ISLAMISM AND DEMOCRACY IN INDONESIA
The Institute of Southeast Asian Studies (ISEAS) was established as an autonomous organization in 1968. It is a regional centre dedicated to the study of socio-political, security and economic trends and developments in Southeast Asia and its wider geostrategic and economic environment. The Institute’s research programmes are the Regional Economic Studies (RES, including ASEAN and APEC), Regional Strategic and Political Studies (RSPS), and Regional Social and Cultural Studies (RSCS).

ISEAS Publishing, an established academic press, has issued more than 2,000 books and journals. It is the largest scholarly publisher of research about Southeast Asia from within the region. ISEAS Publishing works with many other academic and trade publishers and distributors to disseminate important research and analyses from and about Southeast Asia to the rest of the world.
ISEAS Series on Islam

Islamism and Democracy in Indonesia

Piety and Pragmatism

Masdar Hilmy

Institute of Southeast Asian Studies
Singapore
Contents

Acknowledgements ix

1. Introduction 1

2. ISLAM AND DEMOCRACY: Re-examining the Intricate Relationship 18
   Cultural Essentialist/Exceptionalist Approaches 19
   The Critics: Structural-Instrumentalist Approaches 24
   On the Multivocality of Islam: Muslims’ Debates on Democracy 30
   Arguments of Democracy Proponents 33
   Accommodationist Approaches to Democracy 40
   The Islamists’ Culturalist Approaches to Democracy 46
   Conclusion 49

3. ISLAM AND DISCOURSES ON DEMOCRACY IN INDONESIA: Definition, Historical Account, and Muslims’ Approaches to Democracy 61
   Conceptualizing Democracy in the Indonesian Context 61
   Islam and Democracy: A Fluctuating Relationship 66
   Indonesia’s Democracy in Historical Perspective 69
      The Dutch Colonial Period 69
      The Japanese Occupation 71
      Sukarno’s “Demokrasi Terpimpin” 74
      Soeharto’s New Order 76
      Post-Soeharto Era 78
   Indonesian Muslims’ Approaches to Democracy: A Preliminary Discussion 79
   Conclusion 88
4. ISLAMISM IN POST-NEW ORDER INDONESIA: Explaining the Contexts  
Defining Islamism in the Indonesian Context  
The Socio-political Background of Islamism  
Majlis Mujahidin Indonesia (MMI)  
Hizbut Tahrir Indonesia (HTI)  
Partai Keadilan Sejahtera (PKS)  
Conclusion  

5. THEOLOGY OF RESISTANCE: On the Utopian Islamist Rejection of Democracy  
The Islamists’ Conception of Democracy  
Islamist Exceptionalism  
The Social Construction of Anti-Democracy Discourse  
The Role of the Media  
Resisting Democracy with the Arguments of Democracy  
Islamists and the Ballot Box  
Anathema to the Islamists: Secularism, Liberalism, and Pluralism  
Conclusion  

6. TOWARDS A HOME-GROWN DEMOCRACY? On the Meliorist Islamist Acceptance of Democracy  
Crafting Islamic Democracy: The New Era of Political Islam  
From Political Islam to Islamic Politics: Towards a New Paradigm  
The Islamic State Reconsidered  
The Legacy of Masyumi  
Between Madinah Charter and Jakarta Charter  
Conclusion  

7. INTERSECTION AND RUPTURE: Piety, Pragmatism, and Power Contests among the Islamists  
The Emergence of Public Islam  
The Notion of Power: Between Pietism and Pragmatism  
Power Manifestation: The Transnational Khilafah Islamiyah Approaches to Power Structures  
Expanding Power Structures: Shari’ah-based Proposed By-laws  
Ideological Rupture  
Conclusion
## Contents

8. **CONCLUSION: Findings and Theoretical Reflection** 253  
   Intersection: Commonalities and Differences 256  
   Whither Islamism? 259  

*Appendix 1: Full Text of the Madinah Charter (622 C.E.)* 265  
*Appendix 2: Yogyakarta Charter* 270  
*Bibliography* 271  
*Index* 301  
*About the Author* 320
Acknowledgements

This book was developed from my doctoral thesis (University of Melbourne 2007), examined by Professor Martin van Bruinessen (Utrecht) and Dr Michael Feener (National University of Singapore). Credit is due to an anonymous reviewer of this draft and to the Institute of Southeast Asian Studies (ISEAS) for publishing this manuscript and making it available to a wider audience.

I would like to take this opportunity to extend my deepest gratitude to all those who assisted me during my doctoral studies at the University of Melbourne’s Asia Institute (formerly known as the Melbourne Institute of Asian Languages and Societies, or MIALS). Chief among these are my supervisors, Professors Merle C. Ricklefs and Arief Budiman, whose critical comments and passionate guidance enabled me to complete my research project within a period of three years. Professor Arief Budiman, with his fatherly touch, patience and expertise, enlightened me in matters of sociology and political science. Professor Ricklefs continued to supervise me, even though he resigned from the university in January 2005, and helped me deal with the hardships and complexities of my studies through a series of e-mails and face-to-face communications. Words are simply insufficient to express my deepest gratitude to both of them. After Professor Ricklefs’ resignation, Professor Michael Leigh took over as my supervisor. He also deserves my deep appreciation, particularly in dealing with the structure of the thesis.

