertisements most often seen, read or listened to, April 2009	83
4.3	Government performance in selected socio-economic areas	89
4.4	Multinomial logistic regression analysis of voting for parties, with Partai Demokrat as the reference category	92
4.5	Multivariate analysis of presidential/vice-presidential election	94
5.1	Main changes to the electoral system introduced by Law No. 10/2008 on General Elections	108
5.2	Internationally accepted criteria for electoral performance and Indonesia’s electoral performance in 2009	109
5.3	Votes for the three highest-ranking parties versus invalid votes, April 2009	115
6.1	Four possible conditions for a candidate’s name recognition and likeability	133
6.2	Three possible positions for an incumbent seeking re-election	135
7.1	Legislative election results, 2009	144

7.2	Election results of the six core parties, 1999–2009	146
7.3	Fragmentation of the Indonesian party system: biggest parties' share of the vote, 1999–2009	154
7.4	Party fragmentation at the provincial level: number of parties in provincial parliaments, 2009	155
12.1	Numbers of female and male candidates in direct local elections, 2005–2008	245
12.2	Numbers of women and men elected in direct local elections, 2005–2008	246
12.3	Number of direct local elections, and number and percentage of women elected, 2005–2008	247
12.4	Political parties and coalitions nominating women candidates in direct local elections, 2005–2007	248
13.1	Background of all candidates in gubernatorial elections, 2005–2008	275
13.2	Initiators of local government regulations in four districts and municipalities, 2001–2006	279
14.1	Distribution of seats in the Aceh provincial parliament, 2009	291
14.2	Seats won by Partai Aceh in Aceh's 23 district parliaments, 2009	292
14.3	Votes for parties (versus votes for individual candidates) in the district legislative elections	294

MAPS AND FIGURES

MAPS

1.1	Indonesia	xx
14.1	Aceh	287
15.1	Papua	308
16.1	North Maluku	331

FIGURES

2.1	Average GDP growth in Indonesia and other emerging democracies, 1999–2008	29
2.2	Scores on Human Development Index of Indonesia and other emerging democracies, 1995 and 2006	30
2.3	Control of corruption in Indonesia and other emerging democracies, 1998 and 2008	36
2.4	Support for and satisfaction with democracy in Indonesia and other East Asian emerging democracies, 2006	39
2.5	Rejection of authoritarianism in Indonesia and other East Asian emerging democracies, 2006	40
2.6	Support for liberal values in Indonesia and other East Asian emerging democracies, 2006	41
2.7	Categories of democrats in Indonesia and other East Asian emerging democracies, 2006	42
2.8	Trust in state institutions in Indonesia and other East Asian emerging democracies, 2006	44
4.1	Mean score for likeability of party leader	80
4.2	Mean score for feeling close to a particular party	81
4.3	Campaign exposure and candidate advertisements most often seen, read or listened to, July 2009	84

4.4	Association between campaign and party advertisements viewed most often on TV and voting for that party, April 2009	84
4.5	Association between candidate advertisements viewed most often on TV and voting for those candidates, July 2009	85
4.6	Voters' evaluation of the national economic condition in 2009 compared to the previous year	86
4.7	Association between voters' evaluation of the national economic condition and voting for incumbent (PD) and opposition (PDIP/ Gerindra) parties	87
4.8	Association between voters' evaluation of the national economic condition and voting for the president/ vice-president	88
5.1	Adequacy of information on 2009 elections, September 2008 and March 2009	113
5.2	Knowledge of election process and voting procedures, March 2009	114
11.1	Proportions of women and men in key institutions, 2005	224
11.2	Proportions of men and women elected to parliament, 1955-2009	226
11.3	Proportions of male and female candidates nominated nationally by the major parties, 2004	230
11.4	Proportions of male and female candidates given the top two positions by the major parties, 2004	231
11.5	Seats won by women as a proportion of a party's total seats, 2009	236
11.6	Placement of women and men on candidate lists, 2009	237
16.1	Results of the 2009 presidential election: North Maluku, North Halmahera, Morotai and South Morotai	335

CONTRIBUTORS

Edward Aspinall

Senior Fellow, Department of Political and Social Change, School of International, Political and Strategic Studies, College of Asia and the Pacific, The Australian National University, Canberra

