Getting a Dial Tone
The Institute of Southeast Asian Studies (ISEAS) was established as an autonomous organization in 1968. It is a regional centre dedicated to the study of socio-political, security, and economic trends and developments in Southeast Asia and its wider geostrategic and economic environment.

The Institute's research programmes are the Regional Economic Studies (RES, including ASEAN and APEC), Regional Strategic and Political Studies (RSPS), and Regional Social and Cultural Studies (RSCS).

ISEAS Publishing, an established academic press, has issued almost 2,000 books and journals. It is the largest scholarly publisher of research about Southeast Asia from within the region. ISEAS Publishing works with many other academic and trade publishers and distributors to disseminate important research and analyses from and about Southeast Asia to the rest of the world.
Getting a Dial Tone
Telecommunications Liberalisation in Malaysia and the Philippines

LORRAINE CARLOS SALAZAR
For Nanay and Tatay
Contents

Map of Malaysia and the Philippines viii
List of Tables ix
List of Figures xi
List of Appendices xii
List of Abbreviations xiv
Acknowledgements xix

1 Rent-Seeking, Market Reforms, and States 1
2 Reviewing the Literature: Theories and Puzzles 18
3 Historical Overview of the State and Business in Malaysia and the Philippines 48
4 The Telecommunications Sector in Malaysia and the Philippines Before Reform 86
5 Reforming the Malaysian Telecommunications Sector 133
6 The Liberalisation of Telecommunications in Malaysia 160
7 Regulatory Reforms in Malaysia 198
8 Reforming the Telecommunications Sector of the Philippines 225
9 The New Players and the Service Area Scheme 258
10 Regulatory Reforms in the Philippines 298
11 Conclusions 325

Appendices 339
Bibliography 375
Index 396
About the Author 412
List of Tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1-1</td>
<td>Puzzles and Arguments</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-2</td>
<td>Teledensity in Malaysia and the Philippines, 1981–2001</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2-1</td>
<td>Major Actors</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-1</td>
<td>Peninsular Malaysia: Ownership of Share Capital of Limited Companies by Ethnicity and Industry, 1970</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-2</td>
<td>Peninsular Malaysia: Ethnic Composition of Employment by Industry, 1970</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-3</td>
<td>Average Growth of GDP in Southeast Asia, 1950–2000</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-1</td>
<td>Malaysian and Philippine Basic Telecommunications Indicators, 1965–90</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-2</td>
<td>Malaysian Telephone Demand, 1970–84</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-3</td>
<td>Revenue and Financing of the Telecommunications Department, 1976–84</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-4</td>
<td>Turnkey Project Outcomes</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-5</td>
<td>PTIC Ownership, January 1968</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-6</td>
<td>Major Pre-Reform Telecommunications Firms in the Philippines</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-7</td>
<td>Coverage of Local Telephone Operators By Region, 1973–74</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-8</td>
<td>Distribution of Local Telephone Operators By Region, 1973–74</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-9</td>
<td>PLDT Ownership Structure, 1987</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Tables

5-1 Performance of Telekom Malaysia Before and After Privatisation 148
6-1 Malaysian Telecommunications Companies After Liberalisation, 1989–96 163
6-2 Malaysian Telecommunications Market After Consolidation, 1996–2002 185
6-3 Malaysian Telecommunications Market After Consolidation, 2003 186
6-4 Malaysian Actors and Their Position During the Reform of the Telecommunications Sector 189
7-1 New Malaysian Licensing Regime, 2001 212
7-2 Malaysian Actors and Their Positions During Regulatory Reforms 217
7-3 Highlights of Telecommunications Reforms in Malaysia 220
8-1 Philippine Telecommunications Franchises 236
8-2 Philippine Actors and Their Positions During Telecommunications Reform 251
9-1 Service Area Scheme Assignments 259
9-2 Philippine Telecommunications Company Ownership, 1998 261
9-3 SAS Accomplishments, December 2000 281
9-4 Concentration of Telephone Facilities in Urban Centres, 2001 283
9-5 Coverage of Telecommunications Services, December 2000 284
9-6 Philippine Telecommunications Players, as of 2002 290
10-1 Summary of Physical Targets, National Telecommunications Development Plan, 1991–2010 302
10-2 Philippine Actors and their Positions During Regulatory Reforms 316
10-3 Highlights of Telecommunications Reform in the Philippines 318
List of Figures

