

Reproduced from *Pluralism, Transnationalism and Culture in Asian Law: A Book in Honour of M.B. Hooker*, edited by Gary F. Bell (Singapore: ISEAS – Yusof Ishak Institute, 2017). This version was obtained electronically direct from the publisher on condition that copyright is not infringed. No part of this publication may be reproduced without the prior permission of ISEAS Publishing. Individual chapters are available at <http://bookshop.iseas.edu.sg>.

# Pluralism, Transnationalism and Culture in Asian Law

**The ISEAS – Yusof Ishak Institute** (formerly Institute of Southeast Asian Studies) is an autonomous organization established in 1968. It is a regional centre dedicated to the study of socio-political, security, and economic trends and developments in Southeast Asia and its wider geostrategic and economic environment. The Institute's research programmes are grouped under Regional Economic Studies (RES), Regional Strategic and Political Studies (RSPS), and Regional Social and Cultural Studies (RSCS). The Institute is also home to the ASEAN Studies Centre (ASC), the Nalanda-Sriwijaya Centre (NSC), and the Singapore APEC Centre.

**ISEAS Publishing**, an established academic press, has issued more than 2,000 books and journals. It is the largest scholarly publisher of research about Southeast Asia from within the region. ISEAS Publishing works with many other academic and trade publishers and distributors to disseminate important research and analyses from and about Southeast Asia to the rest of the world.

# Pluralism, Transnationalism and Culture in Asian Law

A BOOK IN HONOUR OF M.B. HOOKER

EDITED BY

GARY F. BELL

**ISEAS** YUSOF ISHAK  
INSTITUTE



To M.B. Hooker,

*whose scholarship and passion started it all.*



# Contents

Preface	<i>Gary F. Bell</i>	ix
Acknowledgements		xi
About the Contributors		xiii
Chapter 1:	M.B. Hooker and Southeast Asian Law: Path-breaking Passions <i>Veronica Taylor</i> <i>with M.B. Hooker and Virginia Hooker</i>	1
Chapter 2:	Asian Thought and Legal Diversity <i>H. Patrick Glenn</i>	31
Chapter 3:	Comparative Law, Anti-Essentialism and Intersectionality: Reflections from Southeast Asia in Search of an Elusive Balance <i>Arif A. Jamal</i>	52
Chapter 4:	Legal Pluralism and Legal Anthropology: Experiences from Indonesia <i>Franz von Benda-Beckmann and</i> <i>Keebet von Benda-Beckmann</i>	70

Chapter 5:	Mapping the Relationship of Competing Legal Traditions in the Era of Transnationalism in Indonesia <i>Ratno Lukito</i>	90
Chapter 6:	Indonesia's Weak State Courts and Weak Law Fare Poorly in a Pluralist Commercial World <i>Gary F. Bell</i>	116
Chapter 7:	When Laws Are Not Enough: Ethics, Aesthetics, and Intra-Religious Pluralism in Contemporary Indonesia <i>Virginia Matheson Hooker</i>	151
Chapter 8:	Legal Pluralism and the Constitutional Position of East Malaysia's Indigenous Peoples: The View from the Longhouse <i>Andrew Harding</i>	178
Chapter 9:	Sharia, State and Legal Pluralism in Indonesia: How <i>Law</i> Can You Go? <i>Nadirsyah Hosen</i>	208
Chapter 10:	Negotiating Legal Pluralism in Court: Fatwa and the Crime of Blasphemy in Indonesia <i>Melissa Crouch</i>	231
Chapter 11:	Islamic Law in Israel: A Case Study in Legal Pluralism <i>Aharon Layish</i>	257
Chapter 12:	The Road to Democracy Goes Through Religious Pluralism: The Indonesian Case and Thoughts on Post-Mubarak Egypt <i>Giora Eliraz</i>	293

# Preface

This book stems from a symposium held at the Faculty of Law of the National University of Singapore on 27–28 September 2012 in honour of Professor M.B. Hooker. Professor Hooker was a pioneer in the field of legal pluralism. In fact, his scholarship laid the foundation of the field. His 1975 book *Legal Pluralism: An Introduction to Colonial and Neo-Colonial Laws* (1975) was seminal and opened this field of study. The man has been tremendously influential.