Sharon Bessell

Senior Lecturer, Crawford School of Economics and Government, College of Asia and the Pacific, The Australian National University, Canberra

Michael Buehler

Assistant Professor, Department of Political Science, Northern Illinois University

Richard Chauvel

Senior Lecturer, School of Social Sciences and Psychology, Victoria University, Melbourne

Larry Diamond

Senior Fellow, Hoover Institution, and Freeman Spogli Institute for International Studies, Stanford University; Director, Center on Democracy, Development, and the Rule of Law, Stanford University

Ariel Heryanto

Associate Professor of Indonesian Studies, School of Culture, History and Language, College of Asia and the Pacific, The Australian National University, Canberra

Sidney Jones

Senior Advisor, International Crisis Group, Southeast Asia Office, Jakarta

R. William Liddle

Professor of Political Science, Ohio State University, Columbus

Marcus Mietzner

Lecturer, School of Culture, History and Language, College of Asia and the Pacific, The Australian National University, Canberra

Saiful Mujani

Executive Director, Lembaga Survei Indonesia (Indonesian Survey Institute), Jakarta

Blair Palmer

Anthropologist, PhD dissertation submitted to The Australian National University, Canberra, in December 2009

Muhammad Qodari

Executive Director, Indo Barometer (IB), Jakarta

Hana A. Satriyo

Director, Gender and Women's Participation, The Asia Foundation, Jakarta

Stephen Sherlock

Consultant on Governance and Politics in Indonesia, Canberra and Jakarta

Adam Schmidt

Country Director, International Foundation for Electoral Systems (IFES), Jakarta

Rizal Sukma

Executive Director, Center for Strategic and International Studies (CSIS), Jakarta

Dirk Tomsa

Lecturer, School of Social Sciences, Politics and International Relations Program, La Trobe University, Melbourne

Ian Wilson

Lecturer, School of Social Sciences and Humanities, Murdoch University, Murdoch

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This book originated in a conference on the theme 'Democracy in practice' held at the Australian National University (ANU) in October 2009. Timed to reflect on the progress and problems of Indonesian democracy in a year of national elections, the conference was also the 27th annual Indonesia Update conference organised by the university's Indonesia Project. Attended by over 300 people, the conference was an occasion for focused analysis and lively debate on the state of Indonesian democracy. It was also a testament to the tremendous intellectual energy centred on Indonesia at the ANU, an environment in which both of us feel immensely privileged to work.

Our thanks go to the many ANU staff members and volunteers without whose assistance we would not have been able to hold such a successful conference. We are especially grateful to the administrative staff of the Indonesia Project, Cathy Haberle, Liz Drysdale and Trish van der Hoek, whose experience and sheer hard work were crucial to making such a complex event run so smoothly, and for the assistance of Allison Ley and Thuy Thu Pham of the Department of Political and Social Change. We are also thankful to the academic leaders of the Indonesia Project, in particular Chris Manning, Ross McLeod and Budy Resosudarmo, for giving us the opportunity to convene the conference and for supporting our plans for it. The principal sponsor of the Indonesia Project, and of the Indonesia Updates, is the Australian government's overseas development agency, AusAID. The agency has our sincere gratitude for making the conference possible and for assisting in the production of this book. AusAID's support for the Indonesia Project and Indonesia Updates over the years has added greatly to the depth and breadth of Indonesia expertise in Australia. In addition, we thank the ANU's Department of Political and Social Change for providing supplementary funding and the Asia Foundation for assisting several speakers and conference participants to come from Jakarta.

Of course, we are particularly grateful to the contributors to this volume. In planning the conference and this book, we aimed to bring together a group of leading analysts of distinct but complementary aspects of Indonesian politics and society, and of Indonesia in its broader global context. We hoped their combined contributions would provide both a level of detail and a comprehensiveness of scope that is sometimes lacking in discussions of Indonesian democracy. It is not for us to judge the success of our venture, but we were certainly impressed by, and appreciative of, the seriousness with which each of our authors went about grappling with the complexities of contemporary Indonesian democracy, and by the great knowledge and expertise they brought to bear on their topics. Twelve of the fifteen authors contributed papers to the conference and revised them for this book; we are grateful to them for devoting such a long period of creative intellectual work to this project. We also thank the three authors who did not present conference papers but agreed to contribute to the volume, putting aside other tasks in order to do so. All contributors deserve our special thanks for responding to a very tight editorial and production schedule.

