MIRROR IMAGES IN DIFFERENT FRAMES?
The Institute of Southeast Asian Studies (ISEAS) was established as an autonomous organization in 1968. It is a regional centre dedicated to the study of socio-political, security and economic trends and developments in Southeast Asia and its wider geostrategic and economic environment. The Institute's research programmes are the Regional Economic Studies (RES, including ASEAN and APEC), Regional Strategic and Political Studies (RSPS), and Regional Social and Cultural Studies (RSCS).

ISEAS Publishing, an established academic press, has issued more than 2,000 books and journals. It is the largest scholarly publisher of research about Southeast Asia from within the region. ISEAS Publishing works with many other academic and trade publishers and distributors to disseminate important research and analyses from and about Southeast Asia to the rest of the world.
ISEAS MONOGRAPH SERIES

MIRROR IMAGES IN DIFFERENT FRAMES?
JOHOR, THE RIAU ISLANDS, AND COMPETITION FOR INVESTMENT FROM SINGAPORE

FRANCIS E. HUTCHINSON

INSTITUTE OF SOUTHEAST ASIAN STUDIES
Singapore
# Contents

*List of Tables* vi

*List of Figures* ix

*Editorial Note* x

*Acknowledgements* xi

*About the Author* xii

*List of Acronyms* xiii

1. Introduction 1

2. Theoretical Framework 11

3. “Internal State Architecture” and Incentive Structures for Meso-Level Leaders 19

4. The Cases: Johor and the Riau Islands 39
   a. 1990–97: Mirror Images? 40
   b. 1998–2003: Transitions 70
   c. 2004–13: Divergence 92

5. Conclusion 129

*Endnotes* 133

*References* 139
List of Tables

Table 1: Revenue Sources and Size of the Johor State Government’s Budget, 1992–95 44
Table 2: Revenue Sources and Size of the Riau Provincial Budget, 1991–97 55
Table 3: Growth Rates in Johor and Malaysia, 1984–97 59
Table 4: Johor’s Regional GDP per capita Relative to National Average, 1988–98 59
Table 5: Sectoral Composition of Johor’s Economy, 1985–95 60
Table 6: Number of Firms in the Manufacturing Sector in Johor: Total and Top Five Sub-sectors, 1990–97 60
Table 7: Employment in the Manufacturing Sector in Johor: Total and Top Five Sub-sectors, 1990–97 61
Table 8: Foreign Direct Investment in Manufacturing into Malaysia, 1990–97 62
Table 9: Constant Regional GDP Growth Rates in Batam, Riau Islands, Riau Province, and Indonesia, 1984–97 63
Table 10: Riau Islands’ Regional GDP per capita Relative to National Average, 1994–97 64
Table 11: Cumulative Capital Investment in Batam in All Sectors, 1990–96 65
Table 12: The Structure of the Riau Province Economy, 1990–97 66
List of Tables

Table 13: Revenue Sources and Size of the Johor State Government’s Budget, 2001–03 73
Table 14: Revenue Sources and Size of the Riau Provincial Budget, 1997–2002 79
Table 15: Growth Rates in Johor and Malaysia, 1996–2005 85
Table 16: Johor’s Regional GDP per capita Relative to National Average, 1998–2005 85
Table 17: Key Statistics for the Manufacturing Sector in Johor, 2000 85
Table 18: Foreign Direct Investment in Manufacturing into Malaysia, 1998–2003 86
Table 19: Constant Regional GDP Growth Rates in Riau, the Riau Islands Province, and Indonesia, 1998–2003 87
Table 20: Riau Islands’ Regional GDP per capita Relative to National Average, 1998–2003 87
Table 21: The Economic Structure of Riau Province and the Riau Islands, 2003 88
Table 22: Foreign Direct Investment into Indonesia, 1998–2003 89
Table 23: Revenue Sources and Size of the Johor State Government’s Budget, 2004–12 95
Table 24: Iskandar Malaysia: Flagship Areas and Key Players 101
Table 25: The Population of the Riau Islands by Self-Declared Ethnic Group 110
Table 26: Revenue Sources and Size of Riau Islands Provincial Budget, 2007–11 112
Table 27: Growth Rates in Johor and Malaysia, 2006–12 117
Table 28: Sectoral Composition of Johor’s Economy, 2005–12 118
Table 29: Foreign Direct Investment in Manufacturing into Malaysia, 2004–13 119
Table 30: Constant Regional GDP Growth Rates in the Riau Islands Province, Riau, and Indonesia, 2004–11 120
Table 31: Riau Islands Province’s Regional GDP per capita Relative to National Average and Riau Province, 2003–11 122
Table 32: Sectoral Composition of the Riau Islands Province’s Economy, 2004–10 123
Table 33: Foreign Direct Investment into Indonesia, 2004–12 123
Table 34: Japanese and Singapore MNCs in Operation in Johor and Batam by Year of Establishment 126
List of Figures

