The GMS (Greater Mekong Subregion) Development Series is an initiative of the Cambodia Development Resource Institute (CDRI), Cambodia’s leading independent development policy research institute. Established in 1990, CDRI’s research focuses on five areas: economy, trade and regional cooperation; poverty, agriculture and rural development; democratic governance and public sector reform; natural resources and the environment; and social development.

The Institute of Southeast Asian Studies (ISEAS) was established as an autonomous organization in 1968. It is a regional centre dedicated to the study of socio-political, security and economic trends and developments in Southeast Asia and its wider geostrategic and economic environment. The Institute’s research programmes are the Regional Economic Studies (RES, including ASEAN and APEC), Regional Strategic and Political Studies (RSPS), and Regional Social and Cultural Studies (RSCS).

ISEAS Publishing, an established academic press, has issued more than 2,000 books and journals. It is the largest scholarly publisher of research about Southeast Asia from within the region. ISEAS Publications works with many other academic and trade publishers and distributors to disseminate important research and analyses from and about Southeast Asia to the rest of the world.
Improving Health Sector Performance

Institutions, Motivations and Incentives
The Cambodia Dialogue

EDITED BY
Hossein Jalilian and Vicheth Sen

GMS Development Series 1
A CDRI Publication
CONTENTS

Acknowledgements ix
Foreword xi
List of Contributors xiii
Introduction xvii

Part I  Overview
1. What Incentives Are Effective in Improving Deployment of Health Workers in Primary Health Care in Asia and the Pacific? 3
   Vivian Lin, Lee Ridoutt, Emily Brink, and Bruce Hollingsworth

2. Reforming Provider Behaviour through Incentives: Challenges and Reflections from the U.K. Experience 19
   Alan Maynard

Part II  Organizational Arrangements: Purchasing Health Services
3. The Transition to Semi-Autonomous Management of District Health Services in Cambodia: Assessing Purchasing Arrangements, Transaction Costs and Operational Efficiencies of Special Operating Agencies 45
   Khim Keovathanak and Peter Leslie Annear

   Jean-Olivier Schmidt and Atia Hossain
## Contents

5. Social Health Insurance in Cambodia: An Analysis of the Health Care Delivery Mechanism  
   *Sopheap Ly*  
   101

6. Purchasing Health Services in New Zealand  
   *Toni Ashton and Maria C.G. Bautista*  
   136

### Part III  Optimal Health Workers Contracts

7. A Civil Service That Performs: Primary Health Care in Curitiba, Brazil  
   *Geoffrey Shepherd*  
   151

8. Increasing Uptake of Reproductive Health Services Using Innovative Financing Models: Experiences of Marie Stopes International  
   *Che Katz and Thoai D. Ngo*  
   184

9. Understanding Rural Health Service in Cambodia: Results of a Discrete Choice Experiment  
   *Bundeth Seng, Neath Net, Nonglak Pagaiya, and Sethea Sok*  
   202

10. Contracting Health Workers to Underserved Areas: Indonesian Approaches to a Distributional Challenge  
    *Hjalte Sederlof and Rooswanti Soeharno*  
    248

### Part IV  Managing Doctors and Nurses

11. How Managers Manage in Cambodia’s Public Health Sector  
    *Neath Net, Roger Hay, and Klaus J. Broesamle*  
    265

12. The Impact of Management Training and Education on the Performance of Health Care Providers: What Do We Know?  
    *Orville Adams and Leanne Idzerda*  
    304

13. Incentive Systems in Public Health Care Organizations in Italy  
    *Alberto Asquer*  
    328
Part V  Health Service Consumer Behaviour
14. Factors Influencing Health-Seeking Behaviour in Siem Reap: A Qualitative Analysis
   Sarah C. Smith

15. Villagers’ Evaluation of a Community-based Health Insurance Scheme in Thmar Pouk, Cambodia
   Sachiko Ozawa and Damian Walker

APPENDIX
Health Equity Funds Implemented by URC and Supported by USAID
Tapley Jordanwood, Maurits van Pelt, and Christophe Grundmann

Index
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This volume comprises chapters based on a collection of papers presented at a two-day international conference on “Improving Health Sector Performance: Institutions, Motivations and Incentives” in Phnom Penh from 26–27 April 2010. The event was co-organized by the Cambodia Development Resource Institute (CDRI) and the Oxford Policy Institute (OPI), with financial support from the Department for International Development (DFID), United Kingdom. The conference would not have been possible without the efforts of many people within the CDRI and OPI. Significant contributions to the organization of the conference were provided by the Social Development Programme, with support from Administration and Support Services, External Relations, and Publications Units, CDRI. Special thanks also are due to the late Roger Hay, former director of OPI, for his active support during the initial stage of the project. Overall guidance was provided by the senior management of CDRI.