Finally, we are grateful to those individuals who assisted in the production of the book. We depended upon Beth Thomson for her meticulous and professional copy-editing and typesetting. It was a pleasure to work with someone who has such exacting standards, such specialist knowledge and so much helpful advice. Staff at Cartographic & GIS Services at the ANU, in particular Jennifer Sheehan, prepared the maps, and impressed us with the care they took in researching recent boundary changes. Michael Cookson provided invaluable advice and assistance in helping us to establish those boundaries in Papua. Angela Grant produced the index. We are also grateful to Triena Ong and Rahilah Yusuf at the Institute of Southeast Asian Studies for their support in publishing this book, and for continuing to support the Indonesia Update series.

Edward Aspinall and Marcus Mietzner
Canberra
February 2010

GLOSSARY

<i>abangan</i>	term for nominal or less observant Muslims
<i>adat</i>	custom or tradition; customary or traditional law
<i>aliran</i>	'stream'; a term developed in 1950s anthropological research to distinguish between the various currents of Islam and their affiliated parties and organisations
Apindo	Asosiasi Pengusaha Indonesia (Association of Indonesian Entrepreneurs)
ASEAN	Association of Southeast Asian Nations
<i>bamus</i>	<i>badan musyawarah</i> (steering committee)
Bappenas	Badan Perencanaan Pembangunan Nasional (National Development Planning Agency)
Bawaslu	Badan Pengawasan Pemilu (election supervisory body)
BKN	Badan Kepegawaian Negara (National Civil Service Agency)
BMI	Banteng Muda Indonesia (Indonesian Young Bulls)
BPK	Badan Pemeriksaan Keuangan (State Audit Agency)
BPS	Badan Pusat Statistik (Statistics Indonesia), the central statistics agency
Brigass	Brigade Siaga Satu (Alert One Brigade)
<i>bupati</i>	district head
CETRO	Centre for Electoral Reform
DPD	Dewan Perwakilan Daerah (Regional Representative Council)
DPR	Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat (People's Representative Council), the Indonesian parliament
DPRD	Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat Daerah (Regional People's Representative Council), regional legislature

DPRP	Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat Papua (Papuan People's Representative Council)
FBR	Forum Betawi Rempug (Betawi Brotherhood Forum)
Forkabi	Forum Komunikasi Anak Betawi (Children of Betawi Communication Forum)
Forkot	Forum Komunikasi Tabanan (Tabanan Communication Forum)
FPI	Front Pembela Islam (Defenders of Islam Front)
<i>fraksi</i>	political grouping within parliament, similar to a caucus
<i>gali</i>	<i>gabungan anak liar</i> (gangs of wild children)
GAM	Gerakan Aceh Merdeka (Free Aceh Movement)
Gerindra	Partai Gerakan Indonesia Raya (Greater Indonesia Movement Party)
Golkar	orig. Golongan Karya (the state political party under the New Order, and one of the major post-New Order parties)
<i>gubernur</i>	governor
Hanura	Partai Hati Nurani Rakyat (Peoples' Conscience Party)
<i>haram</i>	'forbidden' or prohibited under Islamic law
IFES	International Foundation for Electoral Systems
<i>jago, jawara, jeger</i>	local strongman
<i>jasa</i>	services
JPPR	Jaringan Pendidikan Pemilih untuk Rakyat (People's Voter Education Network)
<i>kapupaten</i>	district
KNPB	Komite Nasional Papua Barat (West Papua National Committee)
Kodam	Komando Daerah Militer (Military Area Command)
<i>komisi</i>	standing committee
Komnas Perempuan	Komisi Nasional Anti Kekerasan Terhadap Perempuan (National Commission on Violence Against Women)
Kopassus	Komando Pasukan Khusus (Special Forces)
<i>kota</i>	municipality
KPA	Komite Peralihan Aceh (Aceh Transitional Committee)
KPI	Koalisi Perempuan Indonesia (Indonesian Women's Coalition)
KPK	Komisi Pemberantasan Korupsi (Corruption Eradication Commission)