In the first chapter of this book, entitled *M.B. Hooker and Southeast Asian Law: Path-breaking Passions*, Veronica Taylor traces the career of M.B. Hooker and gives us a list of his publications. I will therefore refrain from doing this in this preface. I will however state my admiration for the man and scholar. Professor Hooker has been very influential on me (and so many others), yet I met him for the first time only at the symposium we held in 2012. Although by all accounts M.B. Hooker has been generous in his personal support for young scholars, in my case, due to distance, his influence was not personal but truly merely intellectual, which makes it clear that the man has been a leader in the field.

The chapters of this book are very diverse, reflecting the breadth of legal pluralism and of M.B. Hooker's scholarship, which covered legal pluralism, Islamic law, Malaysian and Indonesian law, *adat* law, etc. I will not here introduce each of the chapters — the table of contents should suffice to show the breadth of this collection. It is however an homage to M.B. Hooker that colleagues with such diverse interests readily volunteered for a symposium and book in his honour — it shows the breadth of his own scholarship and its influence. All the chapters relate to legal pluralism. All of them relate to Asia (which goes as far as Israel).

I wish to thank my colleagues Veronica Taylor of the Australian National University and Michael Dowdle of the National University of Singapore for assisting me in editing some of the chapters of this book.

On a sad note, we were very sorry to learn of the loss of two contributors between the symposium and the publication of this book. Professor H. Patrick Glenn, another giant in the field of comparative law, has passed away. His wife, Jane Glenn, also of McGill University, has kindly agreed to the publication of the final version of his chapter. Franz von Benda-Beckmann, who had co-written a chapter with his wife Keebet von Benda-Beckmann, also sadly passed away before the publication of this book. A great loss to all of us and to anthropology generally. We are grateful that Professor Keebet did the final editing on behalf of both of them.

I hope you will enjoy the book as much as I enjoyed working with this group of authors.

Gary F. Bell  
National University of Singapore  
28 August 2016

## Acknowledgements

I would like to thank the National University of Singapore for the generous research grant that allowed us to hold a conference in 2012 from which this book stems. I would also like to thank the Faculty of Law of the National University of Singapore and its Centre for Asian Legal studies for their support.

I also would like to thank the *Asian Journal of Comparative Law*, a journal of the Asia Law Institute (ASLI), which authorized the reproduction of an article by Arif A. Jamal (Chapter 3). I would also like to thank the artists who authorized the reproduction of their work in Chapter 7.

But mainly all the authors of the different chapters would like to thank Professor M.B. Hooker for his leadership in the field of legal pluralism and for inspiring all of us.



## About the Contributors

**Associate Professor Gary F. Bell.** After an undergraduate degree in theology (BTh) at the Université Laval (Quebec City), Gary F. Bell obtained degrees in both the common law (LLB) and the civil law (BCL) at McGill University in Montreal and an LLM at Columbia University in New York City. He was Editor-in-Chief of the *McGill Law Journal*, clerked for Justice Stevenson of the Supreme Court of Canada and taught at McGill University. He teaches in Comparative Law (Comparative Legal Traditions, International Commercial Arbitration, Indonesian Law). He does most of his research on Indonesian law and on the United Nations Convention on Contracts for the International Sale of Goods. He is the Director of the Asian Law Institute (ASLI).