4-1 PLDT Ownership Structure, 1967  103
4-2 Distribution of PLDT Equity Shares, 1987  117
6-1 Celcom’s Takeover by TRI  166
6-2 Types of Rent Recipients and Their Political Patrons  183
List of Appendices

A1  Selected Economic Indicators for Malaysia and the Philippines
   A1-1  GDP, GDP Growth Rate, and GDP per Capita 340
   A1-2  Total Population, Telephone Mainlines, and Official Exchange Rate 342
   A1-4  Malaysian and Philippine GDP Growth Rate, 1960–2001 345
   A1-5  Malaysian and Philippine GDP per Capita, 1960–2001 346
   A1-7  Malaysian and Philippine Telephone Mainlines per 1,000 People, 1960–2001 348

A2  PLDT Ownership Issue Timeline 350

A3  Comparative Performance of the Telecommunications Sector in Selected ASEAN Countries
   A3-1  Cellular Mobile Subscribers in Selected ASEAN Countries, 1990–2005 363
   A3-2  Cellular Telecommunications Cost in Selected ASEAN Countries, 1995–2006 (US$) 364
List of Appendices

A3-3 Fixed-Line Telephone Waiting List in Selected ASEAN Countries, 1982–2005 365
A3-4 Urban and Rural Fixed-Line Teledensity in Selected ASEAN Countries, 1991–2001 366
A3-5 Public Payphone Availability in Selected ASEAN Selected ASEAN Countries, 1991–2005 367
A3-6 Fixed-Line Telecommunications Cost in Selected ASEAN Countries, 1990–2005 368
A3-7 Functions of the Regulatory Agencies 369
A3-8 Accountability, Autonomy, and Competency of the Regulatory Process 370

A4 JTM Regulatory Determinations, 1995–99 371
A5 Agile’s Ten-point Programme to Restructure the Philippine Telecommunications Industry and Outcomes of Agile Support for the NTC, 2002 373
List of Abbreviations

ACA  Anti-Corruption Agency
ACCIM  Associated Chinese Chambers of Commerce and Industry of Malaysia
ADB  Asian Development Bank
AGILE  Accelerating Growth, Investment, and Liberalization with Equity
AMPS  Advanced Mobile Phone System
BayanTel  Bayan Telecommunications Holding Corporation
BellTel  Bell Telecommunications Corporation
BN  Barisan Nasional
BOT  build-operate-transfer
BTA  Basic Telecommunications Agreement
Butel  Bureau of Telecommunications
CA  Commonwealth Act
CAP  Consumers Association of Penang
CapWire  Capitol Wireless
CDMA  Code Division Multiple Access
Celcom  Cellular Communications Berhad
CEO  chief executive officer
CIC  Capital Issues Committee
CIDA  Canadian International Development Aid
CMA  Communications and Multimedia Act
CMC  Communications and Multimedia Commission
CMTS  Cellular Mobile Telephone System
List of Abbreviations

CPCN Certificate of Public Convenience and Necessity
CPP Communist Party of the Philippines
CUEPACS Congress of Unions of Employees in the Public and Civil Services
DAI Development Alternatives Incorporated
DAP Democratic Action Party
DC Department Circular
Digitel Digital Telecommunications Philippines Inc.
DNU Department of National Unity
DOMSAT Domestic Satellite Company
DOTC Department of Transportation and Communications
EO Executive Order
EOI export-oriented industrialisation
EON Edaran Otomobil Nasional
EPF Employees’ Provident Fund
EPU Economic Planning Unit
ETACS Extended Total Access Communication System
ETPI Eastern Telecommunications Philippines Incorporated
Extelcom Express Telecommunications, Incorporated
FELDA Federal Land Development Authority
FIC Foreign Investment Committee
GATS General Agreement on Trade in Services
GFIA General Framework for Interconnection and Access
Globe Globe Telecom (formerly Globe Mackay Cable and Radio, Incorporated)
GR General Register
GSM Global System for Mobile Communications
GTE General Telephone and Electronic Corporation
HICOM Heavy Industries Corporation of Malaysia
IBRD International Bank for Reconstruction and Development
ICA Industrial Coordination Act
ICC International Communication Corporation
ICT Information and Communications Technology
List of Abbreviations