The earlier stage of this work benefitted from a number of professors and experts from various universities. Professor Abdullah Saeed, Director of the Asia Institute at the University of Melbourne, gave invaluable comments on the overall draft of the thesis. Professor Tim Lindsey from the Law School, University of Melbourne, not only helped me sharpen the argument of the thesis but also made it stronger in character. I would like to extend my sincere thanks to both of them. Furthermore, the following people contributed in one way or another towards the betterment of the thesis: Professors M.B. Hooker, Virginia Hooker, Kathryn Robinson, and
Greg Fealy from the Australian National University (ANU) helped me in criticizing the earlier draft of my proposed research at the 2004 Mt. Beauty Workshop; Clive Kessler, Professor of Sociology from the University of New South Wales (UNSW), Sydney, Anthony Bubalo, Research Fellow at the Lowy Institute for International Policy in Sydney, and Kevin Dunn, Professor of Cultural Geography at UNSW, gave comments on the paper I delivered at the second annual Islamic Studies Postgraduate Conference at the University of Melbourne on 20–22 November 2006; Olle Törnquist, a political scientist from Oslo University, read and gave invaluable comments on Chapters 5 and 6 of the thesis; Elizabeth Fuller Collins of Ohio University for her contribution in the writing of Chapter 6; Ariel Heryanto, the Convenor of Indonesian Studies at the Asia Institute, University of Melbourne, for his critical comments on Chapters 1 and 3; Professors Azyumardi Azra and Komaruddin Hidayat, the respective former and current Rectors of the State Islamic University (UIN), Jakarta, for their criticisms on my proposed research during their visits to Melbourne; Nadirsyah Hosen, the former Postdoctoral Research Fellow at the University of Queensland (UQ), for his help in proofreading and commenting on Chapter 5; Thoha Hamim, Deputy Rector I of the State Institute for Islamic Studies (IAIN) Sunan Ampel, Surabaya, for his insights and comments on my thesis; and Noorhaidi Hasan, a Postdoctoral Research Fellow at the National University of Singapore (NUS), for his suggestions through e-mail communication during the preparation of the thesis. I benefited greatly from intellectual exchanges with all of these scholars during conferences, seminars, e-mail communications, and informal conversations, and I extend my deepest gratitude to all of them.

My doctoral studies would not have been possible without the support given by my home institution, IAIN Surabaya. In this case, let me extend my deepest gratitude to Professor Dr H.M. Ridwan Natsir, M.A., Rector of IAIN, for allowing me to absent myself from all my duties as a lecturer of this institute during my studies and for giving me the recommendation to pursue my Ph.D. degree at the University of Melbourne.

My stay in Australia would not have been possible without the financial support provided by various institutions. Special thanks go firstly to AusAID for granting me a scholarship to pursue my Ph.D. degree at the University of Melbourne. I am particularly grateful to Lucia Wong and Kathy Menezes, the AusAID liaison officers of the University of Melbourne. My research fieldwork in Indonesia was only possible due to financial support I received from AusAID, the Postgraduate Overseas Research Experience Scholarship (PORES), and the Asia Institute Fieldwork/Travel Grants. To all of these institutions I express my sincerest gratitude.
During my fieldwork, I received assistance from a number of people such as Soedharmono, Professor of History at the Sebelas Maret University Surakarta (UNS), Moh. Syafi’i Anwar, Director of the International Center for Islam and Pluralism (ICIP) in Jakarta, Rizal Mallarangeng from the Freedom Institute in Jakarta, Mutoharun Jinan, a lecturer from Muhammadiyah University Surakarta (UMS), Janif Zulfiqar, an undergraduate student at the State Islamic University (UIN) Sunan Kalijaga, Yogyakarta, who was undertaking research for his thesis on MMI and took me to MMI's headquarters in that city, and Fatimah Husein and Muhammad Wildan, who are lecturers at the UIN Yogyakarta. I am indebted to all of them for their contributions to my fieldwork.

Acknowledgements also go to my colleagues, the Ph.D. students at the University of Melbourne such as Su’aidi Asy’ari, Arskal Salim, Luthfi Assyaukanie, Ludiro Madu, Arnusianto, Khalid Al-Azri, Dirk Tomsa, Amelia Fauzia, Andi Ali Amiruddin, Dina Afrianty, Raihani, Denny Indrayana, and Nina Nurmiia, who gave me the sense of being at home at work. Many thanks for their warm friendship and for sharing ideas as well as experiences with me during my stay in Melbourne. Special credit is due to Dirk Tomsa for proofreading the entire draft of my thesis.

The general staff at the Asia Institute, including Linda Poskitt, Nadine Blair, Jemimah Fraser, Mary Kidd, Cheryl Carter, Michelle King, and Liza Tsang, helped me immensely in dealing with administrative matters. I thank them very much for their contributions during my stay at the Asia Institute.

I feel a deep sense of gratitude to my father, K.H. Usman Rifa’i, and my mother, Hj. Sunipah, who have given all they have, including emotional and spiritual support, for my success and health in accomplishing this Ph.D. I am also grateful to my parents-in-law, my brothers and sister, and all members of my family for their support in the completion of my studies.

Last but not least, my very special thanks go to my beloved wife, Nanik Anjarwati, and my lovely cute daughter, Fifi (Aliviani Emilia Hilna, seven years old), whose enduring love and persistent support and encouragement have been inspiring along the way. Especially to my sweetheart Fifi, I apologize for having “neglected” you during the critical moments of finishing the thesis. I hope that someday you will understand why I could not spend more time with you having fun, as I should have. I do not know in what way I have to pay back for what you have sacrificed and given to me during the time you accompanied me in Melbourne, except my love from the bottom of my heart. This humble piece of work is dedicated to both of you.

Masdar Hilmy
Surabaya
2 March 2009