1. The Two-Level Decision-Making Model for Meso-level Leaders 16
2. Malaysia: The Flow of Revenue and Responsibilities Over Time 25
3. Indonesia: The Flow of Revenue Sources and Responsibilities after 1999 36
4. Electronics MNCs in Johor and the Riau Islands, 1990–97 68
5. Electronics MNCs in Johor and Batam, 1998–2003 90
6. Electronics MNCs in Johor and Riau Islands Province, 2004–12 125
Editorial Note

The ISEAS Monograph Series disseminates profound analyses by major scholars on key issues relating to Southeast Asia. Subjects studied in this series stem from research facilitated by the Institute of Southeast Asian Studies, Singapore.

The Institute’s Manuscript Review Committee is in charge of the series, although the responsibility for facts presented and views expressed rests exclusively with the individual author or authors. No part of this publication may be reproduced in any form without permission from the Institute.

*****
I would like to thank Milica Topalovic, Hans Hortig and the other members of the Architecture of Territory team of ETH-Zurich for very fruitful discussions on Singapore, Johor, and the Riau Islands, as well as the use of their photographs and maps. The work of Ng Kok Kiong and Rahilah Yusuf of the ISEAS Publications Unit has been exemplary. I would also like to thank Cassey Lee, Gwenaël Njoto-Feillard, Leo van Grunsven and Reema Bhagwan Jagtiani for their comments on drafts of this monograph. I would like to thank my colleagues from the Malaysia Studies Programme, particularly Ooi Kee Beng, for their feedback and encouragement. Lorraine Carlos Salazar has, as always, provided valuable feedback and support. The administrative, financial, and logistical backing of the Institute of Southeast Asian Studies has been essential for this project. The responsibility for any and all errors rests with me.
About the Author

Francis E. Hutchinson is a Senior Fellow at the Institute of Southeast Asian Studies and Managing Editor of the Journal of Southeast Asian Economies. He has a PhD in Public Policy and Administration from the Australian National University and degrees from the Universities of Cambridge and Sussex.

Dr Hutchinson’s research focuses on state-business relations, federalism, decentralization, innovation, and industrialization in Southeast Asia. He is the editor of Architects of Growth? Sub-national Governments and Industrialization in Asia (2014) and has published in Journal of Contemporary Asia, Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society, Economic and Political Weekly, and Southeast Asian Affairs.
# List of Acronyms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AFC</td>
<td>Asian Financial Crisis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AVG</td>
<td>average</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BCIC</td>
<td>Bumiputera Commercial and Industrial Community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIDA</td>
<td>Batam Industrial Development Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIE</td>
<td>Bintan Industrial Estate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIFZA</td>
<td>Batam Indonesia Free Zone Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BN</td>
<td>Barisan Nasional</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BP3KR</td>
<td>Badan Pekerja Pembentukan Propinsi Kepulauan Riau</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CDP</td>
<td>Comprehensive Development Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FDI</td>
<td>foreign direct investment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FGFF</td>
<td>first generation fiscal federalism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>gross domestic product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IM</td>
<td>Iskandar Malaysia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IRDA</td>
<td>Iskandar Regional Development Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KEJORA</td>
<td>Lembaga Kemajuan Johor Tenggara</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MNC</td>
<td>multinational corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MP3EI</td>
<td>Masterplan Percepatan dan Perluasan Pembangunan Ekonomi Indonesia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEP</td>
<td>New Economic Policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PDI-P</td>
<td>Partai Demokrasi Indonesia Perjuangan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRI</td>
<td>Province of the Riau Islands</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
SEDC  State Economic Development Corporation
SEZ  Special Economic Zone
SGFF  second generation fiscal federalism
UMNO  United Malays National Organisation