Most of the chapters in this volume have benefited substantially from peer review by a number of experts in the health sector. Thanks are due to the following reviewers for their invaluable contributions to this process: Peter Annear, Kimberley McClean, Vivian Lin, Maryam Bigdeli, Ann Robins, and Geoffrey Shepherd. Thanks are also due to Allen Myers for his editorial assistance. We would also like to thank H.E. Dr Tia Phalla, vice-chair of the National AIDS Authority, Cambodia, for contributing the Foreword to this volume.
Finally, we would also like to thank University Research Co., LLC, especially Dr Christophe Grundmann, for financial support of this publication.

Hossein Jalilian (PhD)
Director of Research
Cambodia Development Resource Institute

Vicheth Sen
Programme Coordinator
Social Development Programme
Cambodia Development Resource Institute
FOREWORD

The Cambodian Government considers health as the heart of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) because healthy people constitute the basis for human resource development and sustainable socio-economic progress.

The chapters in this volume come from papers presented at an international conference organized by the Cambodia Development Resource Institute in April 2010. With participation from local and international experts, the conference aimed at collecting major experiences and innovative solutions from inside and outside the country to improve health sector performance, with particular focus on institutions, motivations and incentives.

The growing gap between the supply of health care professionals and the demand for their services is recognized as a key issue for health and development worldwide. The Cambodian National Strategic Plan for Health notes that in 2008, for every 10,000 members of the population there were only 0.10 physicians, 0.55 secondary midwives, and 1.21 secondary nurses.

This shortage of health human resources is becoming a high priority issue on the political agenda. The introduction of the Priority Operating Costs (POC) system in July 2010 will allow for the motivation of health care workers to deliver better public services. Within the framework of Cambodian ownership and leadership, this public administration reform aims at facilitating the harmonization and alignment of practices by development partners in this area. The general principles of POC aim at “management which is result-based with payments that are made against achievements”. It is further characterized as “a scheme which provides means to appointees to do their work efficiently in a spirit of ownership and leadership”.
The chapters in this volume deal with both an overview of the issues and with the four broad themes of the conference: the purchasing of health services; health worker contracts; managing doctors and nurses; and health service consumer behaviour.

Through the chapters and discussions, the conference offered a unique forum for policy makers, health officials, civil society organizations, United Nations agencies, and development partners to discuss with local and international researchers major issues concerning the performance of the health sector. The lessons drawn will enable Cambodia to plan and manage human resources in the health sector better and to address major issues of organization, motivations and incentives. From the conference, four critical issues of human resources management in health — numbers, quality, attitudes, location — were identified as key factors for the implementation of national health strategies and for attaining the MDGs that are health related.

Dr Tia Phalla
Vice-Chair
National AIDS Authority
LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

Dr Orvill Adams is director of Orvill Adams & Associates Incorporated, Health Systems Policy and Workforce Planning, Ottawa, Ontario, Canada.

Dr Peter Leslie Annear, PhD, is senior research fellow, Nossal Institute for Global Health, University of Melbourne, Australia.

Professor Toni Ashton, PhD, is associate professor and director, Centre for Health Services Research and Policy, School of Population Health, University of Auckland, New Zealand.

Dr Alberto Asquer is assistant professor, Department of Business Management, Faculty of Economics, University of Cagliari, Italy.

Dr Maria C.G. Bautista is senior tutor, Centre for Health Services Research and Policy, School of Population Health, University of Auckland, New Zealand.

Emily Brink is a PhD student, School of Public Health, La Trobe University, Melbourne, Australia.

Klaus J. Broesamle is consultant for the Oxford Policy Institute, the United Kingdom.

Dr Christophe Grundmann (PhD) is chief of party, University Research Co. (URC), Cambodia.

