

*Islam* and the  
*Secular State*  
in Indonesia

The **Institute of Southeast Asian Studies (ISEAS)** was established as an autonomous organization in 1968. It is a regional centre dedicated to the study of socio-political, security and economic trends and developments in Southeast Asia and its wider geostrategic and economic environment. The Institute's research programmes are the Regional Economic Studies (RES, including ASEAN and APEC), Regional Strategic and Political Studies (RSPS), and Regional Social and Cultural Studies (RSCS).

**ISEAS Publishing**, an established academic press, has issued almost 2,000 books and journals. It is the largest scholarly publisher of research about Southeast Asia from within the region. ISEAS Publishing works with many other academic and trade publishers and distributors to disseminate important research and analyses from and about Southeast Asia to the rest of the world.

*Islam* and the  
*Secular State*  
in Indonesia

Luthfi Assyaukanie



INSTITUTE OF SOUTHEAST ASIAN STUDIES  
Singapore



*To*

*Titi, Gabriel, Melika, and Amadea*



# CONTENTS

---

<i>Preface</i>	ix
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xiii
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xiv
1. Islamic Ideology and Utopias	1
2. Muslim Responses to Political Change	24
3. Model 1: Islamic Democratic State	57
4. Model 2: Religious Democratic State	97
5. Model 3: Liberal Democratic State	140
6. Continuity and Discontinuity of the Models	177
7. Conclusion	222
<i>Bibliography</i>	234
<i>Index</i>	253
<i>About the Author</i>	262



# PREFACE

---

For the last ten years, popular and academic books on Islam revolve around various aspects of Islamic radicalism. There seems to be no analysis of Islam unless it is rendered with the phenomenon of Islamic radicalism. Books on Indonesian Islam are no exception. The outbreak of religious conflicts since 1998 and a series of atrocious bombings in Bali and other places, only ensure that writers have nothing more relevant to speak about Islam other than its violent aspects. This book is different. It confronts the current media hype over the phenomenon of radical Islam in Indonesia. It presents a very fundamental inquiry about Indonesian Islam — once described as tolerant, peaceful, and “different from the Middle East” — as to whether it has been absorbed by the global wave of religious fundamentalism.

One argument that I make in this book is that throughout the last fifty years, Indonesian Islam has undergone tremendous development and made progress towards a more pluralist and democratic system of polity. To put it in a comparative historical perspective, Indonesian Muslims are politically more pragmatic and rational. This assumption obviously needs ground on which one can hold its validity. In this book, I argue that there is no better measurement to judge the religio-political attitude of Indonesian Muslims than the general election. Since independence, Indonesian people have gone through several elections, of which three were democratically held: in 1955, 1999, and 2004. Comparing these three general elections, we get a different picture of Indonesian Islam. Instead of becoming more ideological, the religio-political attitude of Indonesian Muslims is increasingly pragmatic. The last two general elections (1999 and 2004) distinctly showed that Islamic political parties have failed to improve on the record that they achieved in 1955 (43 per cent). Together, Islamic parties only obtained 14 per cent (in 1999) and 17 per cent (2004) of the total votes.

The failure of Islamic parties in the 1999 and 2004 general elections left a big question mark as to why there was such a change and so dramatic at that? This Indonesian case is even more fascinating when we compare it with other Muslim countries, where there is, contrastingly, a tendency for Islamic triumph in electoral democracy. In Jordan, for instance, the Islamic Action Front, a Muslim Brotherhood (Ikhwan al-Muslimin) based party, won the 1989 election by obtaining 28.7 per cent of the total vote. In Algeria, the Islamic Salvation Front (FIS, Front Islamique du Salut) won the

1990 general election for local council by obtaining 55 per cent of the total vote. In Turkey, the Refah Party, surprisingly won the 1995 general election by obtaining 21.3 per cent of the total vote. Finally, interesting to add also, in the 2005 parliamentary election in Egypt, the Muslim Brotherhood, obtained eighty-seven seats (20 per cent of the vote), making it the second most powerful party after the incumbent party, the National Democratic Party, which obtained 314 seats (69 per cent).