KPPI	Kaukus Perempuan Politik Indonesia (Indonesian Women's Political Caucus)
KPPOD	Komite Pemantauan Pelaksanaan Otonomi Daerah (Regional Autonomy Watch)
KPU	Komisi Pemilihan Umum (General Elections Commission)
KPUD	Komisi Pemilihan Umum Daerah (Regional General Elections Commission)
Lingkaran Survei Indonesia	Indonesian Survey Circle
LP3ES	Lembaga Penelitian, Pendidikan dan Penerangan Ekonomi dan Sosial (Institute for Social and Economic Research, Education and Information)
LSI	Lembaga Survei Indonesia (Indonesian Survey Institute)
Malari <i>merdeka</i>	Malapetaka Januari (January Disaster) freedom, independence
MOU	memorandum of understanding
MPR	Majelis Permusyawaratan Rakyat (Peoples' Consultative Assembly)
MRP	Majelis Rakyat Papua (Papuan People's Assembly)
Muhammadiyah	Indonesia's largest modernist Islamic organisation
MUI	Majelis Ulama Indonesia (Council of Islamic Scholars)
NU	Nahdlatul Ulama (Awakening of the Ulama), Indonesia's largest traditionalist Islamic organisation
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
OPM	Organisasi Papua Merdeka (Free Papua Movement)
Opsus <i>ormas</i>	Operasi Khusus (Special Operations) <i>organisasi masyarakat</i> (social organisations)
PA	Partai Aceh (Aceh Party), a local Aceh party associated with former leaders of the separatist organisation GAM
PAN	Partai Amanat Nasional (National Mandate Party)
Pancasila	the five guiding principles of the Indonesian state (belief in God, humanitarianism, nationalism, democracy and social justice)
<i>panja</i>	<i>panitia kerja</i> (working committee)
<i>pansus</i>	<i>panitia khusus</i> (special committee)
Partai Patriot	Patriot Party
Partai Patriot Pancasila	Patriotic Pancasila Party

PBB	Partai Bulan Bintang (Crescent Moon and Star Party), an Islamic modernist political party
PBR	Partai Bintang Reformasi (Star Reformist Party), a splinter of PPP
PD	Partai Demokrat (Democratic Party), the party led by President Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono
PDA	Partai Daulat Aceh (Aceh Sovereignty Party), a local Aceh party
PDIP	Partai Demokrasi Indonesia Perjuangan (Indonesian Democratic Party of Struggle), the party led by former president Megawati Sukarnoputri
PDP	Presidium Dewan Papua (Papua Presidium Council)
PDS	Partai Damai Sejahtera (Prosperous Peace Party)
<i>pecalang</i>	'traditional' civilian security forces (Bali)
<i>pemekaran</i>	'blossoming', referring to the process of subdivision of administrative units
Pemuda Pancasila	Pancasila Youth
<i>pilkada</i>	<i>pemilihan kepala daerah</i> (direct elections of local government heads)
PKB	Partai Kebangkitan Bangsa (People's Awakening Party), a traditionalist Muslim party
PKI	Partai Komunis Indonesia (Indonesian Communist Party)
PKPI	Partai Keadilan dan Persatuan Indonesia (Indonesian Justice and Unity Party)
PKS	Partai Keadilan Sejahtera (Prosperous Justice Party), an Islamist party
PMB	Partai Matahari Bangsa (Sun of the Nation Party)
PNI	Partai Nasional Indonesia (Indonesian National Party), founded by former president Sukarno in the 1920s
PPP	Partai Persatuan Pembangunan (United Development Party), an Islamist party
PRA	Partai Rakyat Aceh (Aceh People's Party), a left-wing local Aceh party
<i>preman</i>	thug
PSHK	Pusat Studi Hukum dan Kebijakan (Centre for Indonesian Law and Policy Studies)
<i>reformasi</i>	'reform', the post-New Order period
<i>santri</i>	pious Muslims who seek to adhere strictly to the ritual and legal requirements of Islam
<i>satgas</i>	<i>satuan tugas</i> (task force)
SBY	Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono, Indonesia's president

SIRA	Sentral Informasi Referendum Aceh (Aceh Referendum Information Centre)
SPSI	Serikat Pekerja Seluruh Indonesia (All Indonesia Workers Union)
<i>syari'ah</i>	Islamic law
<i>Tatib</i>	<i>Peraturan Tata Tertib</i> [Rules of Procedure]
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
<i>walikota</i>	mayor
Currencies	
\$	US dollar
Rp	Indonesian rupiah

Map 1.1 Indonesia