Roger Hay (deceased) was the former executive director of the Oxford Policy Institute, the United Kingdom.
Professor Bruce Hollingsworth is professor and director of the Centre for Health Economics, Monash University, Melbourne, Australia.

Atia Hossain is senior advisor in health economics, Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit (GTZ) GmbH, Bangladesh. (P.O. Box 6091, Gulshan I, Dhaka, Bangladesh).

Leanne Idzerda is research assistant at the Centre for Global Health, Institute for Population Health, University of Ottawa, Ontario, Canada.

Hossein Jalilian, PhD, is a reader in Economic Development at the University of Bradford. Over the period from April 2007–Sept. 2010, on leave of absence from the University of Bradford, he was research director at CDRI.

Tapley Jordanwood (M.Sc.) is health financing programme manager, University Research Co. (URC), Cambodia.

Che Katz is programme director, Marie Stopes International Cambodia.

Keovathanak Khim is a PhD student, Nossal Institute for Global Health, University of Melbourne, Australia.

Professor Vivian Lin, PhD, is professor of Public Health, School of Public Health, La Trobe University, Melbourne, Australia.

Ly Sopheap is currently working as a team leader of the Public Sector Strengthening Component for the Cambodia MSME Project, USAID Cambodia. She received her LLD in 2009 from the Graduate School at Nagoya University, Japan, majoring in Public Administration.

Professor Alan Maynard, PhD, is professor of health economics at the Department of Health Sciences and the Hull-York Medical School at the University of York, England. He was chair of the York Hospitals NHS Trust from 1997 to 2010.

Net Neath is research fellow of the Social Development Programme, Cambodia Development Resource Institute (CDRI), Cambodia.
List of Contributors

Ngo Thoai D. is Asia regional research manager, Research & Metrics, Health System Department, Marie Stopes International.

Sachiko Ozawa, PhD, is an assistant scientist, Department of International Health, Health Systems, Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health, Johns Hopkins University, the United States.

Dr Pagaiya, Nonglak, PhD, is a researcher for the International Health Policy Programme (IHPP), Ministry of Public Health, Thailand.

Lee Ridoutt is director of Human Capital Alliance, Sydney, Australia.

Jean-Olivier Schmidt is programme director, Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit (GTZ) GmbH, Bangladesh. (#74/1, 2nd Main Road, 8th Block, Jayanagar, Bangalore 560082, India).

Hjalte Sederlof is advisor to the Ministry of Health, Indonesia, on health systems development.

Sen, Vicheth is the programme coordinator of the Social Development Programme, Cambodia Development Resource Institute (CDRI), Cambodia.

Dr Seng, Bundeth is research associate of the Social Development Programme, Cambodia Development Resource Institute (CDRI), Cambodia.

Geoffrey Shepherd is an economist with experience at the World Bank, the United States and the University of Sussex and a consultant in the areas of political economy and public sector reform.

Sarah C. Smith is a PhD candidate in medical anthropology at the University Queensland, School of Social Sciences, Australia.

Dr Rooswanti Soeharno is advisor to the Ministry of Health, Indonesia, on health systems development.

Sok, Sethea is research associate of the Social Development Programme, Cambodia Development Resource Institute (CDRI).
Dr Phalla Tia is vice-chair of the National AIDS Authority (NAA), Cambodia.

Maurits van Pelt (M.Sc., L.L.M.) is a consultant for the University Research Co. (URC), Cambodia.

Professor Damian Walker is associate professor, Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health, Johns Hopkins University, the United States.
INTRODUCTION

There is growing international evidence that the effectiveness of health services stems primarily from the extent to which the incentives facing providers and consumers are aligned with “better health” objectives. Efficiency in health service provision requires that providers and consumers have incentives to use health care resources in ways that generate the maximum health gains. Equity, in at least one sense, requires that consumers requiring the same care are treated equally, irrespective of their ability to pay. Efficiency in the use of health services requires that consumers are knowledgeable about the services on offer and which are most appropriate for their needs. Although these principles are enshrined in the design of every health system in the world, they have proven extremely difficult to apply in practice. Health care providers have financial obligations to their families as well as professional obligations to their patients. Health service consumers generally lack information about both their health and health services so that they underconsume or overconsume health care. Matters are unlikely to improve until there is more empirical evidence of the way health service providers and consumers in different parts of the world are actually motivated and how these incentives are best modified to improve health service efficiency and equity.