**The late Professor Franz von Benda-Beckmann** was an honorary Professor at Leipzig University and at the Martin Luther University in Halle. He obtained his first law degree at the High Court in Schleswig, his PhD at the University of Kiel and his second law degree at the High Court of Hamburg. After working in Zürich for five years he worked at the University of Leiden, heading a small research institute dealing with law in the former Dutch colonies. In 1981 he was appointed Professor for Law and Rural Development in Developing Countries at Wageningen University. In summer 2000 he moved to Halle to establish and head the project group Legal Pluralism at the Max Planck Institute for Social Anthropology together with Keebet von Benda-Beckmann.

**Professor Keebet von Benda-Beckmann** is an honorary Professor at Leipzig University and at the Martin Luther University in Halle. She holds a law degree from the University of Amsterdam and obtained her PhD at the University of Nijmegen. She first was an assistant in sociology of law at the University of Zürich, then worked at the University of Leiden, and taught for a while in Wageningen. In 1982 she took a position in anthropology and sociology of law at Erasmus University Rotterdam, where she later received a personal professorship in the anthropology of law in 1998. In summer 2000 she moved to Halle to establish and head the project group Legal Pluralism at the Max Planck Institute for Social Anthropology together with Franz von Benda-Beckmann.

**Dr Melissa Crouch** is a Senior Lecturer at the Law Faculty, the University of New South Wales, Sydney. Her research contributes to the field of Asian Legal Studies, with a concentration on constitutional change, law and development, and law and religion. She is the editor of three major volumes on Myanmar: *Law, Society and Transition in Myanmar* (2014); *Islam and the State in Myanmar: Muslim-Buddhist Relations and the Politics of Belonging* (2016); and *The Business of Transition: Law, Development and Economics in Myanmar* (forthcoming 2017). She is the author of *Law and Religion in Indonesia: Conflict and the Courts in West Java* (2014). Melissa has contributed to numerous initiatives on constitutional and legal reform in Myanmar.

**Dr Giora Eliraz** is a Research Fellow, Harry S. Truman Institute for the Advancement of Peace, the Hebrew University of Jerusalem; Affiliate Instructor, Jackson School of International Studies, University of Washington, Seattle; Research Fellow, the Institute for Counter-Terrorism, the Interdisciplinary Center, Herzliya; and Member of a research group at the Minerva Humanities Center, Tel-Aviv University.

**The late Professor H. Patrick Glenn** was the Peter M. Laing Professor of Law, Faculty of Law, McGill University, a Member of the International Academy of Comparative Law and President of the American Society of Comparative Law. He taught and had research interests in the areas of comparative law, private international law, civil procedure and the legal professions. His book *Legal Traditions of the World* (2000) received the grand prize of the International Academy of Comparative Law. A fifth edition appeared in 2014. He has been Director of the Institute of Comparative Law and in that capacity worked on projects on the reform of the Russian Civil Code and judicial education in China. He was a member of the Royal Society of Canada and the International Academy of Comparative Law and has been a Bora Laskin National Fellow in Human Rights Law, a Killam Research Fellow, and a Visiting Fellow of All Souls College, Oxford. In 2006 H. Patrick Glenn received the Prix Léon-Gérin, a prestigious award bestowed by the Government of Québec, in recognition of his contribution to comparative law throughout his career. In 2010–11 he held the Henry G. Schermers Fellowship of the Hague Institute for the Internationalisation of Law.

**Professor Andrew J. Harding** is a leading scholar in the fields of Asian legal studies and comparative constitutional law. He commenced his academic career at the National University of Singapore (NUS) before moving to SOAS, University of London, where he became Head of the Law School. He joined NUS from the University of Victoria, BC, Canada, where he was Professor of Asia-Pacific Legal Relations and Director of the Centre for Asia-Pacific Initiatives. At NUS he has served as Director of the Centre for Asian Legal Studies and Director of the Asian Law Institute. Professor Harding has worked extensively on constitutional law in Southeast Asia and has contributed to scholarship in comparative law and law and development, having published fourteen books as author or editor. He is co-founding editor of Hart Publishing's book series *Constitutional Systems of the World*, a major resource for constitutional law in context, and has co-authored the book on Thailand in that series (2011) and authored that on Malaysia (2012). His most recent book is *Constitutionalism and Legal Change in Myanmar* (2017).