ICU Implementation and Coordination Unit
IDD international direct dialling
IFC International Finance Corporation
IGF International Gateway Facility
IMF International Monetary Fund
ISI import substitution industrialisation
Islacom Isla Communications Co. Inc.
IT information technology
ITU International Telecommunications Union
IWC International Wireless Corporation
JICA Japan International Cooperation Agency
JKH Jadual Kadar Harga (Schedule of Standards and Rates)
JTM Jabatan Telekom Malaysia (Telecommunications Department)
KLSE Kuala Lumpur Stock Exchange
KWAP Kumpulan Wang Amanah Pencen
Lakas ng Bansa Strength of the Nation–National Union of
–NUCD–UMCD Christian Democrats–United Muslim Christian Democrats
LDP Laban ng Demokratikong Pilipino
LRIC long-run incremental cost
LTAT Lembaga Tabung Angkatan Tentera
MARA Majlis Amanah Rakyat
MAS Malaysian Airlines
MCA Malaysian Chinese Association
MIC Malaysian Indian Congress
METP Ministry of Energy, Telecommunications, and Posts
MECM Ministry of Energy, Communications, and Multimedia
MNLF Moro National Liberation Front
MOF Ministry of Finance
MORE Phones Movement for Reliable and Efficient Phone System
MPH Multi-Purpose Holdings
MRCB Malaysian Resources Corporation
MSC Multimedia SuperCorridor
MTPDP Medium-Term Philippine Development Plan
List of Abbreviations

MTSU  Malaysian Technical Services Union
NCC   National Consultative Council
NCR   National Capital Region
NDP   New Development Plan
NEB   National Electricity Board
NEDA  National Economic and Development Authority
NEP   New Economic Policy
NGO   non-governmental organization
NSC   National Security Council
NTC   National Telecommunications Commission
NTDP  National Telecommunications Development Plan
NTP   National Telecommunications Policy
NTT   Nippon Telephon and Telegraph Company
NUTE  National Union of Telecommunications Employees
OPP   Outline Prospective Plan
OSA   Official Secrets Act
PAP   Privatisation Action Plan
Paptelco Philippine Association of Private Telephone Companies Incorporated
PAS   Parti Islam SeMalaysia
PCGG  Presidential Commission on Good Government
PCIJ  Philippine Center for Investigative Journalism
PCN   Personal Communications Network
PCS   Personal Communications System
Pernas Perbadanan Nasional
PHI   Prime Holdings Incorporated
PHILCOM Philippine Global Communications Company
Philcomsat Philippine Communications Satellite Corporation
Pitel  Pilipino Telephone Company
PLDT  Philippine Long Distance Telephone Company
PLUS  Projek Lebuhraya Utara Selatan
PMP   Privatisation Masterplan
PNB   Permodalan Nasional Berhad (National Equity Corporation)
PSC   Public Services Commission
PSDN  Public Data Switched Network
PSTN  public switched telephone network
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PTIC</td>
<td>Philippine Telecommunications Investment Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PT&amp;T</td>
<td>Philippine Telegraph &amp; Telephone Corp.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RA</td>
<td>Republic Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RAM</td>
<td>Rebolusyonaryong Alyansang Makabayan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retelco</td>
<td>Republic Telephone Company</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RIDA</td>
<td>Rural and Industrial Development Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RTDP</td>
<td>Regional Telephone Development Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAS</td>
<td>Service Area Scheme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SBC</td>
<td>Southwestern Bell Company</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Supreme Court</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEC</td>
<td>Securities and Exchange Commission (Philippines)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEDC</td>
<td>State Economic and Development Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SingTel</td>
<td>Singapore Telecommunications</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SIP</td>
<td>Subscribers Investment Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smart</td>
<td>Smart Telecommunications Company</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMS</td>
<td>short messaging service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOE</td>
<td>state-owned enterprises</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SSS</td>
<td>social security system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STM</td>
<td>Syarikat Telekom Malaysia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STW</td>
<td>Syarikat Telefon Wireless</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Telekom/TM</td>
<td>Telekom Malaysia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TelicPhil</td>
<td>Telecommunications Infrastructure Philippines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Telof</td>
<td>Telecommunications Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRD</td>
<td>Telecommunications Regulatory Determination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRI</td>
<td>Technology Resources Industries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UDA</td>
<td>Urban Development Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UEM</td>
<td>United Engineers Malaysia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UMNO</td>
<td>United Malays National Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UMW</td>
<td>United Motor Works</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USAID</td>
<td>United States Aid for International Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USO</td>
<td>Universal Service Obligation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VANS</td>
<td>value-added network services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VAS</td>
<td>value-added services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WB</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WLL</td>
<td>wireless local loop</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WTO</td>
<td>World Trade Organization</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Writing this book has been a tremendously exciting and rewarding journey, which would not have been possible without the help, generosity, and kindness of so many people. Thus, I would like to acknowledge their contribution, though all errors and shortcomings are my responsibility alone.