The question is why Islamic parties in Indonesia lost their battle to win democracy. Why does the Islamic agenda at the state level often fail to be implemented? Also, in spite of all those achievements, why is there a growing number of Islamic radical groups? This book is designed to answer this very question by giving a quite different perspective and taking a different approach. Most books on Indonesian Islam emphasize the role of the state in changing the religio-political attitude of Indonesian Muslims. While acknowledging the crucial role played by the Soeharto's regime in the last three decades, this book offers a new analysis. The change in the religio-political attitude of Indonesian Muslims is not only due to the Soeharto government, which ruled the country repressively, but also due to the long and passionate role played by Muslim intellectuals, particularly the *santri* intellectuals, who, believing in the doctrine of change and progress, silently support the regime's agenda of modernization. As the precursors of the Islamic reform movement, these intellectuals believed that only by developing Islamic arguments could the ongoing changes in Muslim societies be religiously and rationally justified.

Then from the early 1970s, a new generation of *santri* Muslims emerged in the public arena, pitting their reformist ideas primarily against their *santri* seniors (mostly affiliated with Masyumi). Fundamental concepts such as the "Islamic state", "Islamic party", "*shari'ah*", and "the basis of state", were ceaselessly examined. This intellectual exercise often generated a strong reaction and immediately challenged the integration of the Muslim community. Better educated and trained in both religious and secular sciences, this new generation of *santri* Muslims was quite successful in rebutting their seniors' arguments on such fundamental issues.

Certainly, argument is only one dimension of the contestation of ideas in contemporary discourse of Islam and politics in Indonesia. There are other dimensions that alter such an argument that have taken effect in society. Mass media were accustomed to playing a significant role. Indonesian leading media such as *Tempo* and *Kompas* knowingly took sides with — and directly or indirectly promoted — the religious reform project led by the new *santri* generation. The result was quite clear: given the pressure of the

unfriendly regime to political Islam and the attack of Muslim intellectuals at the central core of Islamic political doctrines, Indonesian Muslims had not much choice except to welcome the situation. The role of argument has long been studied by various branches of social sciences, but none relating its role specifically to Indonesian Islam, or even the Islamic world in general, has been done.

This book tries to fill this gap. Existing studies on Islam in Indonesia are dominated by an anthropological approach, partly influenced by Clifford Geertz and other first generation Western Indonesianists. The emerging categorizations were thus reflecting such anthropological analysis, such as *santri-abangan* and traditionalist-modernist dichotomies. This book comes with a new perspective that borrows from the framework of sociology of knowledge. Apart from the role of arguments, people's projection of an ordered polity, which Karl Mannheim called "utopia", is very much connected with ideology. It is nearly impossible to imagine people's utopian projections without acknowledging the role of ideologies. In the last fifty years, Indonesian Muslims have been interacting and dealing with world ideologies (for example, secularism, communism, Marxism, liberalism, etc.), which have directly or indirectly shaped their utopian views of an ideal polity.

This book grew out of my Ph.D. thesis, which I submitted to the University of Melbourne, Australia. I needed four years to write and complete it. Many people had been helpful in completing this book. First and foremost, I would like to thank Professors Merle C. Ricklefs, Abdullah Saeed, and Arief Budiman, who supervised me while I did my Ph.D. programme at the University of Melbourne. I was lucky to have such great supervisors. They gave such intense critiques and comments on the drafts of my thesis that I sometimes felt hurt. I now realize that without their constructive criticisms the thesis would not have been as good. In late July 2007, I received a letter from the University of Melbourne advising that my thesis, this book, had won the Chancellor's Prize for the best Ph.D. thesis in Humanities. I feel that the role played by my supervisors had not been small. After this achievement, Professor Ricklefs kept requesting me to turn the thesis into a book and have it published. Every time we met in Singapore or Jakarta, the first question he raised was "when is the book coming?" is I hope he would now stop asking me that question!

During my studies in Melbourne, I was helped by the Australian Agency for International Development (AusAID). This institute had generously given me a good scholarship that allowed me and my family to live comfortably. The Melbourne Institute of Asian Languages and Society

(MIALS) and the Melbourne Abroad Travelling Scholarship (MATS) also kindly helped me financially to do my fieldwork research in Indonesia.