Health provider incentives are generated by the institutions (rules) that govern their professional behaviour. These can be classified broadly into institutions that generate extrinsic incentives (organizational formats, managerial arrangements, social norms, and remuneration), and intrinsic incentives arising from values such as altruism, beliefs, reputation, and work satisfaction. The incentives that consumers have to use health services efficiently stem from intrinsic incentives arising from concern for their health, knowledge about the available health services, and social institutions, such as the trust and respect that mediate their transactions with providers.
This volume is based on a collection of papers from both Cambodian and international scholars, researchers, and practitioners in the health sector presented at a two-day international conference co-organized in Phnom Penh on 26–27 April 2010 by the Cambodia Development Resource Institute (CDRI) and the Oxford Policy Institute (OPI) with support from the Department for International Development (DFID), the United Kingdom. Under the theme, “Improving Health Sector Performance: Institutions, Motivations and Incentives”, the conference brought about sixty Cambodian researchers and health sector managers together with researchers from the region and elsewhere. Structured according to the programme of the conference, this collection focuses on four themes related to the incentives that motivate health service providers and consumers:

**Theme 1: Alternative organizational arrangements for delivering health services, including commissioning and purchasing**

There is an international trend towards active commissioning and contracting with both government and non-government providers for the supply of health services. Recent reforms in Cambodia are introducing such arrangements across the health sector. At the same time, provider units in Cambodia are being transformed into semi-autonomous organizations (Special Operating Agencies). This is intended to increase activity, improve service quality, focus service provision on priorities, and so improve allocative efficiency by providing better specified and stronger incentives for health service managers and providers. However, contract management also carries additional transaction costs. What is the evidence for better technical efficiency, taking into account increased activity and service quality?

**Theme 2: Incentives associated with alternative health worker employment contracts**

The way clinicians are employed and paid creates powerful incentives for resource management, productivity (or shirking), and service quality. Commonly, government health services are staffed by government employed clinicians, often with civil service status. The principal-agent theory suggests that perverse incentives arise and are common when provider and patient objectives do not coincide. How, and to what extent, can health worker contracts, including obligations to allow observation of their work, mitigate such agency problems? What is the relationship between salaried employment, capitation, fee-for-service, and “payment
by results’ remuneration and health service volumes and quality? In a region where government salaries are typically low, what is the relationship between levels of remuneration, labour productivity, and service quality?

Theme 3: Health worker management regimes
Clinicians have long prized and defended their independence. However, this independence is being increasingly eroded by clinical protocols, service delivery targets, and managed working practices. Some would argue that this has undermined professional ethics and the intrinsic incentives of altruism and reputation. Do “managed” clinicians perform better? Are doctors and nurses best at managing doctors and nurses? How does clinician management in government and non-government sectors differ and with what results? What is the role of organizational leadership in clinician motivation, in innovation, and in the improvement of organizational performance?

Theme 4: Incentives associated with the effective use of health care by service consumers
Most empirical demand-side health service research has focused on price elasticities and the demand for the different types of health care. But the demand for health services is also influenced by consumer knowledge, access to information (health care markets are characterized by great informational asymmetries between patients and providers), peer pressure, and trust in health care providers.

In particular, this collection of papers will consider and examine three sets of issues:

1. What is the effect of information on the incentives people have to improve their lifestyles and to use health services more efficiently?
2. What are the effects of subsidies and taxes on health care-seeking behaviour? Should people be paid to adopt healthier behaviours or seek preventative care, such as Conditional Income Transfers (CIT)?
3. What are the incentives for people, well and sick, to enrol in voluntary health insurance schemes?

We hope that the chapters in this volume will contribute to our understanding of what is known about the institutions and incentives moderating the behaviour of health service providers and consumers in
Asia and beyond, and how these can be incorporated into national policies for the improvement of health services in Cambodia and other countries. It is also hoped that the book will provide lessons learnt from Cambodia and other countries to increase our knowledge of incentives and of their relationships with the behaviour of health service providers and consumers that could prove useful for formulating policy recommendations for Cambodia and other nations. Moreover, we hope this volume provides different research methodologies that are reliable and could be recommended for future research in the health sector in Cambodia and elsewhere. Finally, we expect that the findings and conclusions from different studies in this collection will promote further study of issues in the health sector, especially the institutions and incentives that relate to health service strategy.