First of all, the book was based on my Ph.D. dissertation at the Australian National University. I benefited greatly from having Ben Kerkvliet as a mentor. His capacity for critical, open-minded, and thorough thinking has been exemplary, as has his kindness and friendship. Harold Crouch, Hal Hill, Natasha Hamilton, Virginia Hooker, Terence Gomez, and Boying Lallana provided me with helpful advice, engaging comments, and encouragement from the start of my research up to the end. Before going to ANU, Dodong Nemenzo challenged me to pursue a Ph.D. rather than going to law school. His generosity and example of melding activism and scholarship have been a source of great inspiration for me.

Second, the Institute of Southeast Asian Studies provided me the space and opportunity to rewrite the dissertation into a book. For this, I am grateful to ISEAS Director Ambassador K. Kesavapany and Regional Economic Studies Programme Convenor Denis Hew. Also, I would like to thank the excellent and supportive staff of ISEAS Publications Unit led by Mrs Triena Ong for the completion of this book.

Third, an earlier version of Chapter 6 was published as “Privatisation, Patronage and Enterprise Development: Liberalising...
Telecommunications in Malaysia”, in *The State of Malaysia: Ethnicity, Equity and Reform*, edited by Edmund Terence Gomez (London: RoutledgeCurzon, 2004), pp. 194–228. I thank RoutledgeCurzon for their permission to reprint the chapter. I also would like to thank the United States Agency for International Development’s (USAID) Growth with Equity in Mindanao (GEM) Project for giving me permission to use the photo of Condo Diwa, an ex-Moro National Liberation Front fighter turned seaweed farmer, for the book cover.

During fieldwork in Malaysia and the Philippines, the help and cooperation of a lot of people facilitated data gathering for this research. I am very grateful to all my interviewees who gave me time and agreed to share information, although some of them have requested anonymity. Without them, this book would not have been written. In Malaysia, I would like to specially thank: Leo Moggie, Nuraizah Abdul Hamid, Hod Parman, Munir Majid, Mohamad Said Mohamad Wira, Zamani Zakariah, Jaafar Ismail, and Vijay Kumar. In the Philippines, I would like to express my heartfelt gratitude to former President Fidel Ramos, Jose Almonte, Antonio Carpio, Anthony Abad, Simeon Kintanar, Josefina Lichauco, Helen Mendoza, Edgardo Cabarios, Philip Varilla, David Fernando, Antonio Samson, Rudy Salalima, Rodolfo Salazar, Mario Lamberte, Monette Serafica, and Jaime Faustino.

I am also thankful to the late Noordin Sopiee and the Institute of Strategic and International Studies-Malaysia (ISIS-Malaysia) and the late Ishak Shaari of IKMAS for giving me an institutional home and a research base while I was in Malaysia in 2000 and 2001. I benefited greatly from discussions with Terence Gomez, Khoo Khay Jin, Jomo K.S., Cassey Lee, Sumit Mandal, James Ongkili, Bridget Welsh, Saliha Hassan, Wan Faisal Wan Hamzah, Mohamad Jawhar, Zainal Aznam, Stephen Leong, Francis Loh, James Jesudason, Jennifer Jacobs, and B.K. Sidhu. Special thanks go to Lee Kam Hing for facilitating my use of the *Star* newspaper library. I am also grateful to Mr Kana of ISIS for organising my lodging, for Usha Rani and Shaleen for providing me a home in Kuala Lumpur, and for Pastor Vic Lumanglas and the Filipino congregation in Kuala Lumpur for their kindness and support. For their friendship and introduction to things Malaysian and otherwise, I thank Rehman Rashid, Angela Yap, Lee Hwok Aun,
Acknowledgements

Jacqui Tan, Denis Hew, Ahmad Shabery Chik, Neil Khor, Leong Choon Cheng, Patrick Pillai, Malik Hakim, and Noorul Ainur. In the Philippines, thanks are due to teachers and friends: Alex Magno, Boying Lallana, Temy Rivera, Ledi Carino, Luis Dery, Tesa Tadem, Patricia Pascual, Rudy and Kimi Quimbo, Shelah Lardizabal, Rhani Andam, Jaynee Saure, Zorah Andam, Chris Monterola, Cynthia Pagba, Mark Pierre Dimamay, Daphne Oh, Vanessa Velasco, Rey de Luna, Mark Uy, Third Fermin, Deo David, Toto Bacolcol, Germaine Santos, Emmylou Hallig, Chona Reyes, and Leeboy De Velez.