Several experts on Indonesia contributed to the process of writing this book: Professors Virginia Hooker, Daniel S. Lev (the late), R. William Liddle, Robert E. Elson, and Robert W. Hefner, Dr Lance Castles, and Dr Greg Barton. I would like to thank them for their kindness in helping me directly or indirectly. I would also like to convey my appreciation and thanks to my friends in Australia: M. Syafi'i Anwar, Fatimah Husein, Andy Fuller, Ludiro Madu, Yayah Khisbiyah, Arskal Salim, Suadi Asyari, Masdar Hilmy, Khalid Al-Azri, Dewi Anggraini, Stephen and Indah Morgan.

My colleagues in Indonesia were also helpful: Ulil Abshar-Abdalla, Hamid Basyaib, Ahmad Sahal, Nong Darol Mahmada, Anick HT, Burhanuddin, Abd. Moqsith Ghazali, Novriantoni, Lanny Octavia, M. Guntur Romli, Maljaul Abror, Saidiman, Ade Juniarti, and other friends in Jaringan Islam Liberal (JIL), who are too many to mention here by name. My friends at the Freedom Institute, Rizal Mallarangeng, Saiful Mujani, Sugianto Tandra, Hidayaturohman, Sarah Santi, and Zaim Rofiqi also supported me in their own ways. I must also mention my colleagues at Paramadina University: Ahmad Rivai Hasan, Abdul Hadi W.M., Nanang Tahqiq, Nasruddin Latief, Abdul Muis Naharong, and Suratno.

The process of transforming the thesis into this book would not have been possible without the help of the S. Rajaratnam School of International Studies (RSIS), Nanyang Technological University, Singapore, which granted me a post-doctoral fellowship for one year (1997). There are many people who had been so kind to me during my stay at RSIS. First of all, I would like to thank Ambassador Barry Desker, Dean of RSIS, Professor Amitav Acharya, Deputy Dean, and Dr Leonard Sebastian, Head of Indonesian Programme. My gratitudes also go to Dr Joseph Liow, Yang Razali, and Mohamed Nawab, and Dr Vedi R. Hadiz of the NUS.

Lastly, I owe my deep gratitude to my family who supported me throughout the writing of this book. My wife, Titi Sukriyah, is a most pleasant companion and the one with whom I share my joys and agonies. My kids, Gabriel, Melika, and Amadea often fill our home with delight and laughter. I dedicate this book to them.

# ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

---

An earlier version of Chapter 5, “Model 3: Liberal Democratic State” was first published in Luthfi Assyaukanie, Robert Hefner and Azyumardi Azra, *Muslim Politics and Democratisation in Indonesia*, Annual Indonesian Lecture Series 28 (Clayton: Monash Asia Institute Press, 2008). Reproduced by permission of the publisher.

An earlier version of Chapter 6, “Continuity and Discontinuity of the Models” was first published as “Trajectories of Islamic Liberalism in Contemporary Indonesia”, *Australian Religion Studies Review*, vol. 21, no. 2 (2008), pp. 145–74. Reproduced by permission of the copyright-holder, Equinox Publishing.

# ABBREVIATIONS

---

AD/ART	Constitution and Bylaws (Anggaran Dasar, Anggaran Rumah Tangga)
BKAM	Coordinating Institution of Muslim Groups (Badan Koordinasi Amal Muslimin)
BMI	Islamic Bank of Indonesia (Bank Muamalat Indonesia)
BPUPKI	Investigating Committee for Preparatory Work for Indonesian Independence (Badan Usaha Penyelidik Persiapan Kemerdekaan Indonesia)
BUMN	State-owned Companies (Badan Usaha Milik Negara)
CSIS	Centre for Strategic and International Studies
DDII	Indonesian Islamic Preaching Council (Dewan Dakwah Islamiyah Indonesia)
Depag	Department of Religion (Departemen Agama)
DGI	Indonesian Council of Churches (Dewan Gereja Indonesia)
DI	House of Islam (Darul Islam)
DPR	People's Representative Council (Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat)
FPI	Defenders of Islam Front (Front Pembela Islam)
GBHN	Broad Outlines of the State Policy (Garis-garis Besar Haluan Negara)
Golkar	Functional Group (Golongan Karya)
HMI	Muslim Student Association (Himpunan Mahasiswa Islam)
HTI	Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia
HUSAMI	Indonesian Association of Muslim Businessmen (Himpunan Usahawan Muslimin Indonesia)
IAIN	State Institute of Islamic Religion (Institut Agama Islam Negeri)
ICG	International Crisis Group
ICMI	Association of Indonesian Muslim Intellectuals (Ikatan Cendekiawan Muslim Indonesia)
IDS	Islamic Democratic Model