**Virginia Matheson Hooker** is Professor Emeritus and Fellow in the Dept of Political & Social Change, College of Asia and the Pacific, at The Australian National University. She retired as Professor of Indonesian and Malay in the Faculty of Asian Studies in January 2007. Her research focuses on Islam in Southeast Asia, literature and social change in Malaysia and Indonesia, Indonesian political culture and Islam-inspired art in Southeast Asia. Her *Voices of Islam in Southeast Asia* (2006), co-edited with Assoc. Professor Greg Fealy, is an award-winning sourcebook on contemporary Islam in Southeast Asia.

**Dr Nadirsyah Hosen** has been working as a Senior Lecturer at the Faculty of Law, Monash University since July 2015. Prior to this role Dr Hosen was an Associate Professor at the School of Law, University of Wollongong. He has a Bachelors degree (UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta), a Graduate Diploma in Islamic Studies, a Master of Arts with Honours (University of New England), as well as a Master of Laws in Comparative Law (Charles Darwin University). He completed his first PhD (Law) at the University of Wollongong and a second PhD (Islamic Law) at the National University of Singapore. Dr Hosen is internationally known for his expertise on sharia and Indonesian law.

**Dr Arif A. Jamal** is an Assistant Professor in the Faculty of Law, National University of Singapore (NUS). He has research interests in legal and political theory and comparative legal studies, in particular as these relate to the areas of law and religion and law in Muslim contexts. He is a co-editor of *Regulating Religion in Asia: Norms, Modes and Challenges* (forthcoming) and serves on the Executive Committee of the Centre for Asian Legal Studies at NUS and as an editor with the *Asian Journal of Comparative Law* (Cambridge University Press).

**Professor Aharon Layish** is Professor Emeritus of Asian and African Studies at Hebrew University of Jerusalem. He is known for his

expertise in Islamic law and has conducted research in many areas, including on sharia and custom in a sedentary tribal society, the reinstatement of Islamic law in the Sudan by means of statutory codification and legislation, legal circulars and court decisions, and the Mahdi's legal methodology and its application in the Sudan (1881–85) as reflected in legal documents issued by the Mahdi.

**Professor Ratno Lukito** is a Professor at the Faculty of Syari'ah and Law at the State Islamic University Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta. His MA in Islamic studies was obtained from the Institute of Islamic Studies, McGill University, Montreal, Canada (1997), while his Doctor of Civil Law (DCL) was obtained from the Institute of Comparative Law, Faculty of Law, McGill University (2006). His thesis was on conflict and resolution among the three legal traditions of *adat*, Islamic law and civil law in Indonesia, under the supervision of the late Professor Patrick Glenn. He was a Postdoctoral fellow of KNAW-Van Vollenhoven Institute, Faculty of Law, Leiden University, the Netherlands (2009–11). He is currently a fellow of the American Institute for Indonesian Studies. He has authored twelve books and thirty-six articles, mostly on the topic of Islamic law and legal traditions in Indonesia. His book *Legal Pluralism in Indonesia: Bridging the Unbridgeable* was published in 2013. He has been working recently on a monograph entitled "Islamic Law and State in Indonesia: Confabulating the Sacredness".

**Professor Veronica Taylor** is a socio-legal scholar and Professor in the School of Regulation and Global Governance at the Australian National University and an ANU Public Policy Fellow. Her major contribution to socio-legal studies centres on rule of law assistance as a form of foreign policy and as an emergent field of professional practice. She examines (i) the rise of non-Western rule of law exporters, (ii) regulatory analysis of the rule of law industry and (iii) empirical study of the practice and professionalization of rule of law promotion and law and justice interventions.