For their valuable documentary collections and accommodating staff, I would like to thank the libraries of the following institutions in Malaysia: Institute for Strategic and International Studies, University of Malaya, Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia, Universiti Sains Malaysia, Ministry of Energy, Communications and Multimedia, Communications and Multimedia Commission, Securities Commission, Star Publications, New Straits Times, Telekom Malaysia, Maxis, and Celcom. In addition, the Singapore-Malaysia Collection at the National University of Singapore and the Institute for Southeast Asian Studies (ISEAS) library in Singapore proved to hold important materials on Malaysia and the Philippines. In the Philippines, I am grateful for access to the documentary collections of the following institutions: University of the Philippines Main Library, UP College of Law Library, National Centre for Public Administration and Governance Library, UP School of Economics Library, Philippine Centre for Investigative Journalism, Philippine Institute for Development Studies, Congressional and Senate Libraries, National Telecommunications Commission, Department of Transportation and Communications, Telecommunications Office, National Economic and Development Administration (NEDA), Securities and Exchange Commission, Congressional Planning and Budget Office, Tariff Commission, Accelerating Growth, Investment and Liberalisation with Equity (AGILE) office, Foundation for Economic Freedom, Philippine Long Distance and Telephone Company, Globe Communications, Bayantel, Smart Telecommunications, Philcom, RCPI, Philcomsat, and the Makati Business Club.

For financial and institutional support for the fieldwork research, I would like to thank the Department of Political Science and the
University of the Philippines for giving me study leave to go to ANU; the ANU and the Australian Department of Education, Training and Youth Affairs for granting me tuition and stipend scholarships, and the Faculty of Asian Studies for fieldwork funding.

Friends that I met in ANU and some who have moved on to other places since have made life fun, pleasant, and meaningful. For their friendship, animated conversations, and inspiration, I thank Jackie Siapno, Fernando de Araujo, Kaori Maekawa, Deb Johnson, Chalinee Hirano, Tomomi Ito, Julius Bautista, Kit Collier, Malcolm Cook, Mike Poole, Liew Chin-Tong, Nathan Quimpo, Neilson Mersat, Rommel Curaming, Emma Pennel, Tristan Stephens, Gevy Vega and Rob Chambers, Edgi Vega, Amy Chan, Yae Sano, and Kyoung-Hee Moon.

For being my parents in Canberra, I am truly grateful to Melinda and Ben Kerkvliet. I also would like to thank the active and engaging members of the Philippines Study Group and the Malaysian Study Group to whom I presented aspects of this study, and in return received constructive comments and delicious dinners! I also would like to thank my grandparents, my Lolo Enchong and Lola Ciony who, even if they have both recently passed away, have been a constant source of love, support, and humour. My Aunties Susan, Nita, Odette, Anna, and Carmen, Uncles Manuel, Manding, Boy, and Pat, Ate Jo and my cousins deserve to be thanked for giving me enjoyable times off work. In the Philippines, my siblings Cynthia, Karen, and Alvin have also been loving, supportive, and productive — and thanks to them, I now have three nephews and a niece!

In writing this book, my husband, Francis Hutchinson’s help, diversions, love, encouragement, and support were crucial. Thanks to him, and the words of wisdom from my mother-in-law, Bea Cervantes Hutchinson, this book has been successfully completed.

My parents, Elvin and Perlita Salazar in Villasis, Pangasinan, deserve tons of appreciation and gratitude. They have continually amazed me with how, even as they live in and depend on a small rural economy, they were able to send all their four children to school. Their hard work, love, support, and example gave me motivation and strength to accomplish this task. It is to them that I dedicate this book.

Finally, for His goodness, sovereignty, and enduring love, I recognise and thank God. May all glory and honour be His alone.