---

IKIP	Teacher Training Institute (Institut Keguruan dan Ilmu Pendidikan)
Inpres	Presidential Instruction (Instruksi Presiden)
ISDV	Indies Social-Democratic Association (the Indische Sociaal-Democratische Vereeniging)
ITB	Bandung Institute of Technology (Institut Teknologi Bandung)
JIB	Young Islamic Association (Jong Islamieten Bond)
JIL	Liberal Islam Network (Jaringan Islam Liberal)
KISDI	Indonesian Committee for Solidarity with the Islamic World (Komite Indonesia untuk Solidaritas Dunia Islam)
KPPSI	Committee for the Preparation of the Implementation of Shari'ah (Komite Persiapan Penegakan Syariat Islam)
KPU	General Election Committee (Komite Pemilihan Umum)
KSI	Committee of Islamic Solidarity (Komite Solidaritas Islam)
KTP	Resident Identity Card (Kartu Tanda Penduduk)
KWI	Indonesian Catholic Bishops' Conference (Konferensi Waligereja Indonesia)
LDS	Liberal Democratic State
LIPIA	College of Arabic and Islamic Sciences (Lembaga Ilmu Pengetahuan Islam dan Arab)
LJ	Jihad Troopers (Laskar Jihad)
LKiS	Institute for Islamic and Social Studies (Lembaga Kajian Islam dan Sosial)
LP3ES	Institute for Economic and Social Research, Education, and Information (Lembaga Penelitian, Pendidikan, dan Penerangan Ekonomi dan Sosial)
LSAF	Foundation of Study of Philosophy and Religion (Lembaga Studi Agama dan Filsafat)
Masyumi	Consultative Council of Indonesian Muslims (Majelis Syuro Muslimin Indonesia)
MAWI	Indonesian Council of Bishops (Majelis Agung Waligereja Indonesia)
MIAI	Supreme Islamic Council of Indonesia (Majelis Islam A'laa Indonesia )
MMI	Indonesian Council of Mujahidin (Majelis Mujahidin Indonesia)

---

MPR	People's Consultative Assembly (Majelis Permusyawaratan Rakyat)
MUI	Indonesian Council of Religious Scholars (Majelis Ulama Indonesia)
NII	Indonesian Islamic State (Negara Islam Indonesia)
NKRI	United State of Indonesian Republic (Negara Kesatuan Republik Indonesia)
NU	Nahdlatul Ulama
ORI	Currency of the Republic of Indonesia (Oeang Republik Indonesia)
PAN	National Mandatory Party (Partai Amanat Nasional)
Parmusi	Indonesian Muslim Party (Partai Muslimin Indonesia)
PBB	Crescent and Star Party (Partai Bulan Bintang)
PBN	National Labour Party (Partai Buruh Nasional)
PDI	Indonesian Democratic Party (Partai Demokrasi Indonesia)
PDI-P	Indonesian Democratic Party of Struggle (Partai Demokrasi Indonesia Perjuangan)
PDRI	Emergency Government of the Republic of Indonesia (Pemerintahan Darurat Republik Indonesia)
Pelita	Five-Year Plan (Pembangunan Lima Tahun)
Penpres	Presidential Decision (Penetapan Presiden)
Permi	Indonesian Muslim Unity (Persatuan Muslimin Indonesia)
Persis	Islamic Unity (Persatuan Islam)
PGI	Communion of Churches in Indonesia (Persatuan Gereja-gereja di Indonesia)
PHDI	Association of Indonesian Hindu Dharma (Persatuan Hindu Dharma Indonesia)
PII	Indonesian Islamic Students (Pelajar Islam Indonesia)
PK	Justice Party (Partai Keadilan)
PKB	National Awakening Party (Partai Kebangkitan Bangsa)
PKI	Indonesian Communist Party (Partai Komunis Indonesia)
PKS	Prosperous Justice Party (Partai Keadilan Sejahtera)
PMB	New Masyumi Party (Partai Masyumi Baru)
PMKRI	Indonesian Catholic Student Association (Perhimpunan Mahasiswa Katolik Republik Indonesia)
PNI	Indonesian Nationalist Party (Partai Nasionalis Indonesia)

PPIM	Indonesian Islamic Political Party of Masyumi (Partai Politik Islam Indonesia Masyumi)
PPKI	Committee for the Preparation of Indonesia's Independence (Panitia Persiapan Kemerdekaan Indonesia)
PPPKI	Federation of Political Association of Indonesian Nationalism (Permuafakatan Perhimpunan Politik Kebangsaan Indonesia)
PPP	United Development Party (Partai Persatuan Pembangunan)
PRD	Democratic People's Party (Partai Rakyat Demoratik)
PRRI	Revolutionary Government of the Indonesian Republic (Pemerintah Revolusioner Republik Indonesia)
PSI	Indonesian Socialist Party (Partai Sosialis Indonesia)
PSII	Islamic Political Association of Indonesia (Partai Sarikat Islam Indonesia)
PSP	Worker Solidarity Party (Partai Solidaritas Pekerja)
PSPSI	All Indonesia Worker Solidarity Party (Partai Solidaritas Pekerja Seluruh Indonesia)
PTIQ	Institute of Qur'anic Science (Perguruan Tinggi Ilmu al-Qur'an)
PUI	Islamic Community Party (Partai Umat Islam)
PUSTEP	Centre for Study of Pancasila Economy (Pusat Studi Ekonomi Pancasila)
RDS	Religious Democratic State
Repelita	Five-Year Plan for Development (Rencana Pembangunan Lima Tahun)
Resist	Centre for Religious and Social Studies
RUU	Bill or Legal Draft (Rancangan Undang-Undang)
RUU-KUB	Bill of Religious Tolerance (Rancangan Undang-Undang Kerukunan Umat Beragama)
RUU-P	Marriage Bill (Rancangan Undang-Undang Perkawinan)
RUU-PA	Religious Judicature Act (Rancangan Undang-Undang Peradilan Agama)
SATV	Sidik Amanat Tableg Vatonah
SEI	Islamic Economic System (Sistem Ekonomi Islam)
SEP	Pancasila Economic System (Sistem Ekonomi Pancasila)

SI	Islamic Association (Sarekat Islam)
Sisdiknas	National Educational System (Sistem Pendidikan Nasional)
SIUPP	Press Publication Enterprise Permit (Surat Izin Usaha Penerbitan Pers)
SME	Social Market Economy
SPI	Indonesian Economic System (Sistem Perekonomian Indonesia)
STAIN	Advanced School of State Islamic Religion (Sekolah Tinggi Agama Islam Negeri)
STF	Advanced School of Philosophy (Sekolah Tinggi Filsafat)
TII	Indonesian Islamic Army (Tentara Islam Indonesia)
TUK	Utan Kayu Theater (Teater Utan Kayu)
UGM	Gajah Mada University (Universitas Gajah Mada)
UIN	State Islamic University (Universitas Islam Negeri)
UM	State University of Malang (Universitas Negeri Malang)
UMM	Muhammadiyah University of Malang (Universitas Muhammadiyah Malang)
UUD	Indonesian Constitution (Undang-Undang Dasar)
Walubi	Council of Indonesian Buddhist (Perwalian Umat Buddha Indonesia)
WAY	World Assembly of Youth
WNA	Foreign Citizen (Warga Negara Asing)
WNI	Indonesian Citizen (Warga Negara Indonesia)